

# DEVELOPING HALAL TOURISM IN AN ISLAND OF A THOUSAND MOSQUE: PROSPECTS AND CHALLENGES

Achmad Zainal Arifin and Abdul Wahid

UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta and UIN Mataram

\*[achmad.arifin@uin-suka.ac.id](mailto:achmad.arifin@uin-suka.ac.id)

*Abstract - One important aspect seems to be ignored in developing halal tourism concept is existence of non-Muslims surrounding the halal tourist destinations across the Island of Lombok. Moreover, there is no single definition of the concept of halal tourism. This paper argues that it is important to include fellow Hindus communities in Lombok to avoid negative consequences of developing halal tourism. This research employs a qualitative model, using in-depth interviews, participant observations and documentation methods. This research focuses on Hindus communities in West Lombok and the city of Mataram, where many holy sites of Hindu are located and have a long history of relationship with Islam. Results indicate that there is not enough socialization of the concept of halal tourism for Hindus fellows. Some of them have similar idea with their fellows in Bali in rejecting the concept of halal tourism because they believe that halal tourism will affected their traditions and practices. Meanwhile, other Hindus seem to have a neutral position, meaning that they do not really understand about halal tourism but willing to support it, as long as they still have freedom in expressing their religious traditions and practices. These relatively negative opinions from Hindus communities have to be considered by all related parties in developing halal tourism in Lombok to re-evaluate the concept of halal tourism to prioritize the Islamic values of moderation rather than economic and ideological oriented, including the use of more acceptable term of "Muslim-friendly tourist destination".*

**Keyword:** Halal tourism, Lombok, Religious moderation, and Religious minority.

*Abstrak - Salah satu aspek penting yang sering diabaikan dalam mengembangkan konsep pariwisata halal adalah keberadaan non-Muslim yang mengelilingi tujuan wisata halal di seluruh Pulau Lombok. Selain itu, tidak ada definisi tunggal dari konsep pariwisata halal. Artikel ini berpendapat bahwa penting untuk memasukkan komunitas Hindu di Lombok untuk menghindari konsekuensi negatif dari mengembangkan pariwisata halal. Penelitian ini menggunakan model kualitatif, menggunakan wawancara mendalam, pengamatan peserta dan metode dokumentasi. Penelitian ini berfokus pada komunitas Hindu di Lombok Barat dan kota Mataram, di mana banyak situs suci Hindu terletak dan memiliki sejarah panjang hubungan dengan Islam. Hasilnya menunjukkan bahwa tidak ada cukup sosialisasi konsep pariwisata halal untuk rekan-rekan Hindu. Beberapa dari mereka memiliki gagasan yang sama dengan rekan-rekan mereka di Bali dalam menolak konsep pariwisata halal karena mereka percaya bahwa turisme halal akan mempengaruhi tradisi dan praktik mereka. Sementara itu, Hindu lain tampaknya memiliki posisi netral, yang berarti mereka tidak benar-benar memahami konsep pariwisata halal tetapi bersedia mendukungnya, selama mereka masih memiliki kebebasan dalam mengekspresikan tradisi dan praktik agama mereka. Pendapat-pendapat yang relatif negatif dari komunitas-komunitas Hindu ini harus dipertimbangkan oleh semua pihak terkait dalam mengembangkan pariwisata halal di Lombok sebagai tantangan untuk mengevaluasi kembali konsep turisme halal untuk memprioritaskan nilai-nilai Islam moderasi daripada berorientasi ekonomi dan ideologi, termasuk penggunaan istilah yang lebih dapat diterima dari "target wisata ramah Muslim".*

**Keywords:** pariwisata halal, Lombok, moderasi agama, agama minoritas.



## A. INTRODUCTION

“Halal tourism” is certainly not a new term in the concept of tourism development in the country, especially in regions that are dominated with Islamic nuances, such as in West Nusa Tenggara Province, especially in the Island of Lombok. Many people would easily think that in the region where the number of Muslims is more than 96 percent of its total population, there should be no serious obstacle to develop halal tourism because most all infrastructures needed for supporting halal tourism, such as halal foods, mosques, and Islamic rituals or attractions are effortlessly be found everywhere in the region (Komalasari, Hadijati, Fitriyani, & Kurnia, 2020; Permadi, Darwini, Retnowati, & Wahyulina, 2019). The appearance of many Islamic symbols in public areas also indicates that most people in these areas seem to have a similar idea with the development of halal tourism (Ferdiansyah, Sulhaini, & Athar, 2020). This situation usually leads to a simplified conclusion that there is no different opinion on understanding the term of halal tourism.

However, if we seriously examine the use of the term “halal tourism” in more detail, for example in a smaller area of district or village, we will see various challenges to develop the concept of halal tourism. Indeed, in some places, especially in areas where Muslims are not the majority, such as in Bali and other regions of Eastern Indonesia, the rejection toward the development of halal tourism is explicitly expressed in various forms of protests and public campaign against the presence of several halal tourist sites (Faraudis, Andiani, & Rahmawati, 2019; Handayani, Seraphin, & Korstanje, 2019; Perguna, Triharini, & Pahlevi, 2021).

Most of these rejections are actually related more to a less comprehensive perception of the concept of halal tourism, which is often interpreted as an effort to “Islamize” existing tourism assets only or as a tool of some Islamic political groups to implement local sharia regulations (Hidayat & Komarudin, 2019; Nahidloh & Qadariyah, 2021). This study tries to further examine how some fellow Hindus in West Lombok and Mataram City, especially in some Hindu communities, react to the concept of halal tourism. How do they, including the village government officials, community leaders, and the members of community at the grassroots level, respond to the implementation of surrounding halal tourist destinations. Are there any concerns they feel related to the development of this halal tourism concept? How is the position of developing the concept of halal tourism when compared to other terms that have also begun to be developed, such as the concept of “Muslim friendly” or “friendly to Muslims”?

All of these questions are needed to be considered seriously in finding the best formula for developing halal tourism. As an island, which is closely associated with the popular slogan or tagline as “the island of a thousand mosque”, Lombok certainly has great potential to be developed as perfect locations to realize the halal tourism industry in the country. Indeed, in 2019 Lombok was elected as the best halal tourism in the world based on criteria set by Global Muslim Travel Index (GMTI). It is actually not a big surprise for Lombok because most all parties, such as government employers, NGO activists, tourist actors, to students had been working hard since 2014 to support the development of halal tourism.

Success story of Lombok in developing halal tourism was started in 2015, when Lombok won two prestigious awards at World Halal Travel Summit 2015 held in Abu Dhabi, Uni Emirat Arab as “World’s Best Halal Honeymoon Destination” and “World Best Halal Tourism Destination” (Dewi, Sudirman, & Andriani, 2021; Fitriani & Naamy, 2019). Since then, more serious attention to develop halal tourism had been started by all related sectors of tourism. The Governor of Nusa Tenggara Barat, where the island of Lombok is located, issued a special regulation on halal tourism, Perda (lit. local regulation) No. 6 / 2016. The regulation aims to provide service and convenience to foreign tourists as well as domestic tourists who are Muslim. In this case it is intended that tourism based on Islamic concepts does not mean limit the activities of non-Muslim tourists (Rahmaningsih, Hermanto, & Athar, 2021).

In additions, many investors also came to Lombok and built several infrastructures to support halal tourism, such as hotels, cafes, restaurants, and resorts. They employ Islamic management system toward their assets. Shari’ah hotels, new halal tourist destinations, and shari’ah cafes or restaurants become easy to find across the Lombok. All of these Islamic facilities seems to compete each other to show Islamic symbols at public areas (Churiyah, Pratikto, Filianti, & Akbar, 2020). As the island of a thousand mosques, it is very natural that we see so many symbols of Islam, especially mosques, across Lombok. This fact became the main reason why Lombok has been chosen for the best halal tourist destination in the country since 2019.

High enthusiasm in developing halal tourism does not always have positive results. The presence of Islamic symbols that are increasingly dominant in the daily life of the Lombok people is also used by a group of people who try to make the implementation of sharia regulations an inseparable part of the concept of developing halal tourism. Several political parties that support the implementation of Islamic sharia have begun to work on several regulations related to this matter, such as regulations on alcoholic beverages, the obligation to dress Muslim in several government agencies and public schools, and several other similar regulations (Churiyah et al., 2020; Dase, 2021).

With such a context of tourism development, it is not surprising that the meaning of the concept of halal tourism itself then becomes negative in the eyes of non-Muslims (Fitriani & Naamy, 2019). For some of them, the meaning of halal tourism development is nothing more than the process of Islamization. Starting from the Islamization of tourism assets, which if not controlled will create pockets of Muslim communities who are no longer willing to live side by side with non-Muslims (Maulidi, 2019). The phenomenon of the proliferation of sharia housing can be used as a real indicator of the emergence of the Islamization process.

Of course, the emergence of Islamic housing for now may not be so felt the negative impact. High enthusiasm to display Islamic symbols as part of one’s piety indicators, if not immediately realized the consequences will lead to segregation in society which will further emphasize the identity of “us” and “them” which in the long run can potentially lead to attitudes discrimination and division in society (Nizar & Rakhmawati, 2020).

Therefore, it needs serious attention from all interested parties in the process of developing halal tourism to pay attention to the voices of non-Muslim colleagues on the development of the concept of halal tourism. This is important to do so as not to give rise to negative views related to the development of halal tourism. There needs to be firmness and also more intensive socialization of the process of developing halal tourism by also involving minority groups so that there is no marginalization process for non-Muslim groups, especially the Hindu community, which already has a long history of living in harmony with Muslims in Lombok..

## B. METHOD

Based on research questions, which aim to reveal a description or exploration of the research's subjects, this research can be categorized as qualitative research, using a case study. A case study, as indicated by Robert K. Yin, aims to investigate a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context, especially when the boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clearly evident, and work with this technically distinctive situation. In this case, the social dynamics of Hindu-Muslim relations become an important aspect in analyzing the implementation of the halal tourism concept in everyday life situation. An advantage of using a case study is the role of theory development. For a case study, theory development as part of the design phase is essential, whether the ensuing case study's purpose is to develop or test theory (Yin, 2003). This is one point of difference between case studies and other related methods such as ethnography (Bochner & Ellis, 2002) and grounded theory (Creswell, 2007). In this case, we will employ Islamic social capital theory, which is a modification of social capital theory in general such as formulated by Bourdieu and Putnam, to identify the possibility in optimizing the assets of both sacred sites

## C. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Discourse regarding the development of halal tourism has started to emerge since 2014 when many Western countries, including Australia, began to look at the market share of tourists from Islamic countries, especially those who came from the Middle East (Battour & Ismail, 2016). The initial discourse that developed in those Western countries was how to make Muslim travelers feel comfortable and willing to stay as long as possible. The main concern for developing halal tourism was related to the physical infrastructure needed by Muslim travelers, especially related to foods, accommodations, and the convenience of carrying out worship, especially the five daily prayers. However, these minimum requirements developed into more complex standard of halal tourism (Battour & Ismail, 2016).

In principle, according to Organisation of Islamic Cooperation and The Statistical, Economic and Social Research and Training Centre for Islamic Countries (SESRIC), Islamic tourism is about satisfying tourists looking for a destination that can fulfil their needs without being offensive in any way. It covers all tourism related goods and services that are designed, produced and presented to the market according to the Islamic rules (SESRIC, 2017, pp. 4-5). At the simplest level, these principles "prohibit adultery, gambling, consumption of pork and other Haram (forbidden)

foods, selling or drinking liquor and dressing inappropriately.” In addition, a typical Muslim is expected to do regular prayers in clean environments and fast in Ramadan. In Islamic teachings, Muslims are also expected to abstain from unnecessary consumption and indulgence.

Based on these requirements and the fact that Lombok has been chosen for the best halal tourist destination in the world only within several years of developing halal tourism, there should be no serious obstacle to continue providing what the Muslim travelers need because the everyday life of Lombok people is actually can be considered “Islamic”, especially with the tagline of “Lombok as an island with a thousand mosque” (Assyifa, 2021; Kamali, 2021a). Therefore, concentrate only on improving the quality of those “standard” will be risky and easily be replicated by other competitors. It is necessary to move beyond these halal tourism standards and pay more attention to the harmonious socio-religious potential that has been the hallmark of Indonesian society. This potential needs to be highlighted, apart from the fact that currently many Islamic communities in the world are looking at religious harmony and moderation, it can also be used as a means to involve colleagues from other religions to be actively involved in the development of halal tourism so that they do not feel left out or marginalized in the development project of halal tourism.

However, because there is no single definition related to the concept of halal tourism, various definitions have developed in the community, including negative views on the concept of halal tourism (Assyifa, 2021; Baihaqi, 2019). In this context, the challenges for developing halal tourism are actually starting to emerge. In addition, the enormous economic potential will certainly bring in various parties to get involved and fight for profits from the development of halal tourism in Lombok. These various prospects and challenges will be explained in more detail below.

The explanation regarding the prospects and challenges in developing halal tourism in this study is based on the reality that occurred in the two locations in this study: Narmada District, West Lombok Regency, especially in Suranandi Village and in Mataram City, especially around subdistrict of Mataram.

### Redefining the Concept of “Halal Tourism”

In general, the development of halal tourism in Indonesia, including in Lombok, is actually quite encouraging, considering that Indonesia is still seen by the world as one of the best halal tourism locations in the world. However, there are several negative indicators that need to be taken seriously: first, there is a tendency that halal tourism is used as an entry point by some politicians to support the implementation of Islamic law in this country; second, the lack of socialization and participation from business actors and other religious communities, in the context of Lombok, of course referring to the Hindu community which is quite significant in number, especially when viewed from the grassroots level at the village or sub-district level; and third, the growing variety of definitions related to the concept of halal tourism (Churiyah et al., 2020; Humairah & Alversia, 2021).

Those three indicators are certainly related to each other. Efforts to pass several regional regulations with sharia nuances which are quite widespread in several places in Indonesia in the last

few years have generated a fairly wide controversy in the community. Some people view that the shariatization of regional regulations is the first step which will eventually be seen as replacing the Pancasila ideology with Islamic law. In this context, the rejection does not only come from those of different religions, but also becomes part of the conflict between Islamic groups in the country, especially between mainstream Islam Muhammadiyah and NU vis a vis transnational Islamic group.

This condition of course raises concerns for non-Muslim colleagues so that not a few of them have negative views related to halal tourism, as shown in the rejection of the presence of halal tourism on the island of Bali (Handayani et al., 2019). The concept of halal tourism that has been developed is no more seen as an effort to take over their tourism assets. The meaning of halal tourism as part of the Islamization of tourism assets is something that cannot be avoided. Moreover, most of the informants who are Hindus, especially in Mataram City have the same view or at least they choose to speak neutrally because they are indeed a minority group.

The various terms used in the context of halal tourism, such as “Islamic tourism”, “halal hospitality”, “Shari’ah hotel”, or “Muslim Friendly tourism”, which are not accompanied by a comprehensive explanation also contribute to the meaning of the concept of halal tourism in Indonesia. several places (Fitriani & Naamy, 2019). Halal tourism which has already been connoted as a form of Islamization also gives us an idea of how the process of socializing the concept of halal tourism that is carried out does not specifically accommodate the interests of developing non-Muslim communities, especially Hindu communities.

These facts should be used as a consideration to the authority to create an official term of halal tourism which free from negative image, not only for Muslims, but also for non-Muslims. A term like “Muslim Friendly Tourism” perhaps will be more acceptable compare to halal tourism (Khoiriati, ., Krisnajaya, & Dinarto, 2018; Perguna et al., 2021), which has been negatively portrayed as “Islamization” of tourism. This rebranding of halal tourism is an important step that should be followed by a massive socialization for all Indonesian citizen, regardless their religious affiliation and ethnicity.

### Go Beyond the Standards of Halal Tourism

Halal tourism development efforts which are currently being intensively implemented in several local governments in the country, often only touch the physical aspects related to the halalness of a product, including the management process (Dase, 2021; Faraudis et al., 2019). These issues should no longer need to be worried in the context of the Indonesian people, who are predominantly Muslim and whose daily life cannot be separated from religious aspects. The issue of providing facilities and infrastructure in accordance with the demands of Islamic teachings should indeed be a big problem when the population of halal tourism development areas is still dominated by non-Muslims (Nahidloh & Qadariah, 2021). In Western countries, for example, the existence of mosques, halal food, and the like will certainly be very difficult to realize and require significant development costs.

A simple example of this phenomenon, for example, has never existed in this country any issues related to the halalness of chicken or beef from the side of the animal slaughtering process. Chicken and beef available in traditional markets, even without a halal stamp from the MUI, people will not doubt the halalness of the meat because the person who slaughters the animal is almost certainly a Muslim and he will follow the slaughtering procedure according to Islamic teachings. It is different in Western countries where the majority of the population is non-Muslim, so the discourse related to the process of slaughtering animals, which is likely to be carried out by non-Muslims, will become a separate problem for certain Islamic groups according to the schools they adhere to.

Therefore, it is not appropriate if then efforts to develop halal tourism in the country, especially on the island of Lombok, are only oriented to a physical or infrastructure aspect (Churiyah et al., 2020). Criteria of being a halal tourist destination set by SESRIC, for example, has easily been fulfilled by most tourist destinations in Lombok. Place for prayer, halal foods, shari'ah hotel, facility for fasting, and Islamic package tours, can easily be found in every corner of places.

In addition, if the development of the halal tourism concept only follows the required halal standards, then there will be no comparative advantage to be proud of because it is not easy to replicate in other places (Kamali, 2021b). Moreover, investors with unlimited funds can at anytime and anywhere replicate what we have developed regarding halal tourism, including conjuring beaches and replicating artificial natural beauty. Therefore, it is necessary to make efforts to optimize all existing potentials, including harmony in the daily life of people between followers of different religions. Islam, which claims to be a religion that is rahmatan lil alamin, certainly needs to show moderate values and tolerance which are increasingly rare and difficult to find in Islamic countries in the Middle East, especially after the emergence of the Arab Spring phenomenon.

The two locations in this study provide a good overview of how to manage socio-religious life among followers of different religions, particularly Muslims and Hindus. The fragments of harmonious life between Muslims and Hindus that have existed for hundreds of years can certainly be used as an asset for halal tourism that offers a different alternative compared to various "regulated" natural attractions. Aspects of real learning about the practice of living together will find its urgency in the midst of a world community that is experiencing crises and various religious based conflicts.

To realize this idea, a serious initial step is needed to involve different religious communities to sit down together to discuss how to develop the concept of halal tourism which is more acceptable to all parties and also not used as a tool to sow certain ideologies that are contrary to Pancasila and the Constitution. 1945.

#### D. CONCLUSION

This research on "Developing Halal Tourism in an Island of a Thousand Mosques: Opportunities and Challenges" is intended to contribute ideas related to the development of the concept of halal tourism, which many parties suspect is still understood in various ways by the public and tends to raise concerns, especially for non-Muslims. Muslims whose position seems to be

increasingly marginalized. This is necessary to get the attention of all parties so that the challenges that arise in the development of the halal tourism concept can be handled more wisely.

There is not enough socialization of the concept of halal tourism for Hindus fellows. Some of them have similar idea with their fellows in Bali in rejecting the concept of halal tourism because they believe that halal tourism will affected their traditions and practices. Meanwhile, other Hindus seem to have a neutral position, meaning that they do not really understand about the concept of halal tourism but willing to support it, as long as they still have freedom in expressing their religious traditions and practices. These relatively negative opinions from Hindus communities have to be considered seriously by all related parties in developing halal tourism in Lombok as challenges to re-evaluate the concept of halal tourism to prioritize the Islamic values of moderation rather than economic and ideological oriented, including the use of more acceptable term of “Muslim-friendly tourist destination”..

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This article is based on a research supported by the research funding of BOPTN UIN Sunan Kalijaga 2021.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Assyifa. (2021). *What People Say About Halal Tourism? (Vol. 1): Sharia Economic Applied Research and Training (SMART) Insight*.
- Baihaqi, M. (2019). *Wisata Halal di Gili Trawangan Lombok Utara (Vol. 4): IAIN Langsa*.
- Battour, M., & Ismail, M. N. (2016). *Halal tourism: Concepts, practises, challenges and future (Vol. 19): Elsevier BV*.
- Bochner, A. P., & Ellis, C. (2002). *Ethnographically speaking : autoethnography, literature, and aesthetics*. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.
- Churiyah, M., Pratikto, H., Filianti, F., & Akbar, M. F. (2020). *Halal Tourism: Between Economic Opportunities and Social Acceptance (Vol. 1): State University of Malang (UM)*.
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry & research design : choosing among five approaches (2nd ed.)*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Dase, A. B. (2021). *Industri Wisata Halal di Indonesia: Produk Kapitalisme Sampai Dengan Fundamentalisme Agama (Vol. 1): Sekolah Tinggi Agama Kristen Negeri Toraja*.
- Dewi, K., Sudirman, I., & Andriani, R. (2021). *Pengaruh Service Excellence, Aksesibilitas, dan Word of Mouth (WOM) terhadap Minat Wisatawan serta Implikasinya terhadap Keputusan Kunjungan Wisata Halal di Kabupaten Bandung Barat (Vol. 19): Sekolah Tinggi Pariwisata AMPTA Yogyakarta*.
- Faraudis, Z., Andiani, N. D., & Rahmawati, P. I. (2019). *Bingkai Halal dan Non Halal: Studi Kasus Penerapan Halal Food di Restoran Spice Beach Club Bali (Vol. 2): Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha*.



- Ferdiansyah, L. F., Sulhaini, S., & Athar, H. S. (2020). Penerapan Konsep Pariwisata Halal pada Citra Merek Pulau Lombok (Vol. 9): Universitas Mataram.
- Fitriani, M. I., & Naamy, N. (2019). Halal Tourism in Lombok Island: Potentials, Challenges, and the Role of Islamic Education (Vol. 27): UIN Walisongo Semarang.
- Handayani, B., Seraphin, H., & Korstanje, M. (2019). Halal Tourism in Bali, Why Not? : IGI Global.
- Hidayat, M. R., & Komarudin, P. (2019). The Implementation of National Sharia Board's Fatwa Number 108 Year 2016 about Sharia Tourism on Halal Tourism Products (Vol. 24): IAIN Metro Lampung.
- Humairah, N., & Alversia, Y. (2021). Examining Dimensions of Halal Tourism Attributes and Tourist Experience to Enhance Destination Image in Lombok: The International Institute of Knowledge Management (TIKIM).
- Kamali, M. H. (2021a). Halal and Tayyib Compared: Oxford University Press.
- Kamali, M. H. (2021b). Shariah and the Halal Industry: Oxford University Press.
- Khoiriati, S. D., S., Krisnajaya, I. M., & Dinarto, D. (2018). Debating Halal Tourism Between Values and Branding: A Case Study of Lombok, Indonesia (Vol. 3): Knowledge E.
- Komalasari, D., Hadijati, M., Fitriyani, N., & Kurnia, A. (2020). Factor Extraction and Bicluster Analysis on Halal Destinations in Lombok Island (Vol. 4): STMIK Bumigora Mataram.
- Maulidi, M. J. (2019). Wisata Halal dan Identitas Islami: Studi Kasus Lombok, Nusa Tenggara Barat (Vol. 6): Universitas Gadjah Mada.
- Nahidloh, S., & Qadariyah, L. (2021). Sharia compliance as the potential factor for halal tourism destination development (Vol. 2): State University of Malang (UM).
- Nizar, M., & Rakhmawati, A. (2020). Tinjauan Wisata Halal Perspektif Maqosidus Syariah Terkait Fatwa Dsn Mui Dsn-Mui No. 08 Tahun 2016 (Vol. 6): IAI Darussalam Blokagung.
- Perguna, L. A., Triharini, S., & Pahlevi, D. S. (2021). Exploring perception and resistance on halal labeling: An insight from Denpasar, Bali: Routledge.
- Permadi, L. A., Darwini, S., Retnowati, W., & Wahyulina, S. (2019). Persepsi dan Preferensi Wisatawan Muslim terhadap Sarana dan Prasarana Wisata Halal di Lombok (Studi Kasus Kawasan Ekonomi Khusus Mandalika) (Vol. 4): Universitas Mataram.
- Rahmaningsih, S., Hermanto, H., & Athar, H. S. (2021). Halal Tourism Marketing Strategy Based on Delta Model to Increase Millennial Tourist Interest in Lombok Island (Vol. 8): International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding (IJMMU).
- SESRIC. (2017). Strategic Roadmap for Development of Islamic Tourism in OIC Member Countries. <https://www.oic-oci.org/docdown/?docID=1777&refID=1071>
- Yin, R. K. (2003). Case study research : design and methods (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Sage Publications.

Halaman ini sengaja dikosongkan