

Enhancing Islamic Educational Quality through Output-Based Quality Assurance: A Literature Review Perspective

Sulfiani¹, Nora Saiva Jannana², Sedyo Santosa³

^{1,2,3}Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia

sulfianimustakim983@gmail.com¹, nora.jannana@uin-suka.ac.id², sedyo.santosa@uin-suka.ac.id³

Article Info

Received:

27-09-2023

Revised:

13-11-2023

Approved:

31-12-2023

Keywords

Output-based Quality, Quality Assurance, Educational Quality, Strategic Programs, Islamic Educational Institutions

OPEN ACCESS

Abstract: This research undertakes a comprehensive literature review to analyze output-based quality assurance in Islamic educational institutions. The study systematically reviews scholarly articles published between 2019 and 2023, focusing on quality assurance and educational institution outputs. The findings highlight the pivotal roles of vision and mission alignment, strategic program implementation, robust facilities, and the cultivation of academically and competitively adept graduates. Key outcomes from the review include the importance of effective communication in achieving Islamic institutional goals, the significance of academic and non-academic flagship programs, and the criticality of a strong teaching and learning process. The study also reveals the efficacy of integrating strategic planning, stakeholder engagement, and a balance of academic excellence and character development in enhancing educational quality. Despite its comprehensive nature, the research acknowledges limitations in its scope, primarily its reliance on existing literature, which may not encompass all possible educational contexts. Future research should explore diverse educational settings further and assess the long-term impacts of quality assurance strategies on student outcomes and Islamic institutional reputation. This study significantly contributes to the discourse on educational quality assurance, advocating for comprehensive, adaptable, and inclusive strategies in response to the evolving demands of the educational landscape.

Abstrak: Penelitian ini mengemukakan analisis menyeluruh terhadap jaminan kualitas berbasis keluaran di institusi pendidikan Islam melalui tinjauan literatur. Studi ini secara sistematis mengulas artikel ilmiah yang dipublikasikan antara tahun 2019 hingga 2023, dengan fokus pada jaminan kualitas dan keluaran institusi pendidikan. Temuan utama menyoroti peranan penting keselarasan visi dan misi, implementasi program unggulan strategis, fasilitas yang memadai, dan pengembangan lulusan yang kompetitif secara akademik. Hasil kajian ini menunjukkan bahwa komunikasi efektif sangat vital dalam mencapai tujuan institusional, begitu juga pentingnya program unggulan akademik dan non-akademik, serta proses pengajaran dan pembelajaran yang kuat. Studi ini juga mengungkapkan efektivitas integrasi perencanaan strategis, keterlibatan pemangku kepentingan, dan keseimbangan antara keunggulan akademik dan pengembangan karakter dalam meningkatkan kualitas pendidikan. Meskipun bersifat komprehensif, penelitian ini mengakui keterbatasan dalam lingkupnya, terutama karena bergantung pada literatur yang ada, yang mungkin tidak mencakup semua konteks pendidikan yang mungkin. Penelitian lebih lanjut direkomendasikan untuk mengeksplorasi berbagai pengaturan pendidikan dan menilai dampak jangka panjang dari strategi jaminan kualitas terhadap hasil siswa dan reputasi institusi. Studi ini memberikan kontribusi signifikan pada diskusi tentang jaminan kualitas pendidikan, mendukung strategi yang komprehensif, dapat diadaptasi, dan inklusif sebagai respons terhadap tuntutan yang berkembang dalam lanskap pendidikan

1. Introduction

Education is crucial in shaping high-quality human resources capable of global competitiveness. The current primary focus is on enhancing the quality of educational

institutions, and in this context, quality assurance becomes an essential tool to ensure the attainment of desired standards. In line with the changing dynamics of education, the Indonesian Government has responded by issuing a Government Regulation (PP) on the National Education System (SNP) in 2022. PP SNP 2022 reflects the spirit of a paradigm shift in quality assurance by introducing the concept of output-based quality assurance.¹ This establishes a new foundation where educational institutions are expected to meet process standards and produce high-quality outcomes.²

The transformation in the quality assurance system involves a series of steps or actions taken to enhance the effectiveness, efficiency, and relevance of a quality assurance system.³ The transformation of the quality assurance system often involves a paradigm shift from emphasizing control and monitoring of processes to a focus on outcomes and achievements (output).⁴ Output-based quality assurance refers to assessing and evaluating the quality of institutions or educational products by concentrating on the results produced, such as student achievements, graduate capabilities, or positive impacts on society.⁵ To elevate education quality standards in Indonesia, the Government has issued the Government Regulation (PP) on the National Education System (SNP) in 2022 as the basis for new regulations.⁶ PP SNP reflects the Government's determination to transform education and introduces a new structure in quality assurance, mainly by concentrating on output-based methods.⁷

Education is currently under pressure to transition from a model focused on input to output-oriented.⁸ The assessment of the success of an educational institution is now more focused on educational outcomes. Implementing the National Education Standards (SNP) encourages educational institutions to ensure quality both in the educational process and the results produced.⁹ Integrated quality management, focusing on character, is integral to the National Education Standards (SNP) requirements. Improving the quality of education has become a top priority in efforts to enhance the nation's competitiveness globally.¹⁰ Quality outputs are considered key indicators of educational

¹ Plante David T. et al., "Competency-Based Sleep Medicine Fellowships: Addressing Workforce Needs and Enhancing Educational Quality," *Journal of Clinical Sleep Medicine* 16, no. 1 (December 2023): 137–41, doi:10.5664/jcsm.8138.

² Afkar Afkar et al., *Total Quality Management Dalam Penjaminan Mutu Pendidikan* (Sukoharjo: Tahta Media Group, 2023), hal.9.

³ Heppy Puspitasari, "Standar Proses Pembelajaran Sebagai Sistem Penjaminan Mutu Internal Di Sekolah," *Muslim Heritage* 2, no. 2 (2018): 339–68, doi:doi.org/10.21154/muslimheritage.v2i2.1115.

⁴ Istikomah Istikomah dan Akbar Romadlon Dzulfikar, *Sistem Penjaminan Mutu Pesantren* (Kediri: CV Kreator Cerdas Indonesia, 2023), hal. 24.

⁵ Marina S. Nebeska et al., "Enhancing the Educational Activities of Law Students as One of the Ways to Improve Efficiency and Quality of the Professional Training," *International Journal of Higher Education* 9, no. 4 (2020), doi:doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v9n4p291.

⁶ Rahmat Hidayat, "Manajemen Peningkatan Mutu Lembaga Pendidikan Islam Di Kota Medan," *ISEMA: Islamic Educational Management* 1, no. 1 (2019), doi:doi.org/10.15575/isema.v1i1.4982.

⁷ Sri Rahayu and Fuji Rahmadi P, "PENINGKATAN MUTU LEMBAGA PENDIDIKAN ANAK USIA DINI MELALUI MANAJEMEN SUMBER DAYA MANUSIA," *Jurnal Review Pendidikan Dan Pengajaran (JRPP)* 6, no. 4 (October 2023): 726–32, doi:10.31004/jrpp.v6i4.20299.

⁸ Oksana Holiuk et al., "Integrative Model for Enhancing Students' Competencies and the Quality of Educational Services," *International Journal of Innovative Technology and Engineering* 9, no. 1 (2019), doi:10.35940/ijitee.A4992.119119.

⁹ Amiruddin Siahaan et al., "Mengelola Dan Meningkatkan Mutu Pembelajaran Pendidik Dan Tenaga Kependidikan Dalam Manajemen Lembaga Pendidikan Islam," *Journal on Education* 5, no. 3 (2023): 5815–25, doi:doi.org/10.31004/joe.v5i3.1344.

¹⁰ William K Cummings and Olga Bain, "Modeling Strategies for Enhancing Educational Quality," *Research in Comparative and International Education* 12, no. 2 (2017),



success. Quality outputs are considered key indicators of academic success. Analyzing outcomes helps educational institutions adjust their curricula to the needs of the job market.¹¹ The quality of graduates can be obtained by ensuring that both input and process components involved in all services provided by the school meet high-quality standards. Therefore, to ensure the achievement of the expected quality of graduates, quality assurance needs to be carried out on various aspects considered as determinants of the final quality of school graduates based on the data obtained.

The quality of graduates can be obtained by ensuring that both input and process components involved in all services provided by the school meet high-quality standards.¹² Therefore, to ensure the achievement of the expected quality of graduates, quality assurance needs to be carried out on various aspects considered as determinants of the final quality of school graduates.¹³ Regarding the quality assurance of output-based educational institutions, there are several previous studies relevant to the research title, such as the research results of Devi's study on the Analysis of Quality and Input-Process-Output of Education at MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat, which indicates that (1) To achieve the vision and mission, the head of the madrasah must always be able to communicate with madrasah stakeholders. In addition, the vision and mission are also supported by various strategic flagship programs in both academic and non-academic activities. (2) MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat has exemplary achievements in both academic and non-academic fields, (3) It has facilities and infrastructure above the minimum standards, (4) Graduates of MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat can compete in pursuing the best educational levels.¹⁴ The following study is Luthfi Zulkarmain's research, titled Analysis of Quality (Input Process Output) of Education at MTs Assalam Educational Institution in Mataram City, West Nusa Tenggara, which shows research results that the quality management process system and the quality of students with mandatory boarding schools and following the rules of boarding schools, collaborating with boarding schools, collaborating with the community, and organizing.¹⁵

The research conducted by Saleh and Malik emphasizes the significance of strategic processes in Islamic educational institutions, highlighting the optimization of decision-making, Islamic institutional management, program management, teaching and learning processes, and monitoring and evaluation processes.¹⁶ Among these, the teaching and learning process has the highest level of importance, underscoring its critical role in shaping the educational experience. Concurrently, there is a focus on improving output

doi:doi.org/10.1177/1745499917711546.

¹¹ Khairul Saleh, "Strategi Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Sekolah Dasar Islam Terpadu (SDIT) Di Provinsi Kalimantan Timur (Studi Kasus SDIT Cordova Samarinda Dan SDIT YABIS Bontang)," *Fenomena: Jurnal Penelitian* 11, no. 2 (2019): 143–54, doi:doi.org/10.21093/fj.v11i1.1388.

¹² Baurzhan Bokayev et al., "Distance Learning in Kazakhstan: Estimating Parents' Satisfaction of Educational Quality during the Coronavirus," *Technology, Pedagogy and Education* 30, no. 1 (January 2021): 27–39, doi:10.1080/1475939X.2020.1865192.

¹³ Ana-Paula Correia, Chenxi Liu, and Fan Xu, "Evaluating Videoconferencing Systems for the Quality of the Educational Experience," *Distance Education* 41, no. 4 (October 2020): 429–52, doi:10.1080/01587919.2020.1821607.

¹⁴ Aulia Diana Devi, "Analisis Mutu Dan Kualitas Input-Proses-Output Pendidikan Di MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat," *Al-Fahim: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 3, no. 1 (2021): 1–13, doi:doi.org/10.54396/alfahim.v3i1.115.

¹⁵ Lutfhi Zulkarnain, "Analisis Mutu (Input Proses Output) Pendidikan Di Lembaga Pendidikan MTs Assalam Kota Mataram Nusa Tenggara Barat," *MANAZHIM* 3, no. 1 (2021): 17–31, doi:doi.org/10.36088/manazhim.v3i1.946.

¹⁶ Saleh, "Strategi Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Sekolah Dasar Islam Terpadu (SDIT) Di Provinsi Kalimantan Timur (Studi Kasus SDIT Cordova Samarinda Dan SDIT YABIS Bontang)."

aspects, which includes enhancing academic achievement by optimizing existing components and striving to produce high-quality graduates. This improvement also extends to non-academic achievements, with a targeted emphasis on cultivating students who embody Islamic character and excel in arts, sports, and extracurricular activities.

Parallel to these efforts is the growing adoption of output-based quality assurance in Islamic education. This approach is increasingly recognized as a vital method for systematically enhancing the quality of education. It resonates with the modern educational paradigm that prioritizes measurable outcomes and competency-based education. By synergizing traditional Islamic values with contemporary educational methodologies, Islamic educational institutions are positioned to produce graduates who are proficient in their religious teachings and equipped with the essential skills to succeed in the modern world. This integration ensures a balanced education that honors religious traditions while embracing the demands and challenges of the contemporary era.

However, existing literature on output-based quality assurance in Islamic education reveals certain limitations and gaps. There is a need for more comprehensive studies that address the diverse aspects of educational quality, including the integration of religious and secular curricula, the assessment of non-academic achievements, and the adaptation of modern educational technologies. These gaps present opportunities for further research and exploration, which could contribute significantly to Islamic academic studies.

This research focuses on undertaking a comprehensive literature review to analyze output-based quality assurance in Islamic educational institutions. The aim is to bridge the identified gaps in previous studies and offer fresh insights into enhancing the quality of Islamic education. By examining the existing frameworks and practices of quality assurance, this study seeks to contribute to developing more effective and holistic approaches. Ultimately, the research aspires to support Islamic educational institutions in producing graduates who are academically accomplished and embody Islamic values and ethics in their personal and professional lives.

2. Method

This study utilized a literature review methodology¹⁷ to explore output-based quality assurance in educational institutions. The approach involved systematically analyzing scholarly articles published between 2019 and 2023, focusing on the intersection of quality assurance and educational institution outputs. The procedure commenced with an initial search using the keywords "quality assurance" and "educational institution output" in online databases, namely Google Scholar and Scopus, renowned for their comprehensive academic coverage. This initial search yielded 30 articles, which were then meticulously assessed for relevance and quality, eventually narrowing down to 20 articles categorized into three quality levels: high (10 pieces), medium (6 pieces), and low (4 articles). Data was collected through a strategic and targeted search, ensuring efficiency and relevance in the literature gathered. The qualitative analysis involved thematic coding of the articles, focusing on their contributions to understanding output-based quality assurance. This analysis method allowed for identifying key themes, trends, and gaps in the literature. To ensure the study's reliability and validity, a systematic and transparent approach was adopted in both the selection and analysis of the literature.¹⁸

¹⁷ Raymon van Dinter, Bedir Tekinerdogan, and Cagatay Catal, "Automation of Systematic Literature Reviews: A Systematic Literature Review," *Information and Software Technology* 136 (2021): 106589, doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.infsof.2021.106589>.

¹⁸ Tomas Melo Peralta and Torbjörn E. M. Nordling, "A Literature Review of Methods for Assessment

The multi-level quality assessment of the sources and the comprehensive nature of the database search, encompassing both international and national literature, were critical in bolstering the credibility and relevance of the findings.

3. Result and Discussion

Based on the data obtained regarding the quality assurance of educational institutions based on the output, the educational institution includes: Research results indicate that (1) To achieve the vision and mission, the head of the madrasah must always be able to communicate with the stakeholders of the madrasah. In addition, the vision and mission are also supported by various strategic flagship programs, both academic and non-academic activities. (2) MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat has achieved exemplary achievements in academic and non-academic fields, (3) It has facilities and infrastructure above the minimum standards, (4) Graduates of MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat can compete in pursuing the best educational levels.¹⁹ Subsequent research with the results of the study shows that the quality improvement process system and the quality of students that exist with mandatory boarding schools and following the rules of the pesantren, collaborating with pesantren, collaborating with the community, organizing,²⁰ and similar research also shows in the aspect of the strategic process adopted, namely optimizing processes in decision-making, Islamic institutional management processes, program management processes, teaching and learning processes, and monitoring and evaluation processes. Note that the teaching and learning process has the highest level of importance compared to other methods. Meanwhile, improving the output aspect is to enhance academic achievements by optimizing existing components and striving to produce quality graduates and improve non-academic achievements by trying to produce students with Islamic character and achievements in arts, sports, and extracurricular activities.²¹

3.1. Quality of Islamic Educational Institutions

According to the Indonesian Dictionary (KBBI) definition, quality refers to measuring an object, level, degree, or standard and its overall excellence. This term is associated with products or services.²² Ikesawa expresses his view that quality and customer satisfaction are similar. The meaning of quality in education is always situated within the entire education system, encompassing planning, educational processes, evaluation, and academic outcomes.²³ According to Sallis, as cited by Imam Machali and Hidayat in their book "The Handbook of Educational Management: Theory and Practice of School/Madrasah Management in Indonesia," quality is considered a contradictory concept. This is because quality can be interpreted as an absolute and relative concept. Quality in a whole context is defined as the basis for assessment for improvement, setting the highest standards that cannot be surpassed. This means a product is considered high

of Reproducibility in Science," *Research Square Preprint*, 2022, 0-12, doi:10.21203/rs.3.rs-2267847/v5.

¹⁹ Devi, "Analisis Mutu Dan Kualitas Input-Proses-Output Pendidikan Di MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat."

²⁰ Zulkarnain, "Analisis Mutu (Input Proses Output) Pendidikan Di Lembaga Pendidikan MTs Assalam Kota Mataram Nusa Tenggara Barat."

²¹ Saleh, "Strategi Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Sekolah Dasar Islam Terpadu (SDIT) Di Provinsi Kalimantan Timur (Studi Kasus SDIT Cordova Samarinda Dan SDIT YABIS Bontang)."

²² Yahya Zahid Ismail, "Evaluasi Dan Pengendalian Peningkatan Mutu Dan Daya Saing Lembaga Pendidikan Islam," *AL-IFKAR: Jurnal Pengembangan Ilmu Keislaman* 19, no. 01 SE-Articles (March 2023): 4-29.

²³ Linda Ayu Karisma and Isna Faridatun Nadziroh, "Manajemen Mutu Perubahan Dalam Peningkatan Kualitas Lembaga Pendidikan Islam Di Madrasah Aliyah Negeri," *Dirasat: Jurnal Manajemen Dan Pendidikan Islam* 9, no. 1 (June 2023): 29-42, doi:10.26594/dirasat.v9i1.3295.

quality if it meets the established highest standards. In education, this perspective is only accessible to elite groups since educational institutions capable of providing high standards for students are rare, and the number of students able to afford it is minimal due to high costs.²⁴

Quality in a relative context can be seen as a contextual product, meaning that assessing something as high quality at present does not guarantee that it will remain high quality in the future. This indicates that quality is inherently subjective and dynamic. In relativity, quality becomes a concept that refers to two main aspects: identifying customers with specific needs and meeting action specifications. This concept aligns with Deming's view explained by Imam Machali and Ara Hidayat, interpreting quality as something dependent on context, customer perception, and customer needs and desires.²⁵ Educational quality is considered a method to measure the effectiveness and efficiency of educational management, to create superior achievements in both academic and non-academic aspects for students.²⁶ The definition of quality in the educational context includes aspects such as input, process, and scholarly output.²⁷

In the context of the definition of quality explained by the Indonesian Dictionary (KBBI) and Ikesawa's perspective, quality in education includes input, process, and educational output. Therefore, strategies and implementations of flagship programs in educational institutions can be interpreted as efforts to improve the quality of education through various aspects. The strategies used include determining flagship programs that align with the needs and development of students, implementing innovative and responsive teaching methods, and developing a comprehensive evaluation system to measure the achievements and progress of students. Implementing flagship programs involves operational planning, including curriculum development, human resources, and infrastructure. The execution of learning activities involving teachers, students, and lesson materials is in line with flagship programs, and continuous evaluation is applied to ensure the effectiveness of flagship programs.²⁸

Impact on the quality of educational institutions lies in several aspects: 1) Improvement of Academic Achievement, where the focus is on enhancing the quality of teaching and learning. This involves the implementation of challenging learning methods that support academic achievements. 2) Character Development: integrating character values into the curriculum and extracurricular activities and shaping students' character through activities supporting flagship programs. 3) Optimization of Resources: comprising human, financial, and physical resource management to support flagship programs.²⁹ Efficient use of resources is essential to support the implementation of these programs. The contextual quality within the scope of educational institutions involves

²⁴ Imam Machali dan Ara Hidayat, *The Handbook of Education Management Teori dan Praktik Pengelolaan Sekolah/Madrasah di Indonesia* (Jakarta: Pranadamedia Group, 2016), hal. 36.

²⁵ Ibid, hal. 20.

²⁶ Triana Rosalina Noor and Izzatul Islamiya, "Analisis Faktor Manajemen Peningkatan Mutu Lembaga Pendidikan Islam," *EDUSIANA: Jurnal Manajemen Dan Pendidikan Islam* 10, no. 2 SE-Articles (September 2023): 124–38.

²⁷ Muh Fitrah, "Peran Kepala Sekolah Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan," *Jurnal Penjaminan Mutu* 3, no. 1 (2017): 31–42, doi:doi.org/10.25078/jpm.v3i1.90.

²⁸ Abdul Wafi and Umarul Faruk, "Pesantren Earlier Dalam Implementasi Kurikulum Merdeka: Studi Kasus Di Pondok Pesantren Mambaul Ulum Bata Bata," *Heutagogia: Journal of Islamic Education* 3, no. 1 (2023), doi:doi.org/10.14421/hjje.2023.31-04.

²⁹ Nur Efendi and Muh. Ibnu Sholeh, "Manajemen Pendidikan Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pembelajaran," *Academicus: Journal of Teaching and Learning* 2, no. 1 (2023), doi:doi.org/10.59373/academicus.v2i2.25.

adapting flagship programs according to local or regional needs and conditions. Collaboration with local stakeholders and implementing relevant programs in the surrounding environment is a strategy to strengthen the quality of educational institutions. Thus, the assumption is that the quality and excellence of education in educational institutions are influenced by various factors and processes, providing positive impacts for all members of the educational institution. Consequently, these impacts give an overview of how the quality of educational institutions can be strengthened through improved academic performance, character development, and resource optimization while considering contextualization and sustainability within the local or regional scope.

3.2. Islamic Educational Institution Outputs

The concept of output, etymologically, refers to results or products. Applied to the educational context, educational output includes the results produced by educational institutions, such as policies, graduates, and achievements. Educational institutions aim to enhance learners' quality to produce competitive outputs in the external environment.³⁰ Quality educational institutions provide comprehensive attention to learners from admission to graduation. Academic output can be interpreted as the results or achievements produced by a specific educational institution. Evaluation of educational institution outputs can be conducted through assessments of quality, effectiveness, productivity, efficiency, and innovation. Thus, the quality of an educational institution is considered high if student learning achievements, teacher performance, and student achievements in extracurricular activities reach optimal levels.³¹

The results of madrasah performance, in the form of achievements, are referred to as educational institution outputs. The evaluation of madrasah performance can consider quality, productivity, efficiency, innovation, and work ethics. Educational institution output is the end product produced through the transformation process, especially related to students graduating from madrasah. Through assessment activities, it can be determined whether learners meet the graduation requirements. This assessment process serves as a tool to filter and assess the quality of education.³²

According to Imam Machali and Ara Hidayat, output levels are considered the highest, followed by process levels one step below output, and input levels occupying the lowest position between production and process. In this context, work refers to madrasah achievements arising from implementing learning management in madrasah. For further classification, the output can be divided into two categories: academic and non-academic achievements, such as arts, scouting, craftsmanship, honesty, tolerance, high curiosity, and the ability to collaborate effectively.³³ Meanwhile, four steps are taken to achieve output in the form of graduate quality: review, benchmarking, quality assurance, and quality control.³⁴ Therefore, input, process, and output form a crucial chain that needs continuous improvement involving various stakeholders in educational institutions.

³⁰ Nur Maulida Utu and Beny Sintasari, "Kepemimpinan Kepala Madrasah Dalam Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Di Mts Miftahul Ulum Cermenan Jombang," *Irsyaduna: Jurnal Studi Kemahasiswaan* 1, no. 1 (2021): 25–42, doi:doi.org/10.54437/irsyaduna.v1i1.246.

³¹ Zulkarnain, "Analisis Mutu (Input Proses Output) Pendidikan Di Lembaga Pendidikan MTs Assalam Kota Mataram Nusa Tenggara Barat."

³² Syaefudin Syaefudin, "Analisis Mutu Pendidikan Islam (Input, Proses & Output) (Studi Di MI Unggulan Ash-Shiddiqiyah-3 Purworejo)," *Aksiologi: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Ilmu Sosial* 1, no. 1 (2020): 24–32, doi:doi.org/10.47134/aksiologi.v1i1.1.

³³ Machali dan Hidayat, *The Handbook of Education Management Teori dan Praktik Pengelolaan Sekolah/Madrasah di Indonesia*, hal. 31.

³⁴ Aminatul Zahroh and Binti Maunah, "Total Quality Management (TQM): Sebuah Langkah Dalam

Based on the analysis of the results related to the quality of educational institution outputs, it can be concluded that the quality of results produced by an educational institution directly impacts the overall quality of the institution. High achievements, whether through graduates, policies, or other outcomes, will enhance the reputation and overall quality of the educational institution. Therefore, it is acknowledged that the output of educational institutions significantly influences the overall quality of the institution. High-quality achievements in creation demonstrate the effectiveness of educational institutions in providing a learning environment that supports the development of learners and achieves desired educational goals. The educational institution's work refers to both academic and non-academic aspects present in the institution.

3.4. The Impact of Teaching and Learning on Educational Quality in Islamic Institutional
This research interrogates the concept of output-based quality assurance in educational institutions, a multifaceted endeavor that encompasses vision and mission alignment, strategic programs, and academic achievements, among other aspects. Reflecting upon the research question and relevant literature, it becomes evident that quality assurance in education is a dynamic and intricate process. This process entails harmonizing Islamic institutional goals and stakeholder expectations and requires a critical evaluation of educational outputs, including the competitive edge of graduates.³⁵ Such a holistic approach is crucial for a comprehensive understanding of academic quality, as prevailing educational theories echo.

The study's findings reveal vital insights: firstly, the crucial role of communication by the head of the madrasah with stakeholders in achieving vision and mission alignment; secondly, the notable academic and non-academic achievements of MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat; thirdly, the institution's possession of facilities exceeding minimum standards; and lastly, the competitiveness of its graduates in pursuing advanced education levels.³⁶ Additionally, the research underscores the significance of the teaching and learning process, strategic process optimization, and enhancing academic and Islamic character in students.³⁷ These findings present a multifaceted view of the quality assurance process in educational institutions.

Comparing these results with prior studies, there is a unity in the emphasis on effective communication, comprehensive strategic planning, and robust infrastructure as pillars of educational quality.³⁸ However, this study's spotlight on the importance of the teaching and learning process as the most critical component presents a slight departure from some earlier research that placed equal emphasis on all aspects of educational management. This divergence highlights the evolving understanding of quality assurance in education, where process optimization is increasingly recognized as paramount.

The finding that effective communication by the madrasah head with stakeholders is pivotal in achieving vision and mission alignment highlights the importance of leadership and collaboration in educational quality assurance. This aligns with the

Mengedepankan Kualitas Output Melalui Sistem Kontrol Mutu (Quality Control) Sekolah," *Realita: Jurnal Penelitian Dan Kebudayaan Islam* 13, no. 2 (2015): 224–34, doi:doi.org/10.30762/realita.v13i2.65.

³⁵ Machali dan Hidayat, *The Handbook of Education Management Teori dan Praktik Pengelolaan Sekolah/Madrasah di Indonesia*, hal. 45.

³⁶ Devi, "Analisis Mutu Dan Kualitas Input-Proses-Output Pendidikan Di MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat."

³⁷ Zulkarnain, "Analisis Mutu (Input Proses Output) Pendidikan Di Lembaga Pendidikan MTs Assalam Kota Mataram Nusa Tenggara Barat."

³⁸ Carina Omoeva, Nina Menezes Cunha, and Wael Moussa, "Measuring Equity of Education Resource Allocation: An Output-Based Approach," *International Journal of Educational Development* 87 (2021): 102492, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2021.102492.



broader literature on educational management, emphasizing the leader's role in setting the tone and direction for Islamic institutional success.³⁹ The study's focus on strategic flagship programs, both academic and non-academic, demonstrates an understanding that quality assurance is not just about meeting set standards but also about holistic development, encompassing various aspects of student life and learning. This multifaceted approach reflects contemporary educational theories that advocate for a more rounded development of students, integrating academic excellence with other areas of personal and social growth.⁴⁰

The observed emphasis on improving academic performance through optimizing existing components and nurturing quality non-academic achievements aligns with the primary goal of enhancing educational quality. This is also consistent with the research by Syukron, Murtafiah, Dan Firdausi, etc,⁴¹ emphasizing the critical role of competent teachers, adequate supervision, and strategic management in achieving educational quality. It is essential to interpret cautiously, acknowledging the inherent subjectivity and dynamism associated with the concept of quality.⁴²

The research underscores the significance of facilities and infrastructure that exceed minimum standards, suggesting that the physical environment plays a crucial role in quality education.⁴³ This finding resonates with prior studies that have identified the learning environment as a critical factor in student engagement and success. Moreover, the competitiveness of MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat graduates in further education levels signals the institution's effectiveness in preparing students for higher academic challenges.⁴⁴ This aspect of the findings aligns with global educational trends, where the employability and adaptability of graduates are increasingly becoming markers of Islamic institutional quality.⁴⁵

The study's emphasis on the teaching and learning process as the highest level of importance in the quality assurance framework marks a significant observation. It suggests a paradigm shift from viewing quality assurance as a predominantly administrative task to recognizing the centrality of pedagogical processes.⁴⁶ This aligns with contemporary educational discourse that prioritizes student-centered teaching approaches and learning outcomes.⁴⁷ Furthermore, the initiative to improve academic

³⁹ J Jameson et al., "A Systematic Review and Framework for Digital Leadership Research Maturity in Higher Education," *Computers and Education Open* 3 (2022): 100115, doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.caeo.2022.100115>.

⁴⁰ Nidal Yousef Dwaikat, "A Comprehensive Model for Assessing the Quality in Higher Education Institutions," *The TQM Journal* 33, no. 4 (January 1, 2021): 841–55, doi:[10.1108/TQM-06-2020-0133](https://doi.org/10.1108/TQM-06-2020-0133).

⁴¹ Lutfi Firdausi et al., "Meningkatkan Mutu Lembaga Pendidikan Dengan Prinsip-Prinsip Crosby: Penerapan Untuk Keunggulan Pendidikan," *Attaqwa: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Islam* 19, no. 1 (March 2023): 74–85.

⁴² Anis Zohriah, Machdum Bachtiar, and Anas Nasrudin, "Strategi Peningkatan Mutu Lembaga Pendidikan Madrasah," *JURNAL KRIDATAMA SAINS DAN TEKNOLOGI* 5, no. 1 (June 2023): 209–23, doi:[10.53863/kst.v5i01.698](https://doi.org/10.53863/kst.v5i01.698).

⁴³ Razali Mat Zin et al., "Portraits of Academic Leadership in Brunei Tertiary Institutions: A Special Reference to Melayu Islam Beraja Philosophy," *International Journal of Advanced Research in Education and Society* 4, no. 2 (2022): 111–31, doi:[10.55057/ijares.2022.4.2.11](https://doi.org/10.55057/ijares.2022.4.2.11).

⁴⁴ Devi, "Analisis Mutu Dan Kualitas Input-Proses-Output Pendidikan Di MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat."

⁴⁵ Md. Monirul Islam et al., "Renewable and Non-Renewable Energy Consumption Driven Sustainable Development in ASEAN Countries: Do Financial Development and Institutional Quality Matter?," *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 29, no. 23 (2022): 34231–47, doi:[10.1007/s11356-021-18488-x](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-18488-x).

⁴⁶ Netti Syafitri et al., "Konsultasi Manajemen Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Lembaga Pendidikan Cendana Batam," *Jurnal Pengabdian Ibnu Sina* 2, no. 2 (July 2023): 90–98, doi:[10.36352/j-pis.v2i2.585](https://doi.org/10.36352/j-pis.v2i2.585).

⁴⁷ Bianca Ifeoma Chigbu, Viwe Ngwevu, and Avela Jojo, "The Effectiveness of Innovative Pedagogy in

achievements by optimizing existing components and striving to produce graduates with quality Islamic character and non-academic achievements reflects a holistic view of education. This approach is in line with the growing acknowledgment in educational circles of the importance of nurturing well-rounded individuals, capable not just academically but also in personal and social domains.⁴⁸

The implications of these findings are significant for the broader landscape of educational quality assurance. They suggest that a comprehensive approach that integrates strategic planning, stakeholder engagement, robust infrastructure, and a focus on academic and character development is vital to enhancing educational quality. This approach resonates with the evolving dynamics of education systems worldwide, where the emphasis is shifting towards producing well-rounded individuals equipped to meet the challenges of the modern world. These insights contribute to a deeper understanding of how educational institutions can strengthen their quality assurance processes, thus playing a pivotal role in shaping the future of education.

4. Conclusion

In this study, we conducted an in-depth analysis of output-based quality assurance in educational institutions, centering our attention on elements like strategic alignment, program implementation, infrastructure, academic achievements, and graduate competitiveness. Our primary aim was to evaluate the effectiveness of these quality assurance methods in enhancing the overall quality and competitive edge of educational institutions. The findings pointed to the crucial roles of effective communication, comprehensive strategic flagship programs covering academic and non-academic activities, and a robust teaching and learning process in achieving Islamic institutional goals. Islamic educational institutions exemplified success in these areas, marked by their academic and non-academic achievements, superior facilities, and the production of competitive graduates. These outcomes underscore the importance of a holistic approach to educational quality assurance, integrating strategic planning, stakeholder engagement, and a balance between academic excellence and character development. However, the study acknowledges limitations, including its focus on specific institutions and the potential variability of these findings across different educational contexts. Future research should, therefore, extend to a broader array of educational settings to explore the long-term impacts of these strategies on student outcomes and Islamic institutional reputation. Overall, this study contributes significantly to the understanding of enhancing academic quality, emphasizing the need for comprehensive, adaptable, and inclusive quality assurance strategies in the evolving educational landscape.

5. References

Afkar, Afkar, Uswatun Khasanah, Zulkifli Musthan, Imam Tabroni, Yonas Ferdinand Riwu, Paul Eduard Sudjiman, Lorina Siregar Sudjiman, et al. *Total Quality Management Dalam Penjaminan Mutu Pendidikan*. Sukoharjo: Tahta Media Group, 2023.

Arar, Khalid, Rania Sawalhi, Amaarah DeCuir, and Tasneem Amatullah. *Islamic-Based Educational Leadership, Administration and Management: Challenging Expectations Through Global Critical Insights*. New York: Taylor & Francis, 2023.

the Industry 4.0: Educational Ecosystem Perspective," *Social Sciences & Humanities Open* 7, no. 1 (2023): 100419, doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2023.100419>.

⁴⁸ Navneesh Tyagi, "Aligning Organizational Culture to Enhance Managerial Effectiveness of Academic Leaders: An Interface for Employee Engagement and Retention," *International Journal of Educational Management* 35, no. 7 (January 1, 2021): 1387–1404, doi:[10.1108/IJEM-10-2020-0447](https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEM-10-2020-0447).



Bokayev, Baurzhan, Zulfiya Torebekova, Zhuldyz Davletbayeva, and Fatima Zhakypova. "Distance Learning in Kazakhstan: Estimating Parents' Satisfaction of Educational Quality during the Coronavirus." *Technology, Pedagogy and Education* 30, no. 1 (January 2021): 27–39. doi:10.1080/1475939X.2020.1865192.

Chigbu, Bianca Ifeoma, Viwe Ngwevu, and Avela Jojo. "The Effectiveness of Innovative Pedagogy in the Industry 4.0: Educational Ecosystem Perspective." *Social Sciences & Humanities Open* 7, no. 1 (2023): 100419. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2023.100419>.

Correia, Ana-Paula, Chenxi Liu, and Fan Xu. "Evaluating Videoconferencing Systems for the Quality of the Educational Experience." *Distance Education* 41, no. 4 (October 2020): 429–52. doi:10.1080/01587919.2020.1821607.

Cummings, William K, and Olga Bain. "Modeling Strategies for Enhancing Educational Quality." *Research in Comparative and International Education* 12, no. 2 (2017). doi:doi.org/10.1177/1745499917711546.

Devi, Aulia Diana. "Analisis Mutu Dan Kualitas Input-Proses-Output Pendidikan Di MAN 1 Tulang Bawang Barat." *Al-Fahim: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 3, no. 1 (2021): 1–13. doi:doi.org/10.54396/alfahim.v3i1.115.

Dinter, Raymon van, Bedir Tekinerdogan, and Cagatay Catal. "Automation of Systematic Literature Reviews: A Systematic Literature Review." *Information and Software Technology* 136 (2021): 106589. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.infsof.2021.106589>.

Dwaikat, Nidal Yousef. "A Comprehensive Model for Assessing the Quality in Higher Education Institutions." *The TQM Journal* 33, no. 4 (January 1, 2021): 841–55. doi:10.1108/TQM-06-2020-0133.

Education, Reinventing Islamic, Development Technology, and Future Volume. "Strategies to Improve the Quality of Graduates of Private Islamic Secondary Education Institutions at Muhammadiyah" 1, no. 4 (2023): 113–34.

Efendi, Nur, and Muh. Ibnu Sholeh. "Manajemen Pendidikan Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pembelajaran." *Academicus: Journal of Teaching and Learning* 2, no. 1 (2023). doi:doi.org/10.59373/academicus.v2i2.25.

Firdausi, Lutfi, Akhyak Akhyak, Nur Efendi, and As'aril Muhajir. "Meningkatkan Mutu Lembaga Pendidikan Dengan Prinsip-Prinsip Crosby: Penerapan Untuk Keunggulan Pendidikan." *Attaqwa: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Islam* 19, no. 1 (March 2023): 74–85.

Fitrah, Muh. "Peran Kepala Sekolah Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan." *Jurnal Penjaminan Mutu* 3, no. 1 (2017): 31–42. doi:doi.org/10.25078/jpm.v3i1.90.

Hidayat, Rahmat. "Manajemen Peningkatan Mutu Lembaga Pendidikan Islam Di Kota Medan." *ISEMA: Islamic Educational Management* 1, no. 1 (2019). doi:doi.org/10.15575/isema.v1i1.4982.

Holiuk, Oksana, Ian Kurinnyi, Svetlana Kurinna, Nataliia Honchar, Viktoriia Rozghon, and Valentyna Dogadina. "Integrative Model for Enhancing Students' Competencies and the Quality of Educational Services." *International Journal of Innovative Technology and Engineering* 9, no. 1 (2019). doi:10.35940/ijitee.A4992.119119.

Huijser, Henk, Megan Yih Chyn A Kek, and Fernando F Padró. *Student Support Services*. Springer, 2022.

Islam, Md.Monirul, Md.Idris Ali, Brian Ceh, Sanjeet Singh, Muhammad Kamran Khan, and Vishal Dagar. "Renewable and Non-Renewable Energy Consumption Driven Sustainable Development in ASEAN Countries: Do Financial Development and Institutional Quality Matter?" *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 29, no. 23 (2022): 34231–47. doi:10.1007/s11356-021-18488-x.

Ismail, Yahya Zahid. "Evaluasi Dan Pengendalian Peningkatan Mutu Dan Daya Saing

Lembaga Pendidikan Islam." *AL-IFKAR: Jurnal Pengembangan Ilmu Keislaman* 19, no. 01 SE-Articles (March 2023): 4–29.

Istikomah, Istikomah, and Akbar Romadlon Dzulfikar. *Sistem Penjaminan Mutu Pesantren*. Kediri: CV Kreator Cerdas Indonesia, 2023.

Jameson, J, N Rumyantseva, M Cai, M Markowski, R Essex, and I McNay. "A Systematic Review and Framework for Digital Leadership Research Maturity in Higher Education." *Computers and Education Open* 3 (2022): 100115. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.caeo.2022.100115>.

Karisma, Linda Ayu, and Isna Faridatun Nadziroh. "Manajemen Mutu Perubahan Dalam Peningkatan Kualitas Lembaga Pendidikan Islam Di Madrasah Aliyah Negeri." *Dirasat: Jurnal Manajemen Dan Pendidikan Islam* 9, no. 1 (June 2023): 29–42. doi:[10.26594/dirasat.v9i1.3295](https://doi.org/10.26594/dirasat.v9i1.3295).

Melo Peralta, Tomas, and Torbjörn E. M. Nordling. "A Literature Review of Methods for Assessment of Reproducibility in Science." *Research Square Preprint*, 2022, 0–12. doi:[10.21203/rs.3.rs-2267847/v5](https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-2267847/v5).

Muhammad Syukron, Diana Riski Sapitri Siregar, and Sita Ratnaningsih. "Model Supervisi Dalam Penjaminan Mutu Lembaga Pendidikan." *Jurnal Kependidikan Islam* 13, no. 1 SE-Articles (February 2023): 44–54. doi:[10.15642/jkpi.2023.13.1.44-54](https://doi.org/10.15642/jkpi.2023.13.1.44-54).

Murtafiah, Nurul Hidayati. "Manajemen Tatalaksana Lembaga Pendidikan Islam Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pelayanan Pendidikan." *At-Tajdid: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pemikiran Islam* 7, no. 2 (2023): 425–36. doi:[dx.doi.org/10.24127/att.v7i2.2996](https://doi.org/10.24127/att.v7i2.2996).

Nebeska, Marina S., Yevheniia M. Provorova, Elvira M. Gerasymova, Zorina S. Vykhovanets, and Pylyp S. Yepyryntsev. "Enhancing the Educational Activities of Law Students as One of the Ways to Improve Efficiency and Quality of the Professional Training." *International Journal of Higher Education* 9, no. 4 (2020). doi:doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v9n4p291.

Netti Syafitri, Rini Elfina, Sumardin, and Mustaqim. "Konsultasi Manajemen Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Lembaga Pendidikan Cendana Batam." *Jurnal Pengabdian Ibnu Sina* 2, no. 2 (July 2023): 90–98. doi:[10.36352/j-pis.v2i2.585](https://doi.org/10.36352/j-pis.v2i2.585).

Omoeva, Carina, Nina Menezes Cunha, and Wael Moussa. "Measuring Equity of Education Resource Allocation: An Output-Based Approach." *International Journal of Educational Development* 87 (2021): 102492. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2021.102492>.

Puspitasari, Heppy. "Standar Proses Pembelajaran Sebagai Sistem Penjaminan Mutu Internal Di Sekolah." *Muslim Heritage* 2, no. 2 (2018): 339–68. doi:doi.org/10.21154/muslimheritage.v2i2.1115.

Rahayu, Sri, and Fuji Rahmati P. "PENINGKATAN MUTU LEMBAGA PENDIDIKAN ANAK USIA DINI MELALUI MANAJEMEN SUMBER DAYA MANUSIA." *Jurnal Review Pendidikan Dan Pengajaran (JRPP)* 6, no. 4 (October 2023): 726–32. doi:[10.31004/jrpp.v6i4.20299](https://doi.org/10.31004/jrpp.v6i4.20299).

Rahmatullah, Mamat. "Management Strategy for Improving the Quality of Madrasah in Banten Province: Qualitative Systematic Review." *Al Qalam* 38, no. 1 (2021): 25. doi:[10.32678/alqalam.v38i1.4290](https://doi.org/10.32678/alqalam.v38i1.4290).

Ramídio, Paulo J, Lígia M Costa Pinto, Nuno Gouveia, Hélder Costa, and Diogo Arezes. "Sustainability Strategy in Higher Education Institutions: Lessons Learned from a Nine-Year Case Study." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 222 (2019): 300–309. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.02.257>.

Saleh, Khairul. "Strategi Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Sekolah Dasar Islam Terpadu (SDIT) Di Provinsi Kalimantan Timur (Studi Kasus SDIT Cordova Samarinda Dan



SDIT YABIS Bontang)." *Fenomena: Jurnal Penelitian* 11, no. 2 (2019): 143–54. doi:doi.org/10.21093/fj.v11i1.1388.

Siahaan, Amiruddin, Rizki Akmalia, Lydia Amelia, Ahmad Ardhi Mauluddin Sitorus, Muhammad Syaukani Siraj, and Yusril Ardiansyah. "Mengelola Dan Meningkatkan Mutu Pembelajaran Pendidik Dan Tenaga Kependidikan Dalam Manajemen Lembaga Pendidikan Islam." *Journal on Education* 5, no. 3 (2023): 5815–25. doi:doi.org/10.31004/joe.v5i3.1344.

Syaefudin, Syaefudin. "Analisis Mutu Pendidikan Islam (Input, Proses & Output) (Studi Di MI Unggulan Ash-Shiddiqiyah-3 Purworejo)." *Aksiologi: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Ilmu Sosial* 1, no. 1 (2020): 24–32. doi:doi.org/10.47134/aksiologi.v1i1.1.

T., Plante David, Epstein Lawrence J., Fields Barry G., Shelgikar Anita V., and Rosen Ilene M. "Competency-Based Sleep Medicine Fellowships: Addressing Workforce Needs and Enhancing Educational Quality." *Journal of Clinical Sleep Medicine* 16, no. 1 (December 2023): 137–41. doi:10.5664/jcsm.8138.

Triana Rosalina Noor, and Izzatul Islamiya. "Analisis Faktor Manajemen Peningkatan Mutu Lembaga Pendidikan Islam." *EDUSIANA: Jurnal Manajemen Dan Pendidikan Islam* 10, no. 2 SE-Articles (September 2023): 124–38.

Tyagi, Navneesh. "Aligning Organizational Culture to Enhance Managerial Effectiveness of Academic Leaders: An Interface for Employee Engagement and Retention." *International Journal of Educational Management* 35, no. 7 (January 1, 2021): 1387–1404. doi:10.1108/IJEM-10-2020-0447.

Utu, Nur Maulida, and Beny Sintasari. "Kepemimpinan Kepala Madrasah Dalam Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Di Mts Miftahul Ulum Cermenan Jombang." *Irsyaduna: Jurnal Studi Kemahasiswaan* 1, no. 1 (2021): 25–42. doi:doi.org/10.54437/irsyaduna.v1i1.246.

Vossoughi, Shirin, Natalie R Davis, Ava Jackson, Ruben Echevarria, Arturo Muñoz, and Meg Escudé. "Beyond the Binary of Adult Versus Child Centered Learning: Pedagogies of Joint Activity in the Context of Making." *Cognition and Instruction* 39, no. 3 (July 3, 2021): 211–41. doi:10.1080/07370008.2020.1860052.

Wafi, Abdul, and Umarul Faruk. "Pesantren Earlier Dalam Implementasi Kurikulum Merdeka: Studi Kasus Di Pondok Pesantren Mambaul Ulum Bata Bata." *Heutagogia: Journal of Islamic Education* 3, no. 1 (2023). doi:doi.org/10.14421/hjie.2023.31-04.

Zahroh, Aminatul, and Binti Maunah. "Total Quality Management (TQM): Sebuah Langkah Dalam Mengedepankan Kualitas Output Melalui Sistem Kontrol Mutu (Quality Control) Sekolah." *Realita: Jurnal Penelitian Dan Kebudayaan Islam* 13, no. 2 (2015): 224–34. doi:doi.org/10.30762/realita.v13i2.65.

Zin, Razali Mat, Nur Anissa Sarbini, Norashikin Yusof, and Qaisar Ali. "Portraits of Academic Leadership in Brunei Tertiary Institutions: A Special Reference to Melayu Islam Beraja Philosophy." *International Journal of Advanced Research in Education and Society* 4, no. 2 (2022): 111–31. doi:10.55057/ijares.2022.4.2.11.

Zohriah, Anis, Machdum Bachtiar, and Anas Nasrudin. "Strategi Peningkatan Mutu Lembaga Pendidikan Madrasah." *JURNAL KRIDATAMA SAINS DAN TEKNOLOGI* 5, no. 1 (June 2023): 209–23. doi:10.53863/kst.v5i01.698.

Zulkarnain, Lutfhi. "Analisis Mutu (Input Proses Output) Pendidikan Di Lembaga Pendidikan MTs Assalam Kota Mataram Nusa Tenggara Barat." *MANAZHIM* 3, no. 1 (2021): 17–31. doi:doi.org/10.36088/manazhim.v3i1.946.