Demystifying Religious Tolerance Practices at an Indonesian Early Childhood Education Context: Responding to Diversity

Lilif Muallifatul Khorida Filasofa[1✉], Agus Prayogo[2], Felakhah Khasanah[3]
[1]Department of Islamic Early Childhood Education, Universitas Islam Negeri Walisongo, Semarang, Indonesia
[2]Department of English Language Education, Universitas Islam Negeri Walisongo, Semarang, Indonesia
[3]Department of Elementary Education, Universitas Terbuka, Jakarta, Indonesia

Abstract

Purpose – Teaching religious tolerance should be conducted from early childhood, but studies and references on religious tolerance among young children are limited. This study explores how to implement religious tolerance in schools and how early Muslim children instill religious values in response to diversity.

Design/methods/approach – This study was an exploratory case study deploying an ethnographic classroom approach conducted in a playgroup and kindergarten in Semarang city, Central Java, Indonesia. The participants consisted of the school principal, teachers, Play Group students, and Kindergarten children, while the empirical data of this research were gathered through observation and interview.

Findings – The findings showed that religious tolerance at the early childhood education level was enacted by celebrating religious events and conducting school activities containing togetherness. Additionally, religious teachings that supported religious tolerance were inculcated during religious lessons and worship.

Research implications/limitations – All study respondents were from Semarang City, Indonesia, which might limit the generalizability of the findings.

Practical implications – This case study demonstrated how religious tolerance and religious values inculcation prepare children to encounter and respond to diversity in a real-life setting.

Originality/value – This paper contributes to understanding the implementation of religious tolerance in schools and recommends teachers design lesson plans that include inculcating the values of religious tolerance.

Keywords Diversity, Religious tolerance, Religious teaching, Togetherness

Paper type Case study

Lilif Muallifatul Khorida Filasofa, Agus Prayogo, Felakhah Khasanah

1. Introduction

Early childhood education is established to be the starting point for children's lifelong learning and development. The learning aspects cover aspects of life, such as language, physical, cognitive, personal, social, emotional, and spiritual development. The children's experience and spirituality practice are based on their environment and religious teaching. In the Indonesian context, which has many ethnicities, cultures, races, and religions, instilling a tolerant attitude such as respecting differences and other traditions will help children adapt to new environments. The ability enables children to understand how to face differences, in which they will not discriminate in associating and interacting with other people either in the environment where they live or in their future world of work.

Responding to differences also needs to be done toward religion and religious teachings. Children with strong tolerance will not be easily influenced by inappropriate teachings such as radical or misguided teachings, e.g., being easy to blame others or spread hate speeches. Different religious backgrounds challenge children as they have to deepen their gious teaching, while at the same time, they have to show their ability to respect other religions. This practice becomes part of children's social and spiritual development to help them live in a diverse society. Spirituality has been commonly defined as an idea associated with religious belief, although some scholars may propose it more inclusively apart from religion (Crompton, 1999; Bone, 2008). This study emphasizes spirituality in the context of religion, so the spiritual and religious terms may be used interchangeably (Bone, 2008). Understanding the existence of religious differences cannot be separated from religious affiliation. The affiliation becomes a crucial part of young children constructing their identity under religious communities, beliefs, and activities, although the affiliation itself does not agree with the teaching (Peyton & Jalongo, 2008; Wiley, 1997). Consequently, different religions or faiths must be responded to by understanding and implying religious tolerance.

To begin with, tolerance has been defined in various literature as approval with no coercion toward a set of beliefs that are considered unacceptable (Potgieter, Van Der Walt, Wolhuter, & Potgieter, 2014; Tobing, 2013) or being patient with any differences encountered (Raihani, 2014). In Addition to these definitions, the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), under its declaration of principles on tolerance, states that 'tolerance is respect, acceptance and appreciation of the rich diversity of our world's cultures, our forms of expression and ways of being human. It is fostered by knowledge, openness, communication, and freedom of thought, conscience, and belief. Tolerance is harmony in difference' (1995) with these definitions, Alabdulhadi (2019) pinpoints reasons why tolerance is needed, such as the abolition or reduction in the number of hate crimes and the need for treating other people with respect and dignity in daily social interactions. Moreover, situated in this study's context, tolerance is urgently required in a religious society setting, such as Indonesia, which consists of different religions.

Based on the fact mentioned above, one of the goals of education is supposed to be a foundation for disseminating religious tolerance for children and academic society. Classrooms and playgrounds, which become educational context, become a place for establishing the values and character for students because, during the interaction among students, religious intolerance may happen and be manifested in the form of insults, anger, even putting down or dismissing others' opinions during the discussion in the class (Potgieter et al., 2014; Schweitzer, 2007). For this reason, infusing and establishing good habits and character could be done in a classroom through activities, moreover in the classroom consisting of diverse students. The example is engaging a class interaction and activity without considering other students' religious backgrounds. In a school with different or mixed religious members, the interaction can positively impact long-term benefits in promoting improved relationships among the religious school members (Hayes, McAllister, & Dowds, 2013). These notions have shown brief descriptions of how a classroom is depicted as a small society with diversity and problems.

Previous studies have reported how religious tolerance has been practiced in different education contexts such as secondary school and higher education (e.g., Alabdulhadi, 2019;

Potgieter, Van Der Walt, Wolhuter, & Potgieter, 2014; Raihani, 2014; Schweitzer, 2007; Wijaya Mulya & Aditomo, 2019). Among these studies, Raihani (2014) highlights family and community's role in helping students nurture religious tolerance as they may become the cultural capital of religious tolerance. This study also emphasizes teachers' parts in establishing a student's understanding of religious diversity. On the other hand, Mulya and Aditomo (2019), propose discourse analysis to promote tolerance under a religious education setting. The study implies that the individual-specific and society-specific segments may make discourse analysis more effective for religious tolerance promotion. Considering a textbook as guidance of religious tolerance practice, a study by Alabdulhadi (2019) reports that the extent of religious tolerance is reflected and presented on the Kuwait Islamic secondary textbook based on content analysis. Although the study finds more tolerance content in the textbook, he points out that investigating classroom practice is a crucial curriculum application that is highly necessary. Unfortunately, these studies report religious tolerance in different educational contexts because few studies specifically look at religious tolerance in early childhood education settings.

Many studies at early childhood education context tend to focus on children spirituality, such as distinctive features which possibly reflect young children spirituality (Adams, Bull, & Maynes, 2016), exploration of nurturing children spiritual development practice (Bone & Fenton, 2015), even internalization of religious attitudes among young children (Ismail & Fahmi, 2017). Studies on Religious tolerance among young children are scarce; moreover, those investigating its practice and method remain under-researched. Introducing and teaching religious tolerance should be conducted from an early age because early childhood education is considered the foundation of children's development. Additionally, the early school years become the time for children to grow their ability to understand any parts of life (Crawford, 2005). To fill these gaps, this study, with an exploratory case study deploying an ethnographic classroom approach, aims at showcasing how religious tolerance is practiced and implemented at school and the extent to which young Muslim children are inculcated with religious values in response to religious tolerance.

2. Methods

2.1. Setting and design

This study was an exploratory case study conducted in a playgroup and kindergarten under one school foundation, not affiliated with any religious organizations in Semarang city, Indonesia. A case study seeks to answer how and why questions toward a contemporary phenomenon in different social or real-life contexts (Yin, 2003). The case refers to an event, incident, moment, and phenomenon, while the case study can involve everyday or routine settings and experiences. The researchers gained information about the school from the Local Department of National Education of Central Java Province, in which the school had been researched by different researchers for the religious difference of its students, but they are taught unity. Purposive sampling was used to select the school following these two considerations: (1) the school was a model school with religious plurality as the students had different religious backgrounds, and (2) it had a program that established religious tolerance for the students. Then, the researchers visited the school and met the school principal to negotiate access for ethnographic fieldwork.

This study was ethnographic as it tried to investigate natural school setting phenomena of students' lives. The adoption of the ethnographic approach was due to researchers' self-immersion within the school community to closely perceive the school and classroom events that happened (Feldman, 2011; Widodo, 2016). In this regard, the researchers played roles as both an insider (co-teachers and students advisors) as the first author had interaction for a specific duration and an outsider (non-participants observers). Playing these roles (insider and outsider) allowed researchers to build personal and professional trust in daily interaction (Wang, 2013) indicated with a close, open, flexible relationship with participants so richer data may be gained (Labaree, 2002).

2.2. Participants and informed consent

Before empirical fieldwork began, researchers held a meeting with the school principal, teachers, and students to discuss the research objectives, determine the class level that would participate, and explain informed consent. Regarding the research ethic, the informed consent, written in Bahasa Indonesia, detailed that the data obtained from this research would only be used for academic purposes. Every data would be kept confidential and used for academic publication purposes. Then, the informed consent sheets were distributed to read carefully before signing for an agreement to be participants. Students had to ask their parents' permission to sign informed consent since they were too young to make their own decision. Finally, the school principal and teachers signed the consent form and agreed to participate in this study. All students also returned the signed consent form as evidence that their parents permitted their children to participate in this research.

The demographic characteristic of participants consisted of the school principal, two female teachers (playgroup and kindergarten), sixteen Play Group students (seven female and nine male), and sixteen Kindergarten children (six male and ten female). The participants had four different religious backgrounds, i.i.e. Islam (16 children), Christian (9 children), Catholic (4 children), and Hinduism (3 children). The participants indicated that they participated in this study voluntarily, in which all participants understood that they had the right to withdraw their participation during the study.

2.3. Data and data analysis

Empirical data of this research were gathered through observation and interview. The observation was video recorded, while the interview was audio recorded, so the data were digitally stored and saved. Both techniques had secured access and permission from the school authority and all participants. The observation was used to look at religious tolerance practice at school. The interview was then used to verbally justify the data gained from observation and any unclear data that needed to be confirmed. The interview guidelines consisted of questions related to the objectives of the religious tolerance program created by the school, how the program was implemented, the challenges faced by teachers, and the ways the school inculcated religious values to students, which are conducted exploratively aimed to explore and gather richer (Van Manen, 1997). The interview sessions were conducted several times until all data required were gained, combining the face-to-face audio-recorded interview with asynchronously written interview confirming participants' unknown or unclear explanations.

The empirical data collected were analyzed qualitatively. The data analysis involved interpretative endeavors toward the data gained from observation and interview. The observation data and the digital data were reviewed and transcribed so that the tabulation could be conducted to identify and examine participants' interactions and actions within the school program. The data were coded and categorized to capture relevant findings with the research questions. The provisional codes and categories were developed based on the topics of research questions. The data were then reduced to focus and sharpen the analysis and gained themes or topics by sorting the relevant data and discarding irrelevant ones. Finally, member checking was conducted in which participants' responses were confirmed with other participants' answers and what happened in the observation. The participants, school principals, and teachers were also invited to read and check the transcript to make the data accurate. They could also make changes or give additional insights dealing with the data they read to guarantee data trustworthiness (Sulistiyo, Haryanto, Widodo, & Elyas, 2020).

3. Result

3.1. The religious tolerance practice implemented at school

The participants had four different religious backgrounds, which are Islam, Christian, Catholic, and Hinduism. With these differences, establishing children's understanding of religious beliefs became challenges for both teachers and parents. Children, who were growing human beings and social creatures, needed to interact with others, where the interaction made dealt with social

relationships and religious aspects. This is because the society in this study's context, Indonesia, was communal and considered religions a highly inseparable aspect in people's lives. Therefore, it was common for early childhood to make religious worship as part of their early life. To this end, the school with students' different religious backgrounds had set programs that cultivated understanding, respect, and tolerance among students. The school strived to facilitate religious events in commemoration and celebration aiming at accomodating each religion believed by students, ignoring whether the religion was a minority or majority, it treated them equally without any discrimination. Activities that reflected religious tolerance practice at the school were celebrating religious events and conducting school activities containing togetherness, one of which is group work consisting of children with different religious backgrounds. The goals of these activities were to build an understanding that students lived together with people from different religious backgrounds, worship their God according to their faith and belief, and inculcate values of the religions they embraced.

As previously stated, celebrating religious events was part of the religious tolerance practice implemented at the school. The celebrations were conducted as exceptional moments under commemoration, and they were usually outside of regular classroom periods to build tolerant engaged students. In attending the events, the teacher gave instructional procedures guiding students during the celebration, such as what they should do and what they should not do. These procedures aimed to ensure that while meeting the events, the students could join the celebration, understand and absorb the vato instilled the primary goal, namely religious tolerance. Firstly, the teachers explained the event celebrated in simple ways because the students were very young—the explanation employed illustration of students' religious festivals and what would be done during the celebration. Secondly, teachers guided students with simple questions guiding students to understand what they see and listen to during the celebration. At the end of the celebration, teachers finally summarized what they had celebrated by underlining and stressing the values and lessons behind moments. The celebrations aimed to explore different religious festivals, familiarize young students with different religious practices, and raise students' awareness of how people with different religious backgrounds practiced religious events, which finally inculcated religious tolerance. Table 1 below showed how activities were carried out during the celebration and the supposed objectives.

Table 1. Instructional design of religious event celebration

Celebration	Instructional procedures	Objectives
Celebrating religious events	a. Teachers explained the events celebrated the explanation employed illustration of students' religious festivals. The use of media was highly recommended. b. Teachers gave guiding questions regarding what students see and listen to, accompanying them during the celebration. c. Teachers concluded at the end of the events by summarizing the values and lessons behind religious practices.	a. I am exploring different religious festivals. b. We are familiarizing young students with different religious practices. c. Raising students' awareness of how religious events were practiced. d. We are infusing religious tolerance among students.

The celebration of religious festivals was conducted based on the students' religious background, e.g., Muslim students celebrated Halal bi halal (Eid al-Fitr gathering); Christian and Catholic students celebrated Christmas; Hindu students celebrated the Day of Silence. At the Halal bi halal event, the celebration was conducted by listening to a religious sermon from a preacher

inviting all students to contemplate and take lessons from the essence of Halalbi halal, enjoying students' performance, having meals together, and shaking hands among audiences as a symbol of releasing and relieving each other. As stated by the speaker or preacher in each celebration, lessons could be pointed out in these religious festivals. The core of Halal bi halal is forgiveness and brotherhood, so students are taught to forgive each other, to strengthen brotherhood; this is represented at the main activity where each audience shakes hands and forgives each other because students with different religious backgrounds also attend this event. Christian or Catholic students present at the Christmas celebration, sing religious anthems and reflect God's suffering, teaching solidarity and brotherhood to those in need, poor, and suffering. These activities aim at instilling and introducing love to fellow humans from an early age. Finally, the Day of Silence celebration was a unique festival celebrated by Hindu students. It was a festival that was not celebrated with great festivity as another celebration. The times of silence were conducted at school and attended by all students. Lights were turned off, and they have to stay in the room. All students attending the event were previously explained about its essence, values, and why it was celebrated. This celebration teaches students about introspection, simplicity, modesty, empathy, and caring for others, and it was finally ended by wishing Silence day to Hindu' Hindus.

In Addition to the religious celebrations, there were several school activities containing togetherness values at school, such as cooperative and collaborative learning, working together, doing charity, in which all of these activities promote group work and togetherness among students. These activities were enacted within and outside the regular class periods. The activities focused on supporting students to work and collaborate with others in the teaching-learning process, but the joyfulness aspects were not left. Games, songs, and learning activities encouraged students to cooperate in a group, either small or big groups. In this respect, students were supposed to respect and appreciate the moment of togetherness with other students. In the context of out-of-class activities, students were invited to work together cleaning the environment. The activity aimed to raise students' awareness of their surroundings.

Additionally, this activity taught students to care about health, cleanliness, and cooperation where they had to work with others ignoring others' background of social status, race, and even religions so that finally this might lead to collective human beings. Working cooperatively with others will lessen the work's burden because the strength was located at the sensing togetherness. Giving charity was conducted in different ways, such as donations to the poor, sick people, people affected by disasters, or those who need help. Doing charity became the activity that taught students to sacrifice and to sensitive to their situations, grotto empathy, and sympathy. Sacrifice was about giving what was owned and loved by someone to others; activity was about understanding and feeling others' misery and difficulties instead of insulting them. The two values, sacrifice and being sensitive, were the foundation for togetherness and tolerance. When the two values were rooted in someone's heart, they will drive and force someone to help and do good conduct establishing these values establishing done in studies since very young a age. These activities followed the school guidelines under six developmental aspects, i.e., Students' development of moral and religious values; physical and motoric development; cognitive development; social and emotional development; language development; and art development.

3.2. Religious values inculcated by young Muslim children in response to religious tolerance

The cultivation of religious values and teaching for early childhood should be at a basic level. At least children know the religion they profess and also the God they worship. These values become a foundation and shield for young children, especially when religious tolerance becomes the primary goal of the educational setting. In a school environment that consists of various religions, instilling religious teachings is a challenge. According to their religious belief, religious teachings are planted during religious lessons and student worship implementation. For Muslim children in early childhood education, teaching the fundamental values of Islam is conducted by introducing the pillars of faith and the pillars of Islam, which is usually accompanied by the Addition of daily prayer materials. Learning the pillars of faith and Islam's pillars is carried out through various media such as songs and pictures. Songs and pictures often help students to learn. The song lyrics

will be more embedded by memorizing the taught songs even though they do not fully understand the pillars of faith and Islam.

Apart from classroom activities, strengthening religious values is also carried out in celebrating religious holidays, as previously mentioned. In Addition to strengthening religious values in students, this commemoration also instills togetherness. Togetherness in Islam is recommended; for example, Islam teaches its followers to pray together in the congregation. In Addition, the Quran also teaches Muslims to help each other in goodness. This concept is in line with the characteristics that every student must have. There will always be an inculcation of religious and moral values in religious commemoration, especially faith values. The value of faith is essential to be instilled in students to control the religion they profess. Respecting and interacting with adherents of other religions must be instilled; however, strengthening students in believing the teachings of the religion they adhere to is unnegotiable. In external settings, confirming or truth claims against someone's teaching may become not be justified. However, in the internal context, truth claims must be presented in every religious adherent. Here, the teacher must understand this concept so that in its implementation, when students have different religious backgrounds from their teachers, there will be no coercion and psychological intimidation of their students. The teacher must explain that every religious commemoration holds many wisdom and lessons for people with common sense. There are educational values that could be contemplated and applied to strengthen someone's faith.

As one of the services routinely carried out by Muslims, the five daily prayers are prioritized in learning. Attention to prayer education takes precedence over reading and writing skills. Should parents worry that their children cannot read and write before entering elementary school, they should be more worried when they have not prayed even though they are relatively older. Children in early childhood do not have an obligation to pray, but prayer education is the parents' responsibility at home and teachers when children are at school. Habits carried out at school and reinforcement at home will make the child responsible for establishing their prayers. Teaching prayers' procedures for early childhood must be gradually and repeatedly conducted. At school, children in early childhood are taught to pray through several stages. Children aged 3-4 years are introduced to the movements in prayer first. Even though the child has not been able to imitate the prayer movements perfectly, the important thing that must be emphasized is that the child is willing to do it. Even though the children do their movements playfully, the teacher should just let what they do and do not yell at them because the learning goal is that the child is willing to follow the prayer movements. When children are aged 4-5 years, teachers should teach them the prayer movements and introduce them to readings contained in prayer. These children are invited to perform prayer movements while reciting the prayer readings aloud. Teaching prayer readings can be done by the teacher or parent when the child is happy because young children sometimes are moody, so teachers and parents must understand their character. At the 5-6 years old level, the teacher or parent can explain the importance of prayer and the consequences of leaving prayer in an easily understood language by the child. Prayer is one of the worship activities, which is the starting point that can explain to students the values and teachings of other religions, including religious tolerance.

4. Discussion

Religious tolerance is represented in celebrating the school's religious events, where all students attend and participate in the commemoration. The exciting parts of what schools spread among children are that the school has taught and introduced children to different religious festivals, but they are given the freedom to attend the festival or leave it. That means that the school does not force students to attend certain religious celebrations. Before the celebration, the teacher instructs students to attend the event and respect other religions. The teacher emphasizes that students should hold their own religious beliefs and respect other religious practices such as the celebrations they attend since such action may be crucial for cultural peace and religious harmony. Attending and understanding other religious events may instill and develop students' understanding of other religious practices. It is crucial to be established early since violence and

dispute often happen due to a lack of understanding. The teachers have taught students the religious value they believe in, such as respecting and tolerance to others and differences, but at the same time, they are given freedom. The school communicates with students' parents regarding the festivals nationally, but the school does not encounter any barriers since the parents have known the school as a model school with a religious plurality. These attempts may prevent parents from withdrawing their children from school due to misunderstanding different religious activities. Such practices become essential for the dimension of children's spiritual growth as Stark and Glock (1968) posit that teachers should pay attention to several dimensions in ascertaining children's self-awareness such as belief, practice, experience, knowledge, and consequences. The aspect of belief contains expectations of religious adherents to the ideology or religious teaching followed, where the scope of coverage of belief is extended between religions and within the same religions (Robertson, 1972). Through the religious festivals conducted in joyful ways, students could participate in school life enjoyment as they could propose the festival's themes conducted with their teachers. What has been implemented by the school in the form of religious celebrations is evidence that the school as an educational institution advocates future development that aims to make humans lives better in the future.

The values of togetherness become the basis for living in different backgrounds and settings. Teaching such a concept to very young age students needs to be implemented through different activities. The school has managed different programs such as cooperative and collaborative learning, working together, and doing charity, which indicates that the school has instilled the concept of togetherness as they aim to guide students to be collective human beings, strengthen togetherness, work and help each other, learn cooperatively, and build social interaction and communication skill (Fadlillah & Filasofa, 2013). The learning process, which employs games and festive activities, as stated in cooperative learning, for example, implies that the school considers the psychological stages of young children who require spaces to learn and play so that the educational goals could be attained, in this case, is togetherness for religious tolerance. Mata-McMahon (2019) reports how play could be an alternative way to nurture spirituality in early childhood education when the educational settings are designed for nurturing students with opportunities of child-centered, child-directed play so they could experience spiritual moments, which are defined as feeling wonder, admiration, pleasure, and inner peace. Doing charity and donation has been confirmed by Gilliard (2004), who reveals how donation became one of the strategies to foster students' tolerance. In implanting togetherness values, some essential aspects will be achieved by students, namely the emergence of self-awareness in terms of helping each other. Building social skills by helping each other is a moral value that every human being must have. The essence of the best human being is the one who can provide benefits to others. For sure, instilling these togetherness values must be done as early as possible.

Critics may be raised to education with nurture tolerance in a school with different religious backgrounds; this condition is considered risky since it may affect students' religion and spirituality. This idea is supported by the fact that children's religiosity is unreflective, not deep, and they understand the teaching with critics-free and egocentric or less of meaning in what they express (Mansur, 2005). In this sense, the teaching-learning process, which deals with students' religious teaching, plays a crucial role in establishing religiosity and should be strengthened and inculcated. In the Islamic teaching context, mutual respect in faith and belief is a very comprehensive Islamic concept. The consequence of this principle is the birth of a piety spirit in religion. It is because submission to God creates a universal sense of brotherhood among humanity. Universal brotherhood is a form of tolerance taught by Islam, as it causes protection of others' rights and acceptance of differences in society. Universal brotherhood also involves the concepts of justice, peace, and cooperation mutually beneficial and negate all evil.

The concept of tolerance offered by Islam is very rational, practical, and straightforward. However, concerning belief, aqidah, and worship, Muslims do not recognize the word compromise. This means that the belief of Muslims in God is not the same as the belief of other religions' followers in their God; neither are the rituals of worship. Therefore, the word 'tolerance' in Islam is not new but has been applied in life since the birth of Islam (Fadlillah & Filasofa, 2013).

The success in instilling the value of tolerance would bring out maturity in religion. This maturity can be assessed on the ability to understand and practice the teachings of their religion, especially the ability to respect and be tolerant of people with different religions (Rumapea, 2016). With religious maturity, it is hoped that religious harmony will be created. Maturity attitudes can be formed by understanding religious teachings, understanding and accepting the existing differences, and being in unity with others for the sake of creating harmony. Spiritual and religious awareness by upholding one's religion and not imposing their religion on others is one of the values of Islamic teachings. These are the values that must be taught from early age children to be prepared to face any diversity in a real-life context.

5. Conclusion

The present study aims at uncovering how religious tolerance is practiced and implemented at school and the extent to which young Muslim children inculcate religious values in response to religious tolerance. The study's findings imply that the teaching-learning process that deals with students' religious teaching play crucial roles where the establishment of religiosity should be strengthened and inculcated. This is because nurturing tolerance in a school with different religious backgrounds would face challenges and barriers. To conclude, the practice of religious tolerance at the early childhood education level is enacted by celebrating religious events and conducting school activities containing togetherness. Additionally, religious teachings that support religious tolerance are inculcated during religious lessons and student worship implementation according to their religious belief. The practices of religious tolerance and religious values inculcation prepare students to encounter and respond to diversity in a real-life setting. The present study's findings indicate how the teacher should design instructional procedures accompanying religious practice and teaching.

Declarations

Author contribution statement

Lilif Muallifatul Khorida Filasofa conceived of the presented idea. Agus Prayogo and Felakhah Khasanah developed the theory of religious tolerance in early childhood education. All authors discussed the results and contributed to the final manuscript.

Funding statement

Data availability statement

The datasets generated during and/or analyzed during the current study are available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

Declaration of interests statement

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have influenced the work reported in this paper.

Additional information

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to liliffilasofa@walisongo.ac.id.

Lilif Muallifatul Khorida Filasofa, Agus Prayogo, Felakhah Khasanah
DOI: http://dx.doi.org./10.14421/al-athfal.2021.71-02

ORCID

Lilif Muallifatul Khorida Filasofa ⓘ https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2903-029X
Agus Prayogo ⓘ https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1216-2520
Felakhah Khasanah ⓘ https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5765-473X

References

Adams, K., Bull, R., & Maynes, M. L. (2016). Early childhood spirituality in education: Towards an understanding of the distinctive features of young children's spirituality. *European Early Childhood Education Research Journal*, *24*(5), 760–774. https://doi.org/10.1080/1350293X.2014.996425

Alabdulhadi, M. M. J. (2019). Religious tolerance in secondary Islamic Education textbooks in Kuwait. *British Journal of Religious Education*, *41*(4), 422–434. https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2019.1585329

Bone, J. (2008). Creating relational spaces: everyday spirituality in early childhood settings. *European Early Childhood Education Research Journal*, *16*(3), 343–356. https://doi.org/10.1080/13502930802292122

Bone, J., & Fenton, A. (2015). Spirituality and child protection in early childhood education: A strengths approach. *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, *20*(2), 86–99. https://doi.org/10.1080/1364436X.2015.1030594

Crawford, P. A. (2005). Primarily peaceful: Nurturing peace in the primary grades. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, *32*, 321–328. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10643-004-1083-7

Crompton, M. (1999). Children, spirituality, and religion. In P. Milner & B. Carolin (Ed.), *Time to listen to children: Personal and professional communication.* Routledge.

Fadlillah, M., & Filasofa, L. M. K. (2013). *Pendidikan Karakter Anak*. Ar-Ruzz Media.

Feldman, G. (2011). If ethnography is more than participant-observation, relations are more than connections: The case for nonlocal ethnography in a world of apparatuses. *Anthropological Theory*, *11*(4), 375–395. https://doi.org/10.1177/1463499611429904

Gilliard, J. L. (2004). Reflections on a post September 11 student-led project: Teaching strategies that foster tolerance and emotional coping?. *Journal of Early Childhood Teacher Education*, *25*(1), 79–84. https://doi.org/10.1080/1090102040250112

Hayes, B. C., McAllister, I., & Dowds, L. (2013). Integrated schooling and religious tolerance in Northern Ireland. *Journal of Contemporary Religion*, *28*(1), 67–78. https://doi.org/10.1080/13537903.2013.750837

Ismail, I., & Fahmi, F. (2017). Internalisasi Sikap Keberagamaan Sejak Anak Usia Dini. *Raudhatul Athfal: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Anak Usia Dini*, *1*(1), 1–20. https://doi.org/10.19109/ra.v1i1.1473

Labaree, R. V. (2002). The risk of "going observationalist": negotiating the hidden dilemmas of being an insider participant observer. *Qualitative Research*, *2*(1), 97–122. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794102002001641

Mansur. (2005). *Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini dalam Islam*. Pustaka Pelajar.

Mata-McMahon, J. (2019). Finding connections between spirituality and play for early childhood education. *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, *24*(1), 44–57. https://doi.org/10.1080/1364436X.2019.1619528

Peyton, M. R., & Jalongo, M. R. (2008). Make me an instrument of your peace: Honoring religious diversity and modeling respect for faiths through children's literature. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, *35*, 301–303. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10643-007-0231-2

Potgieter, F. J., Van Der Walt, J. L., Wolhuter, C. C., & Potgieter, F. (2014). Towards understanding (religious) (in)tolerance in education. *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies*, *70*(3), 1–8. https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v70i3.1977

Raihani. (2014). Creating a Culture of Religious Tolerance in an Indonesian School. *South East Asia Research*, *22*(4), 541–560. https://doi.org/10.5367/sear.2014.0234

Robertson, R. (1972). *The Sociological Interpretation of Religion*. Basil Blackwell.

Rumapea, M. E. (2016). Kedewasaan Beragama Salah Satu Wujud Kerukunan Beragama. *Jurnal Pendidikan Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, *8*(1), 16–26. https://doi.org/10.24114/JUPIIS.V8I1.3679

Schweitzer, F. (2007). Religious individualization: New challenges to education for tolerance. *British Journal of Religious Education*, *29*(1), 89–100. https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200601037551

Stark, R., & Glock, C. Y. (1968). *American Piety: The Nature of Religion (Pattern of Religious Commitment)*. University of California Press.

Sulistiyo, U., Haryanto, E., Widodo, H. P., & Elyas, T. (2020). The portrait of primary school English in Indonesia: policy recommendations. *Education 3-13*, *48*(8), 945–959. https://doi.org/10.1080/03004279.2019.1680721

Tobing, E. (2013). Promoting religious tolerance: What does religious tolerance mean? Retrieved from The Prospect website: http://www.theindonesianinstitute.org/pers020706.htm.

UNESCO. (1995). Declaration of Principles on Tolerance. Retrieved November 10, 2020, from https://www.refworld.org/docid/453395954.html

Van Manen, M. (1997). *Researching Lived Experiences*. The Althouse Press.

Wang, X. (2013). The construction of researcher–researched relationships in school ethnography: Doing research, participating in the field and reflecting on ethical dilemmas. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, *26*(7), 763–779. https://doi.org/10.1080/09518398.2012.666287

Widodo, H. P. (2016). Engaging Students in Literature Circles: Vocational English Reading Programs. *Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, *25*(2), 347–359. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40299-015-0269-7

Wijaya Mulya, T., & Aditomo, A. (2019). Researching religious tolerance education using discourse analysis: a case study from Indonesia. *British Journal of Religious Education*, *41*(4), 446–457. https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2018.1556602

Wiley, A. (1997, April 1). Religious affiliation as a source of variation in childrearing values and parental regulation of young children. *Mind, Culture, and Activity*, *4*, 86–107. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15327884mca0402_3

Yin, R. K. (2003). *Case study research: Design and methods* (3rd Ed.). SAGE Publications Inc.