

## **Between Prohibition and Permissibility of Islamic Art: an Application of Ma'na-Cum-Maghza Approach on Hadiths of Music, Painting and Dance**

*Antara Larangan dan Anjuran Seni Islam: Aplikasi Pendekatan Ma'na Cum-Maghza terhadap Hadis-Hadis Music, Lukis dan Tari*

Nur Laili Nabilah Nazahah Najiyah \*<sup>(a)</sup> Dadi Nurhaedi <sup>(a)</sup>

\* Corresponding Author, email: 27najiyahnln3@gmail.com

<sup>a</sup> Department of Hadith Studies, UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Laksda Adisucipto Street, Sleman 55281, Indonesia.

### **Abstract**

The problem of music, painting (drawing), and dance in Islam still has differences of opinion regarding the banning of the three. This variety of opinions arises based on verses from the Qur'an and hadith to strengthen their respective arguments. This study reveals how the hadiths about art could be understood and contextualized using the Ma'na-Cum-Maghza Sahiron approach, as well as their relevance in the study of hadith. This qualitative study uses sociological and historical approaches, and the data obtained are analyzed using explanatory analysis techniques. There are two findings in this study: first, in the hadiths of music, painting (drawing) and dance, there is no message that implies a prohibition on these three arts. The hadiths appeared and only took effect at that time or according to the context of certain events behind the emergence of these hadiths. Second, in the current context, the meaning and application of these hadiths must be relevant to the times by paying attention to human interests and needs. If these arts turn out to have a positive impact on human life, then it is possible that these arts can be applied. In the context of hadith studies, the combination of studies of discussions related to art and the application of Ma'na-Cum-Maghza approach is useful for understanding all three in one study so that the understanding of them becomes more integral-comprehensive.

**Keywords: Hadith, Music, Painting, Dance, Ma'na-Cum-Maghza Approach, Islamic Art.**

### **Abstrak**

Permasalahan seni musik, lukis, dan tari dalam Islam masih mengalami perbedaan pendapat terkait pelarangan terhadap ketiganya. Ragam pendapat ini muncul dengan berlandaskan ayat-ayat al-Qur'an dan hadis untuk memperkuat argumen masing-masing. Kajian ini mengungkap bagaimana hadis-hadis tentang seni tersebut dapat dipahami dan dikontekstualisasikan dengan menggunakan teori Ma'na-Cum-Maghza Sahiron, serta relevansinya dalam studi hadis. Kajian kualitatif ini menggunakan pendekatan sosiologis dan historis, dan data-data yang diperoleh dianalisis menggunakan teknik analisis eksplanatoris. Terdapat dua temuan dalam kajian ini: pertama, dalam hadis-hadis seni musik, lukis dan tari, tidak terdapat pesan yang menyiratkan adanya larangan terhadap ketiga seni tersebut. Hadis-hadis itu muncul dan hanya berlaku pada saat itu atau sesuai dengan konteks peristiwa tertentu yang melatarbelakangi munculnya hadis-hadis tersebut. Kedua, dalam konteks kekinian, pemaknaan dan penerapan hadis-hadis ini harus relevan dengan perkembangan zaman dengan memperhatikan kepentingan dan kebutuhan manusia. Apabila seni-seni tersebut ternyata memberikan dampak positif dalam kehidupan manusia, maka tidak menutup kemungkinan bahwa seni tersebut dapat diterapkan. Dalam konteks studi hadis, penggabungan kajian terhadap pembahasan terkait seni tersebut beserta penerapan teori Ma'na-Cum-Maghza berguna untuk memahami ketiganya dalam satu kajian sehingga pemahaman terhadapnya menjadi lebih integral-komprehensif.



**Kata kunci:** Hadis, Musik, Lukis, Tari, Teori Ma'na-Cum-Maghza, Seni Islam.

## Introduction

Numerous points of view can arise because of differences in choosing the hadith that is used as a guide. The hadiths that are used as a substantial basis for someone's argument are those that have the quality of being trustworthy. These numerous points of view can arise in various issues, one of which is art. In the case of the art of music, for example, the various opinions that occur are related to whether or not the use of music is permissible.<sup>1</sup> In painting, the difference of opinions that occurs is forbidden as well as permissible to paint objects that have a spirit or life.<sup>2</sup>

In addition, related to the world of art, there are jurists' views regarding the *makruh* of dance (as long as it is not accompanied by songs that are forbidden, tempting, or showing genitals) based on hadiths that are believed to be able to strengthen each other's opinions and arguments.<sup>3</sup>

Research on art (music, painting, and dance) and the theory of *Ma'na-Cum-Maghza* Sahiron have been pretty much done in the realm of academic studies. There are books that discuss hadiths about art from an Islamic perspective, especially the perspective of the Qur'an and Hadith on art, in a book entitled *Seni Dalam Pandangan Islam: Seni Vokal, Musik, & Tari*.<sup>4</sup> In addition, there are also journals that have the same discussion theme, entitled: *Seni dalam Perspektif Al Quran dan Hadist*.<sup>5</sup> Furthermore, there are several research results from the last five years on each art (music, painting, and dance). From several researches in the form of books, journals, proceeding, and thesis within that period, it is known that these studies lead to a discussion on law, *ma'anil* hadith, living hadith, and thoughts of hadith figures about art. In addition, there are also studies on the study of the theory of *Ma'na-Cum-Maghza* Sahiron in general, and some of them apply it to verses of the Qur'an, hadith conjointly applied to the message of a theologian.

1 Further explanation of applying music can be seen in: Imam Al-Ghazali, *Ihya' 'Ulum ad-Din li Imam al-Ghazali*, juz 2 (Semarang: PT. Karya Toha Putra, n.d.). page. 268-302.

2 Further explanation of painting can be seen in: Muhammad 'Ali As-Sabuni, *Rawai' u al-Bayani Tafsiru Ayati al-Abkami min al-Qura'ni* (Dimasyqi: Maktabah al-Ghazali, 1981). page. 395; and Yusuf Al-Qardhawi, *Halal dan Haram dalam Islam (terj.)* (Surabaya: PT. Bina Ilmu, 1980). page. 145.

3 Further explanation of *fuqaha* about dance can be seen in: Tim Penyusun, *Al-Mausu'ah al-Fiqhiyyah*, juz 23 (Al-Kuwait: Wizarah al-A' uqaf wa al-Islamiyyah, 1996). page. 10.

4 Abdurrahman Al Baghdadi, *Seni Dalam Pandangan Islam: Seni Vocal, Musik, & Tari* (Jakarta: Gema Insani Press, 1991)

5 Akhmad Akromusuhada, "Seni Dalam Perspektif Al Quran dan Hadist," *Jurnal Tahdzibi* 3, no. 1 (2018): 1-6, <https://doi.org/10.24853/tahdzibi.3.1.1-6>.

Therefore, this paper will explain how the study of hadith on the arts of music, painting, and dance uses the theory of *Ma'na-Cum-Maghza* and its relevance in the contemporary context and the development of hadith studies. The combination of the three main issues is to make it easier for readers and reviewers to understand the three in the same discourse and the application of the theory. Academically, this study can be useful for the development of hadith studies, especially in terms of studies about the arts of music, painting, and dance using the theory of *Ma'na-Cum-Maghza*. The reason why this theory is applied is because the method in this theory can be a vivid and directed guide in contextualizing and relevant hadiths that want to be studied.

In this qualitative study, the primary sources are the Nine Books of Hadith Collection (*al-kutub al-tis'ah*), in the form of hadiths about the arts of music, painting, and dance, as well as an anthology book entitled *Pendekatan Ma'na-Cum-Maghza atas al-Qur'an dan Hadis: Menjawab Problematika Sosial Keagamaan di Era Kontemporer*.<sup>6</sup> The collection of hadith related to these arts is limited to *al-kutub al-tis'ah* to minimize the presence of *da'if* in hadiths. If the quality of the hadith about the arts is *da'if* or false, then the analysis cannot be continued. This is also closely related to the use of theories (especially those that have been modified by Ali Imron so that they can be used in researching hadith), which emphasizes that the use of a hadith must have at least *hasan* quality so that research can continue. Therefore, the hadiths that will be examined in this paper are only a *sahih* or *hasan* quality. The secondary data are books, journals, and thesis with one theme to provide additional, more detailed explanations. The approach used in this study is a sociological and historical approach,<sup>7</sup> and the type of data analysis used is explanatory analysis.<sup>8</sup>

## **Takbrij Hadith of Music, Painting, and Dance**

### ***Hadiths about Music***

After searching the hadiths about music using the *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah* hadith software, then sorting the existing hadiths taken from the *Al-Kutub Al-Tis'ah*, then found hadiths related to music with the keyword *al-ma'azif*, *al-ghina` / tughaniyani*, *mizmar*, *al-duff*, and *al-kubah*. The hadiths with these keywords include:

6 Sahiron Syamsuddin, ed., *Pendekatan Ma'na-Cum-Maghza atas al-Qur'an dan Hadis: Menjawab Problematika Sosial Keagamaan di Era Kontemporer* (Yogyakarta: AIAT se-Indonesia kerja sama dengan Lembaga Ladang Kata, 2020).

7 Further explanation of the sociological historical and other approaches can be read in the article: Sahiron Syamsuddin, "Pendekatan dan Analisis dalam Penelitian Teks Tafsir Sebuah Overview," *Subuf* 12, no. 1 (2019), <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.22548/SHF.V12I1.409>. page. 138.

8 Is a type of data analysis that aims to explain in more depth the content/meaning in the text. Further can be read in the article: Syamsuddin. page. 140.

Bukhari no. 3638;<sup>9</sup> Muslim no. 1480<sup>10</sup> dan no 1482;<sup>11</sup> Bukhari no. 5590;<sup>12</sup> Ahmad no. 21911;<sup>13</sup> Bukhari no. 897;<sup>14</sup> Ibnu Majah no. 4010;<sup>15</sup> Ahmad no. 4307 (It is also narrated in his book that no. 4725 with a different *sanad*);<sup>16</sup> and Abu Dawud no. 3200.<sup>17</sup>

The hadiths above have the same object of discussion but with different contexts/events and times. These hadiths are about music and have different narration paths, namely from 'Ai`syah r.a, Buraidah (father of 'Abdullah bin Buraidah), A`bi Malik al-A`sy'ari, Nafi' and 'Abdullah bin 'Umar. The hadiths narrated from the path of 'Ai`syah r.a have a slightly different pronunciation of the transmission (redaction) of the hadith (although the context/event that occurred at that time was the same) after passing through the path of the narrators of 'Urwah. The possibility of a different path of transmission after 'Urwah is a factor in the different pronunciation of the transmission of these hadiths. It also has little in common with the path of narration apart from 'Ai`syah r.a, namely A`bi Malik al-A`sy'ari. Meanwhile, the hadiths from other narrators do not have the same case as those from the narrators 'Ai`syah r.a and A`bi Malik al-A`sy'ari.

In terms of quality of hadith, apart from the narrations of Bukhari and

- 
- 9 Al-Bukhari, "*Sahih al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Manaqib, Bab Maqdami an-Nabi saw. wa Ashabibi al-Madinah*," (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018). This hadiths narrated in the *Sunan an-Nasa'i* no.1575, *Sunan Ibnu Majah* no. 1888, *Musnad Ahmad* no. 22920, 23541, 23804, 23879 and 24358
- 10 Muslim, "*Sahih Muslim, Kitab Salah al-'Idaini, Bab ar-Rukhsah fi al-La'ibi al-Lazi La Ma'siyah fihi fi Ayyami al-'Id*," (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018). This hadiths narrated in the *Sahih Bukhari* no. 934 and 3266, *Sunan an-Nasa'i* no. 1579 and *Musnad Ahmad* no. 23400
- 11 Muslim, "*Sahih Muslim, Kitab Salah al-'Idaini, Bab ar-Rukhsah fi al-La'ibi al-Lazi La Ma'siyah fihi fi Ayyami al-'Id*," This hadiths narrated in the *Sahih Bukhari* no. 897 and 2691
- 12 Al-Bukhari, "*Sahih al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Asyrah, Bab Ma Ja'a Fiman Yastabillu al-Khamr wa Yusammibi bi Ghairi Ismih*" (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018).
- 13 Ahmad bin Hambal, "*Musnad Ahmad, Kitab Baqi Musnad al-Ansari, Bab Hadis Buraidah al-Aslamiyyi ra.*" (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018). This hadiths narrated in the *Sunan at-Tirmidzi* no. 3623)
- 14 Al-Bukhari, "*Sahih al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Jami'ah, Bab al-Hirabi wa ad-Daraq Yauma al-'Id*" (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018). This hadiths narrated in the *Sahih Bukhari* no. 2691 *Sahih Muslim* no. 1482
- 15 Ibnu Majah, "*Sunan Ibnu Majah, Kitab al-Fitan, Bab al-'Uqubat*" (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018). This hadiths narrated in the *Sunan Abu Dawud* no. 3203 and 3204 (with the different *sanad*), *Musnad Ahmad* no. 21827 and 17379 (with the different *sanad*, but in the redaction of the two hadiths there are no pronunciations that mention music and the like).
- 16 Ahmad bin Hambal, "*Musnad Ahmad, Kitab Musnad al-Mukasirina min al-Sahabah, Bab Musnad 'Abdillah bin 'Umar bin al-Khattab ra.*" (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018).
- 17 Abu Dawud, "*Sunan Abi Dawud, Kitab al-Asyribah, Bab an-Nahyi 'an al-Muskiri*" (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018). This hadiths narrated in the *Sahih Muslim* no. 3729, *Sunan Abu Dawud* no. 3201, *Sunan an-Nasa'i* no. 5490, 5493, 5494, 5501, 5503, 5505, 5507, 5508, 5510, 5511, 5632, *Sunan Ibnu Majah* no. 3378 and 3382, *Musnad Ahmad* no. 2494, 3104, 4415, 6190, 6450, 9174, 11656, 11751, 18817, 18842, 18895, 25416, and *Sunan Darimi* no. 2457

Muslim, the narrations of Ibn Majah (no. 4010), Abu Dawud (no. 3200), and Ahmad (no. 21911 and 4307) were authenticated by Imam Ibn Hibban, where he is known as a hadith narrator who selects authentic hadiths (*sahih hadith*) according to his scientific standards, such as Imam Bukhari and Imam Muslim. In addition, one of the hadiths is Ahmad no. 21911 and has been validated as *sahih* by Imam Muslim.

### ***Hadiths about Painting***

Hadiths related to this theme are taken from the *Al-Kutub Al-Tis'ah*. The results for these hadiths that are about painting have keywords *as-suwwar*, *surah*, *yusawwiru*, and *al-musawwirun / musawwir*, narrated by: Bukhari no. 416;<sup>18</sup> Muslim<sup>19</sup> no. 3942,<sup>20</sup> 3943, 3944, 3945<sup>21</sup> and 3946;<sup>22</sup> Bukhari no. 1944;<sup>23</sup> and Muslim no. 3947.<sup>24</sup>

From several hadiths with the theme of painting that have been described above, there are several different paths of narrators of hadith including 'Ai` syah r.a, Ibn 'Umar, 'Abdillah, 'Abdullah bin Mas'ud, Ibn 'Abbas, 'Aun bin A`bu Zuhafah and A`bu Zur'ah. The hadiths narrated from the path of 'Ai` syah r.a 'Aun bin A`bu Zuhafah and A`bu Zur'ah have different hadith redaction. Meanwhile, the hadiths from the narrators of Ibn 'Umar, 'Abdillah and 'Abdullah bin Mas'ud, have the same hadith meaning but different pronunciations, namely in the way of the narrators of Ibn 'Umar. The location of the difference is that there is an addition to the words of the Prophet: ..... *'Turn the pictures you paint to live!..* ". These words were uttered after the Holy Prophet warned that these painters would be tormented on the Day of Resurrection.

Meanwhile, the hadiths of Ibn 'Abbas have different redactions/pronunciations

18 Al-Bukhari, "*Sahih al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Salah, Bab as-Salah fi al-Bi'ah*" (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018). This hadiths narrated in the *Sahih Bukhari* no. 1255 and 3584, *Sahih Muslim* no. 822, *Sunan an-Nasa'i* no. 697, *Musnad Ahmad* no. 23118

19 Muslim, "*Sahih Muslim, Kitab al-Libas wa al-Zinah, Bab Tabrimi Taswiri Surah al-Hayawani wa Tabrimi Ittikhazi Ma Fibi Surah*" (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018).

20 This hadiths narrated in the *Sahih Bukhari* no. 4783, 5495, 7002 and 7003, *Sunan an-Nasa'i* no. 5266 and 5267, *Sunan Ibnu Majah* no. 2142, *Musnad Ahmad* no. 4477, 4561, 4921, 5507, 5811, 5980, 8584, 23281, 23370, 24684 and 24896 dan *Muwatha` Malik* no. 1525

21 This hadiths narrated in the *Musnad Ahmad* no. 2671

22 This hadiths narrated in the *Sahih Bukhari* no. 2073 and 5506, *Sunan an-Nasa'i* no. 5263, 5264 and 5265, *Musnad Ahmad* no. 1769, 2054, 3102, 3210, 6044 and 10145

23 Al-Bukhari, "*Sahih al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Buyu', Bab Mukil ar-Riba*" (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018). This hadiths narrated in the *Sahih Bukhari* no. 2084, 4927, 5319, 5489 and 5505, *Sunan Abi Dawud* no. 3022, *Sunan an-Nasa'i* no. 4596, *Sunan Ibnu Majah* no. 2151, *Musnad Ahmad* no. 2495, 3103, 13891, 14125, 14274, 18007 and 18019

24 Muslim, "*Sahih Muslim, Kitab al-Libas wa al-Zinah, Bab Tabrimi Taswiri Surah al-Hayawani wa Tabrimi Ittikhazi Ma Fibi Surah*." This hadiths narrated in the *Sahih Bukhari* no. 5497 and 7004, *Musnad Ahmad* no. 6869, 7209, 8716, 8721, 9448 and 10399.



in the same event, namely when someone said to him that he was a person who liked to draw and asked for a *fatwa* from him. The difference in the pronunciation of the delivery lies in the words of the Prophet that were conveyed by Ibn 'Abbas to the painter, namely: *firstly*, it's said: ...*that he (the Prophet) has said: 'Everyone who likes to draw will go to hell. Allah will make for him, with every image he makes, a person who will torture him in Hell.'*<sup>25</sup> *Secondly*, the redaction is: ...*Rasulullah sallallaahu 'alaihi wasallam said: "Whoever draws while in this world, then on the Day of Resurrection he will be told to blow the spirit on the picture even though he cannot breathe it."*<sup>26</sup> The difference between the two redactions may occur after passing through the path of the narrators of Ibn 'Abbas, because the paths of the narrators are different after passing through the narrators of Ibn 'Abbas.

### ***Hadiths about Dance***

The search results related to dance taken from the *al-kutub al-tis'ah*, found four hadith with the keywords *yarqusun* and *yazfinun*. Two of them are not mentioned in full, both *sanad* and *matan*, but will be explained directly in the hadith analysis section. While the other two hadiths are Ahmad no 12082<sup>27</sup> and Muslim no. 1483<sup>28</sup> (after being traced by the narrators in the *sanad* and strengthened by being validated in accordance with the provisions of the conditions for the authentic hadith of Imam Muslim, it can be said that the hadith is of authentic quality or *sahih*.)

The two hadiths regarding dance above come from different narrators, namely 'Ai`syah r.a and Anas. The context/background of the events occurred was the same, namely at that time the Habasyah people were dancing/jumping in front of the Prophet. However, there is a difference in the pronunciation of the transmission of hadith between the two. Hadith from the narrator Anas says that the people of Habasyah danced while praising the name of the Messenger of Allah. Meanwhile, the hadith from the narrator of 'Ai`syah r.a mentions the setting of the place and time of the incident, namely in the mosque on holidays.

<sup>25</sup> Muslim No. 3945.

<sup>26</sup> Muslim No. 3946.

<sup>27</sup> Ahmad bin Hambal, "*Musnad Ahmad, Kitab Baqi Musnad al-Mukasirina, Bab Musnad Anas bin Malik ra.*" (CD *al-Maktabah as-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018).

<sup>28</sup> Muslim, "*Sahih Muslim, Kitab Salah al-Idaini, Bab ar-Rukhsah fi al-La'ibi al-Lazi La Ma'siyah fihi fi Ayyami al-Id.*" This hadiths narrated in the *Sunan an-Nasai`* no. 1576

## Analysis of Hadiths on Art with the Application of *Ma'na-Cum-Maghza* Approach

In studying the hadiths related to the arts of music, painting, and dance, the theory of *Ma'na-Cum-Maghza* (ala Sahiron) will be used. This theory is an approach to obtain the actual meaning (*ma'na*) or the main message/significance (*maghza*) intended by the author or understood by historical audiences. The text is then contextualized in today's life. Therefore, there are three important things that an interpreter needs to look for, *first*, *al-ma'na al-tarikhi* (historical meaning); *second*, *al-maghza al-tarikhi* (historical phenomenal significance); *third*, *al-maghza al-mutaharrik* (dynamic phenomenal significance) in situations where the text of the Qur'an is interpreted.<sup>29</sup>

### Music

- a) Linguistic Analysis, *Ma'na* and *Maghza al-Tarikhi* with the explanation of the Theologian

This analysis focuses on the aspects of the *matan* of the hadith and its scope. The discussion starts from the linguistic aspect. The *first* keyword is *al-ma'azif*. The use of this word is found in the hadith narrated by Imam Bukhari no. 5590 in his book, namely Sahih al-Bukhari and Ibn Majah no. 4010 in his book Sunan Ibn Majah. The word *al-ma'azif* comes from the word *'azafa*, which means entertainment.<sup>30</sup> The word *al-ma'azif* is often interpreted in several hadith editors as a musical instrument (as in hadith of Bukhari above).

Yusuf Qardhawi explained that there are several aspects that need to be considered when interpreting *al-ma'azif* in the hadith as a musical instrument. The pronunciation of *yastabilluna* contained in the redaction has two meanings, namely (1) it means "*hala*" and (2) is a form of *majazi* in expressing the freedom to use musical instruments. If we use the notion of "*hala*" essentially (*zahir*), it can be concluded that it is unlawful to "permit" things that are forbidden—such as alcohol and adultery—as in the hadith. Meanwhile, if you choose to use the meaning of *majazi*, are the things that are prohibited as a whole, or individually?

According to Yusuf Qardhawi, the first understanding is the strongest. This is because the hadith is true that human behavior that is luxurious (such as wearing clothes made of silk and feathered), spending time in nightclubs (full of women

29 Sahiron Syamsuddin, "Metode Penafsiran dengan Pendekatan Ma'na-Cum-Maghza," in *Pendekatan Ma'na-Cum-Maghza atas al-Qur'an dan Hadis: Menjawab Problematika Sosial Keagamaan di Era Kontemporer*, ed. oleh Sahiron Syamsuddin (Yogyakarta: AIAT se-Indonesia kerja sama dengan Lembaga Ladang Kata, 2020). page. 8-9.

30 Ibn Manzur, *Lisan al-Arab* (Kairo: Dar al-Ma'arif, n.d.). page. 2928.

and singing) and drinking alcohol is a wrong/deplorable act. In line with this, Ibn Majah has narrated the hadith from the *sanad* of Abu Malik al-Asy'ari (i.e. hadith no. 4010) and has been narrated by many other narrators including Ibn Hibban and al-Bukhari. Apart from the path of Hisyam Ibn 'Ammar, this hadith is a form of threat intended for people who like to drink alcohol, while musical instruments are only as a complement.<sup>31</sup>

*Second*, the *al-ghina`*, contained in Bukhari no. 3638 and 897 also Muslim no. 1480 and 1482. According to Ibn Manzur in the book of *Lisan al-'Arab*, *al-ghina`* comes from the voice that is sung/singing.<sup>32</sup> In the three of the hadith it is written: "*tughanniyan*", is the verb form of the word *ghina`* and is interpreted as the activity of someone who is singing. Ibnu al-As|ir explain in the book *al-Nihayah fi Gharib al-Hadis| wa al-As|ar*,<sup>33</sup> the word of *ghina`* is a hymn about the war of Bu'ats (the war between the Aus and Khazraj tribes now known as the Ansar) which is sung to remember the tragedy of the war. The songs that are sung are different from the songs/singings that are known among indulgences and games (perhaps the meaning is the song that is usually sung in "entertainment" venues). Therefore, 'Umar gave a dispensation against the songs/songs of the Arabs'.<sup>34</sup>

*Third* is *mizmar*. The use of this word is found in Bukhari no. 897 with the same pronunciation and Ahmad no. 4307 with pronunciation *zammara*. This word has meaning "shepherd's flute/flute from a blown reed".<sup>35</sup> As for the word *al-duff* (in Ahmad no. 21911) means tambourine, while *al-kubab* (in Abu Dawud no. 3200) means "slender little drum".<sup>36</sup> These three words are included in the types of musical instruments used by ancient singers/musicians in celebrating big days such as holidays or certain other events.

Issues related to music (including musical instruments as well as singing/songs) have pros and cons. Both opinions have a basis for the arguments that are believed to strengthen their respective arguments. For example, the group that forbids music by using the arguments of the Qur'an, namely: Qur'an 28: 55. From this verse, scholars believe that the word *laghwun* (useless words) is singing. However, specifically, what is meant by the word *laghwun* is a harsh word, such as cursing,

31 Yusuf Al-Qardhawi, *Islam dan Seni (terj.)* (Bandung: Pustaka Hidayah, 2000). page. 54-55.

32 Manzur, *Lisan al-'Arab*. page. 3310.

33 It is possible that there are two hadiths from the narrators of Aisyah r.a eferred to by Ibn al-Asir in his book, namely: Bukhari no. 2691 and Ahmad no. 23879.

34 Ibnu al-Asir, *al-Nihayah fi Gharib al-Hadis wa al-Asar* (al-Qahirah: Dar Ibn al-Jauzi, 2016). page. 650.

35 Manzur, *Lisan al-'Arab*. page. 1862.

36 Manzur, *Lisan al-'Arab*. page. 3951.



criticizing, and so on. By the word of Allah Swt. also, in tune with Qur`an 25: 63. If traced, in fact the verse does not clearly prohibit a song or a sentence indicating that it is obligatory to avoid singing. Listening to things that are not useful is not forbidden, as Ibn Juraij's opinion that all words, deeds and actions that do not have benefits are not prohibited. Then, what is the position of this? According to Yusuf Qardhawi, these things are neither commendable nor despicable.<sup>37</sup>

Another example that prohibits music and singing is by using the hadith narrated by Imam Bukhari no. 5590 and the hadith narrated by Imam Ibn Majah no. 4010 and Imam Abu Dawud no. 3200 as previously described. After analyzing the linguistic aspect and looking at the historical context of the emergence of the hadith, it was found by *maghza al-tarikhi* that the case against the prohibition of musical instruments mentioned in it was only as a complement. These hadiths actually have a message for people who like to drink alcohol and gamble. In fact, in several other narrations that narrate this hadith, it does not mention/include a redaction regarding singing/music.

There is also a hadith narrated by Imam Ahmad (no. 4307) from the Nafi' path (as mentioned in the previous discussion), that when he heard the sound of the flute, Ibn 'Umar closed his ears until the sound of the flute was no longer heard. When asked by Nafi' the reason why Ibn 'Umar did it, he replied that he had seen Rasulullah saw. did something similar.

A number of scholars say this hadith is authentic or *sahih*.<sup>38</sup> There are also those who say that this hadith is *munkar*, such as Imam Abu Dawud. The reason is, if the hadith is authentic or *sahih*, then the hadith should be evidence that allows music. If hearing the sound of the flute is prohibited, the Rasulullah saw. would call on Ibn Umar to call/prevent this, not avoid it by covering his ears when he heard it. Then, why at that time the Rasulullah saw. covered his ears when he heard the sound of the flute? Yusuf Qardhawi is of the opinion that as is well known, Rasulullah saw. always avoided worldly things that are actually permissible, such as eating while leaning and so on, including listening to the sound of the flute.<sup>39</sup>

From this explanation, it can be concluded that according to Yusuf Qardhawi, Abu Dawud actually wanted to explain the importance of looking at the position of Rasulullah saw. in the hadith as a person who avoids actions that are actually common. This opinion can be understood because in some hadith narrations it indicates that

37 Al-Qardhawi, *Islam dan Seni (terj.)*. page. 47-48.

38 See in: Asy-Syaikh Alwi bin Abdul Qadir Assegaf Hafizhahullah, "Zammarah," Ad-Durar as-Saniyyah – al-Mausu'ah al-Hadisyyah, diakses 11 Oktober 2021, dorar.net.

39 Al-Qardhawi, *Islam dan Seni (terj.)*. page. 58-59.

the Prophet allowed the female slaves to sing (as in Ahmad no. 21911) and even reprimanded Abu Bakr and Umar who forbade it (one of them was Bukhari no. 3638). This indicates that the attitude of the Prophet in avoiding music, such as covering oneself with a cloth or turning her face when the slave girl sings (Muslim no. 1480 and 1482/ Bukhari no. 897) or covering her ears when listening to music (Ahmad no. 4307), is the attitude that is only applied to him as a form of depiction/ proof that the Prophet Muhammad was actually a special creature sent by Allah Swt. as an example for a mankind. Therefore, the Prophet really took care of himself (*muruah*), not only from things that were forbidden, but also things that were allowed (in this case things that did not count as good deeds or bad deeds).

Another important thing is the redaction by Muslim no. 1480 which states that the Messenger of Allah. "covering oneself with a cloth", possibly is when watching the performances of the Habasyah people, there was an insulating cloth covering the Messenger of Allah along with 'Ai` syah r.a. The screen made of the cloth made the Habasyah people who were performing the show could not see 'Ai` syah r.a, but the Messenger of Allah and 'Ai` syah r.a could still see the show from behind the screen that covered it. Another narration that corroborates this statement is the hadith narrated by Bukhari no. 5190 with the following redaction: "The Habasyah people are playing with their weapons of war. Rasulullah saw. spread out a sutra so that they would not see me ('Ai` syah) while I was watching them. Keep doing that until finally I ('Ai` syah) refuses to see anymore".

In addition, in the redaction of these hadiths, there is no statement of Rasulullah saw. which clearly states the reason why the Holy Prophet performed those actions at that time. Even in Ahmad no. 4307, Ibn 'Umar simply repeats the actions taken by the Holy Prophet and does not mention the reasons he did them. In addition, in Muslim no. 1480 and 1482, although the Prophet allowed singing on holidays, it does not mean that music/singing is prohibited other than holidays, because there are no redaction who says that it is prohibited other than on holidays. In addition, there is also no sentence (in the redaction of the hadiths above) which clearly states that the Prophet forbade listening to music, both instruments, song verses and songs.

Apart from the explanation above, there are hadith arguments that prohibit musical instruments or singing above according to some scholars saying that the hadith is not a valid hadith (*sahih*), or is a valid hadith (*sahih*) but the redaction does not clearly indicate that there is a prohibition on musical instruments or singing.<sup>40</sup>

b) Contextualization of Hadith: *Magbza al-Mutaharrik* (Dynamic Phenome-

40 Al-Qardhawi, page. 62.

nal Significance) Hadiths of Music

The hadiths about music are used by both groups who are for and against the issue of the prohibition of music. However, after analyzing the entire hadith, it was found that in fact each of these hadiths about music has various contexts/events behind its emergence of these hadiths.

In the hadiths that are considered to prohibit the existence of music or songs, it is found that the prohibition applies only at the time of the incident. The hadith that contains the prohibition on music is actually not intended for the music itself, but on the behavior of drinking and gambling, while music is only a supporter. For this reason, another narration that narrates this hadith does not include music in its redaction.

From here the author takes one issue of the present context, namely the use of *Qawwali* music (Sufi music) in the teachings of the *H|isytiyyah tarekat*. The largest *tarekat* in India uses their songs (mystical nuances) as a ritual medium to purify themselves (*tazkiyah an-nafs*) and always draw closer to Allah Swt.<sup>41</sup> The music, which was pioneered by Amir Khuslow Dehlavi, comes from the amalgamation of Persian and Indian artistic roots.<sup>42</sup>

Initially this music was used by the *Qawal* to entertain tomb pilgrims on the eve of the *Urs* festival (Sufi Festival) and other *H|isytiy* festivals.<sup>43</sup> Places that are usually used as their holy places known as *ribat*, including in Delhi, Gulbarka, Ajmer, Kalyar, Khuldabad and Pakpattan (Pakistan).<sup>44</sup> In the 20th century, *Qawwali* music entered the recording industry after centuries of maintaining this Sufi music.<sup>45</sup> Today, *Qawwali* music is popular in the provinces of Sindh and Punjab in Pakistan and is often listened to by the people there,<sup>46</sup> as well as in India. In fact, Hindus are interested in listening to it as a form of artistic presentation.<sup>47</sup>

Basically, *Qawwali* music is performed by reciting poems containing praise to Allah Swt or religious poems accompanied by the strains of musical instruments,

41 Saiyid Athar Abbas Rizvi, *A History of Sufisme in India* (New Delhi: Munshiram Manoharial Publishers, 1978). page. 114.

42 Anuradha Bhattacharjee dan Shadab Alam, "The Origin and Journey of Qawwali From Sacred Ritual to Entertainment?," *Journal of Creative Communications* 7, no. 3 (2012). page. 215.

43 Bareera Saeed dan Syeda Shahida Batool, "Experiences and Practices of Contemporary Sufis in Pakistan," *Nust Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* 7, no. 1 (2021). page. 102.

44 Khoiril Anam, "Musik Spiritual (Telaah Filososfis)" (Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel, Surabaya, 2017). page. 38.

45 Anam. page 39.

46 Ghulam Yaseen Kalhoro, "The Role off Off-Grid Solar Electrification Sustainability in the Economic Growth of Pakistan" (Politecnico, Torino, 2021). page. 19.

47 Anam, "Musik Spiritual (Telaah Filososfis)." page. 39.

such as drums, harps, clarinets, violins, and the like.<sup>48</sup> However, this music has a distinctive feature, namely that the composition of the notes sung in it contains elements of India, unlike Islamic music which usually contains elements of Arabic music.<sup>49</sup> Not only that, this spiritual music is the result of the amalgamation of Sufism and psychology with the aim of creating harmony within oneself to be free from stress and pressure. Therefore, it is not surprising that Sufism music like this can play an important role in one's mental health.<sup>50</sup> *Qawwali* music was then popularized in the world by Nusrat Fateh Ali Khan and he changed its essence by emphasizing more on the composition of *Qawwali's* musical notes than the lyrics/poems.<sup>51</sup> Another example of musical style is *nasyid*, which is a form of singing that contains praises to Rasulullah saw., calls to draw closer to Allah and strives for *jihad*.<sup>52</sup>

If hadiths of musical are then constructed more broadly in the contemporary context, such as *nasyid* songs or *Qawwali* music (Sufi music) which emphasizes the beauty aspect and musical style that tends to mix and match the composition of tones characterized by art and culture, then the hadiths which are considered a ban on music cannot be applied. This is because the context of these hadiths is not appropriate to the context of today's arts and culture. In addition, when someone needs refreshing, feels tired and does not have enough energy to go back to their activities, listening to music can be an alternative to just entertain themselves after going through tiring days.

### **Painting**

- a) Linguistic Analysis, *Ma'na* and *Maghza al-Tarikhi* with the Explanation of the Theologian

This step begins by conducting a linguistic analysis. The linguistic analysis aims to determine the meaning of the words *as-suwar*, *surah*, *yusawwiru*, and *al-musawwirun / musawwir* contained in the hadiths. The forms of words used in the redaction of these hadiths are different. The use of the word *as-suwar* is found in the hadiths narrated by Imam Bukhari (no. 416) and Imam Muslim (no. 3942 and 3946). While the word *surah* is found in Imam Muslim no. 3945-3946 and the word

48 Anam. page. 38.

49 Moh. Afnan Rahmatullah, "Dimensi Mistik dalam Musik Qawwali (Studi terhadap Tarekat Chistiyah)" (Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta, 2019). page. 4-5.

50 Saeed dan Batool, "Experiences and Practices of Contemporary Sufis in Pakistan." page. 102.

51 This is clarified by his words in one of his interviews, "Because music does not know language, it is naturally international in nature". It is clear, then, that Sufi music, apart from being used in the spiritual field, can also become music that is loved by the international public and penetrates the industrial world. Further can be seen in: Anam, "Musik Spiritual (Telaah Filosofis)." page. 39-40.

52 Febri Yulika, *Jejak Seni Dalam Sejarah Islam* (Padang Panjang: Institut Seni Indonesia Padang Panjang, 2016). page. 28.

*yusawwiru* no. 3946. The word *al-musawwirun* is found in Muslim no. 3943-3944 or the word *musawwir* on Bukhari no. 1944 and Muslim no. 3945 and 3947.

The five forms of the word come from the word *sawwara*. In the book *al-Nihayah fi Gharib al-Hadis wa al-Asar*, Ibn al-Asir said that apart from the meaning of painting, the word can also be interpreted as “creating”.<sup>53</sup> As Allah Swt. created all aspects that exist on earth with a variety of different forms so as to reveal its beauty and features. Talking about the form of creation, probably this is a factor in the problem regarding the prohibition of painting, namely because it is considered to compete with the form of Allah’s creation. Moreover, the object that is drawn/painted is a creature that is perfect and has a life like the human form, as in the Qur’an 82:7-8 and Qur’an 3:6. In addition, the Qur’an also mentions that among the most beautiful names of Allah is *al-Musawwir* (The Forming of Forms). As the word of God in Qur’an 59:24.

From the arguments of the Prophet’s hadith and the verses of the Qur’an above, there is a central point here that the word *taswir* or *al-Musawwir* has the meaning of “forming a form”. If based on this understanding, then everything that is shaped into a form or other form, both 2-dimensional and 3-dimensional works, is included in the scope of *taswir* and *al-musawwir*.

In the matter of the prohibition of *taswir* and *al-musawwir*, if we look more closely, we can see the *maghza al-tarikhi* on the hadiths above, and there is an accompanying *illah* (cause), namely: *first*, is used to worship other than Allah Swt. Why? The reason is, at that time many people made pictures, paintings and statues with the aim of purifying them and making them as a graven images. For example, in the redaction of the hadith narrated by Bukhari no. 416 which says that when a pious person dies, people make him a statue over his grave, and this usually happens in churches.

*Second*, the pictures, paintings, and sculptures that were formed at that time resembled the shape of a living creature created by Allah Swt. like humans and animals so that they are afraid to match His creation. An example is the redaction of the hadith by Muslim no. 3942 which says that in the hereafter the painter/drawer will be asked to revive what he has drawn because the object he draws is an animate object.

Judging from the explanation, painting is not completely prohibited. That is, the prohibition against it is based on the causal factors or the context that occurred at the time the hadith appeared (historical aspects of a hadith). As for the hadiths that have been described above, most of them are hadiths whose object/focus of hadith is

53 Ibnu al-Asir, *al-Nihayah fi Gharib al-Hadis wa al-Asar*. page. 505.



sculpture (however, some of them discuss drawing/painting). So, the conclusion from the explanation above is that *taswir* and *al-musawwir* not only have the meaning of drawing/painting, but also making/carving statues.

b) Contextualization of Hadith: *Magbza al-Mutabarrik* (Dynamic Phenomenal Significance) Hadiths of Painting

From several hadiths related to painting/drawing that have been described previously, it can be seen that these hadiths were valid at that time. That is, the context/event that occurred at that time became the cause of the emergence of the above hadiths. The prohibition in the above hadiths is to prevent the artwork from being used as a purified object, for example being used as an object of worship, as in the redactions of these hadiths). This is because, at that time, most people still worshiped the pictures, paintings, and statues that they formed and believed to be sacred objects.

In addition, most of the objects of discussion are more directed at making statues. The pronunciation of *taswir* and *al-musawwir* in these hadiths does not only mean drawing/painting but also making sculptures. This conclusion was reached after analyzing the word in the hadiths above, that the prohibition on drawing/painting arose due to the context of the events at that time, that people have a habit of purifying images, paintings, and statues, and most shapes or forms are made to resemble Allah's creations so that at that time it was feared that it could match His creation.

Painting can also have a positive influence, for example, nowadays there is a mosaic painting style which is formed by pasting pieces of various types of materials of various colors originating from nature (such as pieces of ceramics, rocks, leaves, and wood)<sup>54</sup> on a flat medium by using an adhesive, so as to produce a certain painting object as desired, whether human, animal, plant or a combination of the two or all three. The mosaic painting itself is often considered a two-dimensional painting that emphasizes aesthetic/beauty aspects and is considered to have high artistic art, so it is not surprising that these paintings are often used as decorations or displays by the public.

There is a mosaic painter named Ansori (59 years old). Initially, Ansori studied the technique of painting mosaics of ceramic shards in the 1980s by self-taught, starting with making murals with mosaics. Over time, this mosaic artist began to be better known for his skills in making mosaic paintings depicting seven Indonesian Presidents from the arrangement of ceramic fragments. When interviewed, Ansori revealed that he felt the essence of beauty when he saw the mosaics of the seven

54 Dedy Setiawan, "Ekspresionistis sebagai Pendekatan Corak dalam Berkarya Seni Lukis" (Universitas Negeri Semarang, 2019). page. 14.

presidents put together in the form of the painting. From here, he received many offers and has produced many mosaic paintings with pictures of national figures and landscapes, there are more than 100 mosaic paintings produced.<sup>55</sup>

From this example, if the above hadiths are used to prohibit the existence of art that emphasizes aesthetic aspects (such as mosaic painting or other types of painting) simply because it uses the argument “drawing/painting is prohibited” from the redaction of these hadiths, then this is not the appropriate context, because apart from the different contexts that occur in the hadiths, it can also trigger the loss of the existence of art which can actually be a medium for one’s creativity in interpreting the natural beauty that exists in the world through painting media.

### **Dance**

#### a) Linguistic Analysis, *Ma’na* and *Maghza al-Tarikhi* with the Explanation of the Theologian

In the two hadiths above, it can be seen that these hadiths talk about the issue of dancing. However, the use of the word in the two hadiths seems different. For example, in Ahmad no. 12082, the word used is *yarqusun* and is translated as “dancing”. While in Muslim no. 1483, the word used is *yazfinun*.

The hadith narrated by Imam Muslim, even though it uses words other than *yarqusun*, but the intended meaning is “dance”. This can be seen from the book of Syarh Sahih Muslim by Imam Al-Nawawi which states that the meaning referred to in Muslim no. 1483 is dancing<sup>56</sup> The word *yazfinun* comes from the word *zafana* which literally means “pushing hard and kicking with his feet”. Although this understanding does not clearly mention “dancing”, this understanding has a similar meaning to the general notion of “dance”, which is an act of moving the body to express human soul/feelings (usually accompanied by instruments so that the resulting movement becomes rhythmic).

In the book *al-Nihayah fi Gharib al-Hadis wa al-Asar*, said *yazfinun* in the hadith narrated through Aisha ra. means “dance”<sup>57</sup>, so it can be said that the two words have the same meaning, namely “dance”.

Regarding the prohibition on dance/dancing, some scholars also use the argument of the verses of the Qur’an which are considered to be a prohibition against it. The verses of the Qur’an which are considered to have the meaning of

55 Ponco Susono, “Hebat! Seniman Klaten Sulap Pecahan Keramik jadi Mozaik Bergambar Tujuh Presiden RI,” diakses 10 Desember 2021, [www.solopos.com](http://www.solopos.com).

56 Al-Nawawi, “*Syarah al-Nawawi ‘ala Muslim, Kitab Salah al-Idaini, Bab ar-Rukhsah fi al-La’ibi al-Lazi La Ma’siyah fih fi Ayyami al-Id*” (CD *al-Maktabah al-Syamilah*, Global Islamic Software, 2018).

57 Ibnu al-Asir, *al-Nihayah fi Gharib al-Hadis wa al-Asar*. page. 378.

prohibiting dance/dancing by some scholars are the words of Allah in Qur'an 15:37. Imam al-Qurthubi in his commentary, states:

“The theologians postulated with this verse to denounce dancing and its perpetrators. Al-Imam Abul Wafa bin Aqil said, “The Qur'an states that it is forbidden to dance in His word, **do not walk on this earth in an angry way (full of pleasure)**. And this verse also denounces pride. Meanwhile, dancing is a form of walking with a very happy expression and full of pride” (Al-Qurthubi, 10/263).

In his interpretation, he interprets the sentence “...*tamsyi fi al-ardi maraban*” as dancing. The meaning of the sentence according to the author is not quite right. The word *maraban* here in the Qur'anic dictionary is indeed interpreted as “joyful, too cheerful, arrogant, arrogant”.<sup>58</sup> However, the meaning of “joy” here is more to joy that is too excessive, causing arrogance and a sense of pride in oneself.

From the interpretation above, an important point is found, namely that there is an *illah* that walking or stomping is prohibited in the Qur'an 15:37 if it is done arrogantly. If it is related to dance/dancing, then the verse is not appropriate to be addressed to the art of dance. In fact, the aspects mentioned in both verse and interpretation are not always present in the art of dance.

In several hadith narrations, the issue of dance is often followed by the strains of musical instruments/singing. For example, the two hadith narrations above reveal that the Habasyah people danced on holidays while praising the Rasulullah saw. Although in the redaction of the hadith there is no sentence that clearly states that the dance is accompanied by music, but the sentence “... the Habasyah people jumped and danced in front of the Rasulullah sallallaahu 'alaihi wa sallam while saying: ‘Muhammad is a pious servant’..”, indicating that the Habasyah people praised the Prophet by singing him and singing a verse belongs to the musical aspect (although the music here is not like today's music which is full of mixed instruments).

If you combine the two hadiths above, then what is meant by “dancing” is simply jumping/stomping while playing the instruments of war. As for other narrations that corroborate this statement is the hadith narrated by Bukhari no. 5190 with the following redaction: “The Habasyah people are playing with their weapons of war. The Rasulullah saw. spread out a sutra so that they would not see me (‘Ai`syah) while I was watching them. And so until finally I (‘Ai`syah) refused to see again”.

There are also hadiths that serve as the basis that dancing is an act of vanity, by At-Tirmidhi no. 1561 and Ahmad no. 16662. The redaction used as evidence is: “...Every game played by a Muslim man is vanity, except for the practice of throwing

58 Hasanain Muhammad Makhluaf, *Kalimatul Qur'an-Tafsir Wa Bayan (terj)* (Bandung: Gema Risalah Press Bandung, 1992). page. 151.

arrows, or teaching his riding horse, or joking with his wife, because indeed all of this is the truth.”

However, this hadith is not authentic (*sahih*). There are those who judge the hadith as *hasan sahih*, namely Imam Tirmidhi. However, Ibn Hazm said that one of the narrators of the hadith namely ‘Abdullah bin al-Azraq is a *majhul* (unknown personality). As for Imam al-Albani, this hadith is considered a *da’if* hadith, both from the sanad of Uqbah bin ‘Amir and ‘Abdullah bin Abdurrahman bin Abi Husain. This hadith is considered weak in terms of the chain of transmission (*sanad*), so this hadith is not appropriate to be used as a support or basis in judging dance/dancing issues.

From the various hadiths above, there is a *maghza al-tarikhi* in it that the Rasulullah saw. did not prohibit dance at all. More deeply, when the Habashah people celebrate their holidays by dancing while praising the Rasulullah saw. (Ahmad no. 12082 and Muslim no. 1483), Rasulullah saw does not show any words or actions that indicate a prohibition against it. He actually appreciated their holiday by watching the performances of the Habasyah people. In addition, At-Tirmidhi no. 1561 and Ahmad no. 16662 does not clearly indicate there is a prohibition against dance/dancing.

b) Contextualization of Hadith: *Maghza al-Mutabarrik* (Dynamic Phenomenal Significance) Hadiths of Dancing

From various analyses and explanations in the previous discussion, it can be seen that in fact these hadiths have no prohibition against dance. The context when the dance performance took place was on their feast day. This was also demonstrated in the presence of the Rasulullah saw., and he allowed it. If this fact later gives birth to an argument that other than holidays, dance performances are not allowed, then this argument cannot be directly accepted. There is also no hadith redaction that says clearly that dancing is prohibited.

In the current context, for example, there is one type of regional traditional dances that is still being preserved, namely the Zapin Api Dance. This dance is one of the dances that contains cultural and religious elements in it. This Zapin Api dance originates from Teluk Rhu, North Rupal District, Bengkalis Regency, Riau Province.<sup>59</sup> This dance culture is known for its dancers who dance in the middle of the embers. Interestingly, the dancers who performed this dance did not feel the heat at all and seemed to really enjoy the dance.<sup>60</sup> The dance tradition that has been preserved

59 Nika Suryani dan Laila Fitriah, “Seni Pertunjukkan Tari Zapin Api Rupal Utara Bengkalis Provinsi Riau,” *Titian: Jurnal Ilmu Humaniora* 3, no. 1 (2019). page. 24.

60 Nurjanah, “Perencanaan Komunikasi dalam Pengembangan Potensi Pariwisata Kabupaten Bengkalis,” *Jurnal Dakwah Risalah* 29, no. 2 (2018). page. 103.

from generation to generation since the previous ancestors is not just anyone can do it. Only people from the direct lineage of the Zapin Api Dance could do it.

The combination of dance and musical accompaniment is performed in the midst of hot coals at night which requires five *Zapin* dancers, three *kompang* beaters, two fire supervisors and one caliph playing *gambus*. Not only that, some supporting tools are also needed, namely *gambus* and *kompang* musical instruments, coconut fibers and wood that have become fire and incense. Previously, the musical instruments were bathed in lime water, especially the *gambus* which was then smoked with frankincense.<sup>61</sup> The movements in the Zapin Api Dance are carried out freely without a plan, unlike the Zapin Dance in general which has certain patterns and movements.<sup>62</sup>

Before the arrival of Islam, this dance was originally formed to prevent the disasters that at that time often occurred in North Rupat after negotiating with the fire genies, on the condition that they performed a dance in the midst of burning coals while chanting the spells given by him. When the mid-15th century, through the Acehnese of Arab descent (pioneered by a traveler named Said Jafar) then changed the dance into a dance accompanied by music with Zapin elements (now known as the Zapin Api Dance). The mantras spoken by the dancers are also changed by only being allowed to use the blessings of the Prophet, the histories of the Prophet and the greatness of Allah Swt. The Zapin Api dancers are also given Islamic Shari'a practices that must be carried out, such as prayer, dhikr, fasting. If the Zapin Api dancer violates or does something that is against Islamic law, then the Zapin dancer will no longer be able to dance on the fire.<sup>63</sup>

From this it can be seen that the function of the Zapin Api Dance is not actually intended for entertainment performances, but to introduce and symbolize Islam in the North Rupat area. Because of that, the lyrics in Zapin Api Dance contain a lot of praises for the Rasulullah saw. Along with its development, in the 19th century Zapin Api Dance had many enthusiasts in the community so that this dance was then used as a means of entertainment performances in various events, such as weddings, circumcision and other big days in the area. It does not stop there, this dance is used as cultural tourism in Bengkalis Regency as an example of a unique form of artistic and cultural creativity.<sup>64</sup>

61 Suryani dan Fitriah, "Seni Pertunjukkan Tari Zapin Api Rupat Utara Bengkalis Provinsi Riau." page. 29.

62 Sefrona Syaiful, "Strategi Pengembangan Tari Zapin Api sebaga Daya Tari Wisata Budaya di Pulau Rupat Kabupaten Bengkalis," *Intelektiva: Jurnal Ekonomi, Sosial & Humaniora* 2, no. 12 (2021). page. 103-104.

63 Suryani dan Fitriah, "Seni Pertunjukkan Tari Zapin Api Rupat Utara Bengkalis Provinsi Riau." page. 25.

64 Suryani dan Fitriah. page. 30.



In line with this context, if we look again at the hadiths above (especially Ahmad no 12082 and Muslim no. 1483) it shows that there is a cultural concept that is implied in the depiction of the celebration of the Habasyah people with dances performed. to Rasulullah saw. The attitude of the Prophet who witnessed the show indicated that there was a mutual respect for the cultural features of a certain people/region. Therefore, the art of dance in the context of religious culture like this is certainly allowed.

### **The Relevance of Hadith Studies on Art in the Development of Hadith Studies**

Regarding the hadiths of music, painting, and dance that have been studied using the *Ma'na-Cum-Magbza* Sahiron theory above, there are three important things, namely: *first*, this theory can provide room for hadith reviewers to be more careful in selecting and sorting a hadith to be analyzed and can be applied according to the context that occurs in the present. *Second*, there are differences between this study and other studies with almost the same object of study, namely the incorporation of the main issues/objects of the study of hadiths in music, painting, and dance. This is intended to help readers and hadith reviewers to understand all three in one study as well as the application of *Ma'na-Cum-Magbza* theory to the object of study. The scope of the study is not only in the context that occurred during the time of the Prophet Muhammad, but also continues in the present context so that understanding of the music, painting, and dance with the hadiths associated into them becomes more integral-comprehensive.

*Third*, after analyzing the hadiths of music, painting, and dance, it can be seen that the arts of music, painting, and dance have shifted in the contemporary context in terms of human interests and needs. The existence of these two aspects at present is caused by various current issues related to the arts of music, painting, and dance. For example, *Qawwali* music (Sufi music) in the teachings of the *H|isytiyyah Tarekat* which is used to purify oneself and draw closer to Allah Swt; mosaic painting that emphasizes aesthetic/beauty aspects in interpreting an object and is considered to have high artistic art; and the Zapin Api dance tradition which contains cultural and religious elements in the North Rupal area, Bengkalis.

The three problems in the arts, culture, and religion are actual examples that interpreting the hadiths of music, painting, and dance must be in accordance with the times (both time and place). Therefore, contextualization of these hadiths is needed to read the situation and conditions that occur and answer the problems that exist in the present. If it is associated with the three problems above, the issue of whether or

not music, painting, and dance is permissible, which comes from an understanding of these artistic hadiths, can be concluded that the prohibition on some hadiths is only limited to the context of certain events and is a factor in the emergence of hadiths. There are even hadiths that show the permissibility of the three types of arts. In addition, other hadiths are not clearly spelled out or imply messages that indicate a prohibition on the arts of music, painting, and dance.

Therefore, the issue of the prohibition of the arts of music, painting, and dance should not be raised as a whole without paying attention to the interests and needs of today's society (both personal and group). If the art of music, painting, and dance turns out to have a positive impact on the lives of individuals and society, then it is possible that the arts of music, painting, and dance can be applied. More broadly in social networks, the arts of music, painting, and dance can form the character of a society by introducing Indonesian culture, such Indonesian culture continues to develop and is increasingly global.

## Conclusions

There are two points that can be concluded from the results of this study, namely: *first*, in the meaning of the hadiths of music, painting, and dance that have been studied using the theory of *Ma'na-Cum-Maghza* Sahiron, there is no clear prohibition against music, painting, and dance. The hadiths of music, painting, and dance above arose due to the context of events that were valid only at that time or were limited to the context of certain events that were happening behind the emergence of these hadiths. If the hadiths of music, painting, and dance are not used in the right context, they can cause an inaccurate understanding of the main message conveyed by Rasulullah saw. as well as in the application of these hadiths nowadays.

*Second*, in terms of their relevance in the contemporary context, the meaning and application of the hadiths of music, painting, and dance must be in accordance with the times by taking into account human interests and needs. If the arts of music, painting, and dance actually have a positive impact on human life, then it is possible that the three arts can be applied. As for the context of the study of hadith, the merging of the three objects of discussion, namely the arts of music, painting, and dance along with the application of the theory of *Ma'na-Cum-Maghza* aims to make it easier for fans and reviewers of hadith to understand all three in the same study so that understanding of the three arts along with the hadiths related to it becomes more comprehensive.

## Supplementary Materials

The data presented in this study are available in [insert article or supplementary material here] (Usually the datasets were analyzed from library research can be found in the whole data references ).

## **Acknowledgements**

## **Authors' contributions**

All listed authors contributed to this article. N.N. wrote the original draft, reviewed and edited it, wrote the formal analysis, compiled the resources, conceptualised the study, and managed the project administration. D.N. was responsible for the methodology and validation and supervised the project

## **Data availability statement**

Data sharing is not applicable to this article as no new data were created or analysed in this study.

## **Conflict of interests**

None of the authors of this study has a financial or personal relationship with other people that could inappropriately influence or bias the content of the study.

## **Funding**

This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial or not-for-profit sectors.

## **References**

- Ahmad bin Hambal. "Musnad Ahmad, Kitab Baqi Musnad al-Mukasirina, Bab Musnad Anas bin Malik ra." CD al-Maktabah as-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- Akromusyuhada, Akhmad. "Seni Dalam Perspektif Al Quran dan Hadist." *Jurnal Tahdzibi* 3, no. 1 (2018): 1–6. <https://doi.org/10.24853/tahdzibi.3.1.1-6>.
- Al-Bukhari. "Sahih al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Asyabah, Bab Ma Ja`a Fiman Yastahillu al-Khamr wa Yusammih bi Ghairi Ismih." CD al-Maktabah al-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- . "Sahih al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Buyu', Bab Mukil ar-Riba." CD al-Maktabah as-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- . "Sahih al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Jami'ah, Bab al-Hirabi wa ad-Daraq Yauma al-'Id." CD al-Maktabah al-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.

- . “Sahih al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Manaqib, Bab Maqdami an-Nabi saw. wa Ashabihi al-Madinah.” CD al-Maktabah al-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- . “Sahih al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Salah, Bab as-Salah fi al-Bi’ah.” CD al-Maktabah al-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- Al-Ghazali, I mam. *Ihya` ‘Ulum ad-Din li I mami al-Ghazali, juz 2*. Semarang: PT. Karya Toha Putra, n.d.
- Al-Nawawi. “Syarah al-Nawawi ‘ala Muslim, Kitab Salah al-’Idaini, Bab ar-Rukhsah fi al-La’ibi al-Laz|i La Ma’siyah fih fi Ayyami al-’Id.” CD al-Maktabah al-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- Al-Qardhawi, Yusuf. *Halal dan Haram dalam Islam (terj.)*. Surabaya: PT. Bina Ilmu, 1980.
- . *Islam dan Seni (terj.)*. Bandung: Pustaka Hidayah, 2000.
- Amalia, Lia, Hani Nurhanisah, dan Agni Muftianti. “Pemanfaatan Media Bahan Alam Melalui Metode Buzz Group (Diskusi Kelompok Kecil) dalam Meningkatkan Kemampuan Siswa Berkaraya Seni Rupa Mozaik di Kelas III.” *COLLASE: Journal of Elementary Education* 02, no. 04 (2019).
- Anam, Khoirul. “Musik Spiritual (Telaah Filososfis).” Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel, Surabaya, 2017.
- As-Sabuni, Muhammad ‘Ali. *Rawai’u al-Bayani Tafsiru Ayati al-Abkami min al-Qura’ni*. Dimasyqi: Maktabah al-Ghazali, 1981.
- Baghdadi, Abdurrahman Al. *Seni Dalam Pandangan Islam: Seni Vocal, Musik, & Tari*. Jakarta: Gema Insani Press, 1991.
- Bedford, Ian. “The Interdiction of Music in Islam.” *Australian Journal of Anthropology* 12, no. 1 (2001).
- Bhattacharjee, Anuradha, dan Shadab Alam. “The Origin and Journey of Qawwali From Sacred Ritual to Entertainment?” *Journal of Creative Communications* 7, no. 3 (2012).
- Dawud, Abu. “Sunan Abi Dawud, Kitab al-Asyribah, Bab an-Nahyi ‘an al-Muskiri.” CD al-Maktabah al-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- Djidin, M., and Sahiron Syamsuddin. “INDONESIAN INTERPRETATION OF THE QUR’AN ON KHILĀFAH : The Case of Quraish Shihab and Yudian Wahyudi on Qur’an 2: 30-38.” *Al-Jami’ah* 57, no. 1 (2019).
- Hafizhahullah, Asy-Syaikh Alwi bin Abdul Qadir Assegaf. “Zammarah.” Ad-Durar as-Saniyyah – al-Mausu’ah al-H|adis|iyah. Diakses 11 Oktober 2021. dorar.net.
- Hambal, Ahmad bin. “Musnad Ahmad, Kitab Baqi Musnad al-Ansari, Bab Hadis|Buraidah al-Aslamiiyi ra.” CD al-Maktabah al-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- . “Musnad Ahmad, Kitab Musnad al-Mukasirina min al-Sahabah, Bab

- Musnad ‘Abdillah bin ‘Umar bin al-Khattab ra.,.” CD al-Maktabah al-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- Ibnu al-As|ir. *al-Nihayah fi Gharib al-Hadis| wa al-As|ar*. al-Qahirah: Dar Ibn al-Jauzi, 2016.
- Kalhor, Ghulam Yaseen. “The Role off Off-Grid Solar Electrification Sustainability in the Economic Growth of Pakistan.” Politecnico, Torino, 2021.
- Majah, Ibnu. “Sunan Ibnu Majah, Kitab al-Fitan, Bab al-’Uqubat.” CD al-Maktabah al-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- Makhluf, Hasanain Muhammad. *Kalimatul Qur`an-Tafsir Wa Bayan (terj)*. Bandung: Gema Risalah Press Bandung, 1992.
- Manzur, Ibn. *Lisan al-’Arab*. Kairo: Dar al-Ma’arif, n.d.
- Muslim. “Sahih Muslim, Kitab al-Libas wa al-Zinah, Bab Tahrimi Taswiri Surah al-Hayawani wa Tahrimi Ittikhaz|i Ma Fih Surah.” CD al-Maktabah al-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- . “Sahih Muslim, Kitab Salah al-’Idaini, Bab ar-Rukhsah fi al-La’ibi al-Laz|i La Ma’siyah fih fi Ayyami al-’Id,.” CD al-Maktabah al-Syamilah, Global Islamic Software, 2018.
- Nurjanah. “Perencanaan Komunikasi dalam Pengembangan Potensi Pariwisata Kabupaten Bengkalis.” *Jurnal Dakwah Risalah* 29, no. 2 (2018).
- Penyusun, Tim. *Al-Mausu’ah al-Fiqhiyyah, juz 23*. Al-Kuwait: Wizarah al-A`uqaf wa al-’Islamiyyah, 1996.
- Rahmaturrehman, Moh. Afnan. “Dimensi Mistik dalam Musik Qawwali (Studi terhadap Tarekat Chistiyah).” Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta, 2019.
- Rizvi, Saiyid Athar Abbas. *A History of Sufisme in India*. New Delhi: Munshiram Manoharial Publishers, 1978.
- Saeed, Bareera, dan Syeda Shahida Batool. “Experiences and Practices of Contemporary Sufis in Pakistan.” *Nust Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* 7, no. 1 (2021).
- Sidek, Roziah Sidikmat, Azmul Fahimi Kamaruzaman, and Mohd Jailani Abdulah. “Epistemology and Philosophy Related to Music Therapy from the Muslim Scholars’ Perspective.” *International Journal of Islamic Thought* 19, no. 1 (2021).
- Setiawan, Dedy. “Ekspresionistis sebagai Pendekatan Corak dalam Berkarya Seni Lukis.” Universitas Negeri Semarang, 2019.
- Suryani, Nika, dan Laila Fitriah. “Seni Pertunjukkan Tari Zapin Api Rupert Utara Bengkalis Provinsi Riau.” *Titian: Jurnal Ilmu Humaniora* 3, no. 1 (2019).
- Susono, Ponco. “Hebat! Seniman Klaten Sulap Pecahan Keramik jadi Mozaik Bergambar Tujuh Presiden RI.” Diakses 10 Desember 2021. [www.solopos.com](http://www.solopos.com).
- Syaiful, Sefrona. “Strategi Pengembangan Tari Zapin Api sebaga Daya Tari Wisata Budaya di Pulau Rupert Kabupaten Bengkalis.” *Intelektiva: Jurnal Ekonomi*,



- Sosial & Humaniora* 2, no. 12 (2021).
- Syahridawaty, Syahridawaty, and Saifudin Zuhri Qudsy. "The Contestation of Hadith Memes on the Prohibition of Music." *Journal of Hadith Studies* 2, no. 1 (2019).
- Syamsuddin, Sahiron. "Differing Respon to Westren Hermeneutic: A Comparative Critical Study of M. Quraish Shihab's and Muhammad 'Imara's Thoughts." *Al-Jami'ah* 59, no. 2 (2021).
- . "Muhkam and Mutashābih: An Analytical Study of Al-Tabari's and Al-Zamakhshari's Interpretations of Q.3:7." *Journal of Qur'anic Studies* 1, no. 1 (1999).
- . "Metode Penafsiran dengan Pendekatan Ma'na-Cum-Maghza." In *Pendekatan Ma'na-Cum-Maghza atas al-Qur'an dan Hadis: Menjawab Problematika Sosial Keagamaan di Era Kontemporer*, edited oleh Sahiron Syamsuddin. Yogyakarta: AIAT se-Indonesia kerja sama dengan Lembaga Ladang Kata, 2020.
- . "Pendekatan dan Analisis dalam Penelitian Teks Tafsir Sebuah Overview." *Subuf* 12, no. 1 (2019). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.22548/SHF.V12I1.409>.
- , ed. *Pendekatan Ma'na-Cum-Maghza atas al-Qur'an dan Hadis: Menjawab Problematika Sosial Keagamaan di Era Kontemporer*. Yogyakarta: AIAT se-Indonesia kerja sama dengan Lembaga Ladang Kata, 2020.
- Yulika, Febri. *Jejak Seni Dalam Sejarah Islam*. Padang Panjang: Institut Seni Indonesia Padang Panjang, 2016.