

The Rejection of Prophetic Traditions: Analyzing the Inkar Sunnah Movement in West Sumatra, Indonesia

Penolakan Terhadap Tradisi Kenabian: Analisis Gerakan Inkar Sunnah di Sumatra Barat, Indonesia

Luqmanul Hakim^(*) Suci Amalia Yasti^(*)Yassinta Ananda^(*)

^(*)Corresponding Author email, yassinta.ananda@uinib.ac.id

^(*)Universitas Islam Negeri Imam Bonjol, Jl Jendral Sudirman No. 15, Padang Pasir Kp. Ja, Padang Barat, Kota Padang, Sumatera Barat

Abstract

This article explores the ideological stance of the Inkar Sunnah movement, which rejects the prophetic traditions (Sunnah) as a source of Islamic law, focusing on its development in West Sumatra, Indonesia. Historically, this movement can be traced back to political and sectarian conflicts in early Islamic history, such as those involving the Khawarij, Shia, and Mu'tazilah sects. Over time, skepticism towards hadith, fueled by fabricated traditions and modern Orientalist critiques, gained traction. Prominent figures like Dalimi Lubis and Nazwar Syamsu have continued to propagate Inkar Sunnah beliefs in modern Indonesia, advocating that the Qur'an alone suffices for Islamic jurisprudence. This research adopts a qualitative library approach, analyzing primary texts by these figures and secondary sources on hadith scholarship. The study critically examines their arguments and the socio-political context that allowed their ideas to proliferate, as well as strategies to counter this ideological challenge within Indonesian Islamic discourse. The findings reveal a persistent tension between traditional Sunni orthodoxy and reformist interpretations that seek to minimize or outright reject the role of the Sunnah, posing significant implications for Islamic legal and theological frameworks.

Keywords: *Inkar Sunnah, Hadith, Islamic law, West Sumatra, Dalimi Lubis, Nazwar Syamsu, Qur'an, Sunnah rejection*

Abstrak

Artikel ini mengeksplorasi sikap ideologis gerakan Inkar Sunnah, yang menolak tradisi kenabian (Sunnah) sebagai sumber hukum Islam, dengan fokus pada perkembangannya di Sumatra Barat, Indonesia. Secara historis, gerakan ini dapat ditelusuri kembali ke konflik politik dan sektarian dalam sejarah awal Islam, seperti yang melibatkan sekte Khawarij, Syiah, dan Mu'tazilah. Seiring waktu, skeptisisme terhadap hadits, yang dipicu oleh tradisi yang dipalsukan dan kritik modern dari kalangan Orientalis, semakin berkembang. Tokoh-tokoh terkemuka seperti Dalimi Lubis dan Nazwar Syamsu terus menyebarkan keyakinan Inkar Sunnah di Indonesia, mengadvokasi bahwa Al-Qur'an saja sudah cukup untuk yurisprudensi Islam. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif dengan metode kepustakaan, menganalisis teks-teks primer dari tokoh-tokoh tersebut serta sumber-sumber sekunder tentang kajian hadits. Studi ini secara kritis memeriksa argumen mereka serta konteks sosial-politik yang memungkinkan gagasan-gagasan tersebut berkembang, sekaligus strategi untuk melawan tantangan ideologis ini dalam diskursus Islam Indonesia. Temuan penelitian ini mengungkapkan adanya ketegangan yang terus-menerus antara ortodoksi Sunni tradisional dan interpretasi reformis



yang berusaha meminimalkan atau bahkan menolak peran Sunnah, yang menimbulkan implikasi signifikan bagi kerangka hukum dan teologi Islam. tentang living Qur'an dan living tafsir.

Kata Kunci: *Inkar Sunnah, Hadits, Hukum Islam, Sumatra Barat, Dalimi Lubis, Nazwar Syamsu, Al-Qur'an, Penolakan Sunnah*

Introduction

Given that the Prophet's sunnah represents the second foundational aspect of Islamic teachings, it plays a significant role in interpreting Islamic law. This applies both when a legal issue is not directly addressed in the Qur'an or when clarification of existing law is required. However, within the Muslim community, there are individuals who believe that the Qur'an holds absolute authority as the sole source of Islamic law, leading them to reject either a portion or the entirety of the Prophet's sunnah. These individuals are often referred to as "Inkar Sunnah." The origins of this rejection can be traced back to political differences within early Muslim communities. The rise of sects such as the Khawarij, Shia, and Mu'tazilah marked the height of the challenges against the sunnah. Additionally, individuals fabricated hadith to support their ideological positions,¹ some for personal gain, which further fueled skepticism. The "Inkar Sunnah" movement viewed the Qur'an as a complete guide to life,² rendering the sunnah unnecessary. This perspective gained more traction in modern times, particularly among Orientalists, who argued that the sunnah lacked authenticity, as it was recorded posthumously. The author of this study explores these ongoing debates, particularly the view that the sunnah is redundant for establishing sharia law, as the Qur'an itself is deemed sufficient with its definitive (Qath'i) explanations.³

The rejection of the sunnah persists, despite scholars having explicitly refuted and criticized the arguments of those who hold this view.⁴ This belief continues to surface covertly in various media, including books, newspapers, and public announcements. Such ideas have spread across several regions in Indonesia, notably in West Java, with figures like Muhammad Irham Sutarto, in West Sumatra by Nazwar Syamsu and Dalimi Lubis, and in Jakarta by H. Abdurrahman. Nazwar Syamsu and Dalimi Lubis have long articulated their opposition to the sunnah, both verbally and

1 Luqmanul Hakim, *Inkar Sunnah Periode Klasik* (Jakarta: Hayfa Press, 2004).

2 Abdul Madjid Khon, "Ingkar Al-Sunnah Masa Klasik (Telaah Tentang Pokok-Pokok Pemikirannya)," *UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta* (1998).

3 Hakim, *Inkar Sunnah Periode Klasik*.

4 Fatihunnada Fatihunnada and Afni Miftah Khairunnisak, "Kritik Argumentasi Ingkar Sunnah Menurut Al-Buti," *Refleksi* 19, no. 2 (2020): 167–182.

through written works in books and magazines. Notably, these two figures not only reject the sunnah but also propagate their heterodox beliefs. Their steadfastness in rejecting the sunnah has led them to continuously seek new evidence and arguments to support their position. They have authored multiple books that promote their opposition.⁵ This research aims to delve into the views and arguments of Dalimi Lubis and Nazwar Syamsu concerning their rejection of the sunnah. It also explores the historical development of this ideology in West Sumatra and offers an analysis of appropriate strategies to counter the Inkar Sunnah movement in the region.

Based on a review of research related to the understanding and ideology of Inkar Sunnah, several previous studies have explored this topic. Khon's article discusses the key figures involved in the Inkar Sunnah movement and their views.⁶ Edi Safri's research examines the figure of Dalimi Lubis in Padang Panjang and the impact of his teachings.⁷ Handika's article provides a critical analysis of Ir. M. Ircham Sutarto's rejection of the sunnah.⁸ Nurfaizyani's work explores the ideological opposition of Kassim Ahmad and Nazwar Syamsu to the Prophet Muhammad's hadith.⁹ Mursidin's study addresses the sects, groups, and individuals who reject the sunnah, along with their reasons for doing so.¹⁰ Armayanti and her team trace the origins of Inkar Sunnah and explore the figures and their thoughts.¹¹ Afwadzi delves into the epistemology behind Kassim Ahmad's Inkar Sunnah.¹² Zainuddin critiques Sahih al-Bukhari by examining the views of Rashid Ailal, who dismisses Sahih al-Bukhari as a collection of fairy tales.¹³ Zarkasih's article investigates the Inkar Sunnah groups in Indonesia that reject all aspects of the sunnah and how their

5 Edi Safri, *Melacak Pandangan Dalimi Lubis Tentang Penolakannya Terhadap Sunnah (Kajian Kasus Penganut Paham Ingkar Al-Sunnah Di Padang Panjang)* (Padang: Baitul Hikmah Press, 2001).

6 Abdul Madjid Khon, "Paham Ingkar Sunnah Di Indonesia," *Jurnal Theologia* 23, no. 1 (2017): 57–74.

7 Safri, *Melacak Pandangan Dalimi Lubis Tentang Penolakannya Terhadap Sunnah (Kajian Kasus Penganut Paham Ingkar Al-Sunnah Di Padang Panjang)*.

8 Caca Handika, "Ingkar Al-Sunnah Di Indonesia (Studi Analisis Tentang Pemikiran Ingkar Sunnah Ir. M. Ircham Sutarto)," *Al-Din: Jurnal Dakwah dan Sosial Keagamaan* 4, no. 1 (2019): 35–46.

9 Nurfaizyani Nurfaizyani, "Ingkar Hadis Di Indonesia Dan Malaysia (Studi Konparatif Pemikiran Hadis Nazwar Syamsu Dan Kassim Ahmad)," *An-Nida'* 43, no. 1 (2019): 101.

10 Ida Ilmiah Mursidin, "Ingkar Sunnah (Argumen Dan Tokohnya)," *Jurnal Ilmu Hadits* 1, no. 1 (2022): 1–21.

11 Dona Armayanti, "Ingkar Sunnah: Asal Usul Dan Perkembangan Pemikiran Ingkar Sunnah Di Dunia Islam," *Tashdiq: Jurnal Kajian Agama dan Dakwah* 2, no. 1 (2023): 41–50.

12 Benny Afwadzi, "Epistemologi Ingkar Al-Sunnah: Telaah Pemikiran Kassim Ahmad," *Al-Furqan: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Tafsir* 1, no. 2 (2018): 121–144.

13 Zainuddin, "Ailal Rashid's Critical Contribution to Sahih Al-Bukhari in the Book of Sahih Al-Bukhari Nihayah Usturah," *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Hadis* 23, no. 1 (2022): 1–18.

teachings deviate from mainstream Islamic beliefs.¹⁴ Further, Imam al-Shafi'i's¹⁵ and al-A'zami's¹⁶ works provide essential references for understanding hadith and sunnah studies. Despite these numerous studies, no explicit research has yet focused on the Inkar Sunnah ideology in West Sumatra. Given the presence of several prominent figures in this region who reject the Prophet's hadith and disseminate their ideas covertly,¹⁷ this topic warrants further investigation.

This study employs a qualitative library research method with a descriptive analysis approach, focusing on the arguments presented by two Inkar Sunnah figures in West Sumatra concerning their views on the sunnah during the period of 1983-1990. The primary sources for this research include the works of Dalimi Lubis and Nazwar Syamsu, which are available in the form of books, video and audio recordings, magazines, newspapers, and other scientific writings. Secondary sources, such as hadith collections and gray literature, provide additional context regarding the Inkar Sunnah ideology and the role of the sunnah in Islam, aiding the thoroughness of the research. In the data collection process, the author compiles all available materials by Dalimi Lubis and Nazwar Syamsu. The gathered data is then subjected to a descriptive analysis, allowing for a detailed explanation of their ideological stance and the arguments they employed to reject the sunnah as the second source of Islamic teachings after the Qur'an.

Understanding Inkar Sunnah: Definition, History, and Impacts

The term "Inkar Sunnah" is composed of two words: "inkar" and "sunnah." The word "inkar" derives from the Arabic root: اركان ركني ركننا, which carries several meanings, such as not recognizing, not accepting either verbally or internally, being unaware or ignorant of something, or rejecting what does not align with one's desires.¹⁸ "Sunnah," in linguistic terms, refers to a path or way that is followed, whether deemed good or bad.¹⁹ According to Abu Rayyah, whose views are consistent with earlier scholars, the sunnah encompasses everything attributed to

14 Muhammad Ibrahim Ahmad Saif, "Denying Tyranny According to Quran and Sunnah" (2007), <https://repository.najah.edu/handle/20.500.11888/8193>.

15 Muhammad bin Idris As-Syafi'i, *Al-Umm* (Beirut: Dar Al-Ma'rifah, 1975).

16 Mushtafa Muhammad Azami, *Dirasat Fi Al-Hadis Al-Nabawi Wa Tarikh Tadwinibi* (Beirut: Al-Maktab Al-Islami, 1980).

17 Handika, "Ingkar Al-Sunnah Di Indonesia (Studi Analisis Tentang Pemikiran Ingkar Sunnah Ir. M. Ircham Sutarto)."

18 Abdul Madjid Khon, *Ulumul Hadis* (jakarta: Amzah, 2020), hlm. 31.

19 Ibid., hlm. 5.

the Prophet Muhammad (SAW), including his sayings, actions, and approvals.²⁰ Ajjāj al-Khaṭīb further elaborates that the sunnah encompasses all aspects originating from the Prophet (SAW), such as his speech, actions, physical characteristics, behavior, and life history, both before and after he was appointed as a Prophet, including his worship practices in the Cave of Hira.²¹

In terminological terms, “Inkar Sunnah” refers to the rejection of some or all of the teachings and practices taught by the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) in relation to the sunnah. Those who reject the sunnah often develop specific strategies, leading to partial or complete rejection by certain groups or individuals.²² According to Abdul Majid Khon, Inkar Sunnah is a philosophy that arose among a minority of Muslims who dismiss the application of Islamic law based on the saheeh (authentic) sunnah, whether practical or formalistic, and whether systematized by scholars through mutawatir (widely transmitted) or ahad (individually transmitted) reports. These rejections often occur without legitimate reasons, as recognized by scholars.²³ The practical sunnah involves actions derived directly from the Qur’an (sunnah amaliyah), while the formalistic sunnah encompasses the sunnah that has been explained through various traditions.²⁴

Rejection of the entire sunnah is not always implied by the term “Inkar Sunnah.” It can also encompass the rejection of specific parts of the sunnah, such as the dismissal of particular methods or views developed by certain groups, both past and present, which are not recognized by scholars of hadith and fiqh.²⁵ Therefore, the term may refer not only to total rejection but also to the refusal of particular aspects of the sunnah. Imam al-Shafi’i categorized those who reject the sunnah into three groups: the first group rejects all sunnah; the second group accepts only the traditions explicitly mentioned in the Qur’an; and the third group acknowledges only mutawatir traditions (those passed down by a large number of narrators) while rejecting ahad traditions (those not reaching the mutawatir level).²⁶ Each of these groups has its own rationale and reasoning to support their views. Generally, two main categories

20 Mahmud Abu Rayyah, *Adwa’ Ala Al-Sunnah Al-Muhammadiyah* (Makkah: Dar Al-Ma’arif, 1957), hlm. 38–39.

21 Syarifah Mudrikah and Imamul Authon Nur, “Pasang Surut Inkar Sunnah: Studi Analisis Pada Masa Klasik Dan Modern,” *Al-Bukhari: Jurnal Ilmu Hadis* 3, no. 1 (2020): 131.

22 Daud Rasyid, *Sunnah Di Barwah Ancaman: Dari Snouck Hugronje Hingga Harun Nasution* (bandung: Syaamil, 2006).

23 Abdul Madjid Khon, *Pemikiran Modern Dalam Sunnah: Pendekatan Ilmu Hadis* (Jakarta: Kencana, 2001), hlm. 20.

24 Ibid., hlm. 23.

25 Rasyid, hlm. 5.

26 Agus Solahuddin and Agus Suryadi, *Ulumul Hadis* (bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2008).

of sunnah rejection are recognized: those who deny the sunnah entirely and those who accept only mutawatir traditions while rejecting ahad traditions. The first and third groups are fundamentally similar, as both deny traditions of ahad and mutawatir levels, while the second group accepts only those that align with the Qur'an.²⁷

Imam Al-Shafi'i argued that disregarding the sunnah would lead to the collapse of essential Islamic teachings. For instance, the command to pray is significant, but its proper performance, including specific actions and procedures, is detailed through the Prophet's traditions. The Qur'an provides general commands such as establishing prayer and paying zakat, but it is through the sunnah that details, like how to pray, the nisab (minimum wealth subject to zakat), and the method of payment, are clarified. Without the guidance of the sunnah, zakat could theoretically be implemented without adherence to the specific nisab or percentage obligations.²⁸ The Inkar Sunnah movement, therefore, poses a serious threat to the preservation of these teachings and negatively impacts the broader Muslim community, particularly laypeople. Many Muslims perceive this rejection as a betrayal, leading to strong feelings of resentment. Imam Al-Shafi'i also stressed the necessity of repentance for those who reject the sunnah,²⁹ as such actions can undermine the Prophet Muhammad's sunnah as a source of Islamic law.³⁰ However, those within the Inkar Sunnah movement do not view themselves as rejecting the sunnah; they hold a different perspective and definition regarding its role.

The rejection of the sunnah, which has persisted throughout Islamic history, continues to affect the Muslim community. This phenomenon has led some Muslims to question the authority of the Prophet Muhammad's sunnah as a source of Islamic law, evidenced by the increasing number of its proponents. Initially, this belief was limited to individuals, but over time it grew and formed organized groups with their own ideas reinforcing this ideology.³¹ Ayyub Al-Sakhtiyani (d. 131 AH) warned against such a trend, saying that anyone who insists on learning only from the Qur'an and disregards the hadith is misguided.³² The rejection of the sunnah has existed since the early days of Islam, gradually evolving from a partial denial of the hadith into a more organized movement. This progression often stems from ignorance of

27 As-Syafi'i, *Al-Umm*, hlm. 250–257.

28 Luqmanul Hakim, *Inkar Sunnah Periode Klasik* (Jakarta: Hayfa Press, 2004), hlm. 76.

29 As-Syafi'i, *Al-Umm*, hlm. 259–267.

30 Hakim, *Inkar Sunnah Periode Klasik*, hlm. 77.

31 Hakim, hlm. 76.

32 Al-Khatib Al-Baghdadi, *Al-Kifayah Fi 'Ilm Ar-Riwayah* (Beirut: Al-Maktabah Al-'Ilmiyah, 1358), hlm. 16.

hadith and the Prophet's teachings.³³ A notable incident involved the companion Imran bin Husain (d. 52 AH), who, when confronted by someone who asked him to rely solely on the Qur'an, responded by highlighting the necessity of the hadith for understanding practices such as the number of rak'ahs in 'Asr prayer and the required laps between Safa and Marwa. The individual, after realizing the importance of the sunnah, later became a jurist.³⁴

One of the key scholars who extensively discussed hadith is Al-Shafi'i, particularly in his works *Al-Umm* and *Al-Risalah* (written around 204 AH/820 CE). In these texts, Al-Shafi'i lays out the conceptual foundation for the understanding of hadith within the broader context of Islamic teachings. In *Al-Risalah*, he elaborates on the relationship between the Qur'an and hadith, asserting that both hold equal authority, as the Prophet's commands are considered to originate from God. Al-Shafi'i also addresses the weaknesses in the arguments of those who reject the authority of the hadith and emphasizes the need to uphold the importance of hadith while always returning to the Qur'an for guidance. In *Al-Umm*, a dedicated section titled *Jima' Al-'Ilm* presents Al-Shafi'i's views on individuals who question the legitimacy of hadith as a source of Islamic teachings. Through these works, Al-Shafi'i sought to resolve the growing doubts and uncertainties regarding the role of hadith in Islam.³⁵

During the classical period, the trend of rejecting the traditions of the Prophet Muhammad gradually declined. Al-Shafi'i's efforts in refuting the arguments of those who opposed the sunnah, using both scientific and rational evidence, played a significant role in curbing this phenomenon. According to Mustafa Muhammad Al-A'zami, by the third century AH, individuals or groups who ignored the hadith began to disappear. However, the neglect and rejection of the sunnah re-emerged in the 13th century Hijri, largely due to the effects of Western imperialism.³⁶ During this period, several mujaddids (reformers) questioned or rejected certain hadiths entirely. The revival of sunnah rejection in the modern era was different from its earlier manifestations, with modern denials often stemming from the influence of Western modernization and colonialism, particularly in countries like Egypt.³⁷

The rejection of the sunnah in earlier periods was largely a result of a lack of understanding regarding the role and significance of hadith in Islamic teachings. This

33 Abbas Langaji, *Ingkar Hadits* (yogyakarta: Madani, 2021), hlm. 62.

34 Al-Hakim An-Naisaburi, *Al-Mustadrak Ala Ash-Shahihain* (banjarmasin: Dar Al-Ma'rifat, 2006), hlm. 109–110.

35 Muhammad bin Idris As-Syafi'i, *Jima' Al-'Ilm* (Madinah: Dar Al-Atsar, 2002), hlm. 230.

36 Azami, *Dirasat Fi Al-Hadis Al-Nabawi Wa Tarikh Tadwinibi*, hlm. 510.

37 Daniel W. Brown, *Rethinking Tradition in Modern Islamic Thought*, Cambridge University Press (London, 1996), hlm. 3.

period also coincided with Western hegemony and the European colonization of parts of the Islamic world. These factors, combined with political and religious weaknesses within Muslim societies, fostered a strong desire for reform. There was an effort to reshape Islamic legal and social institutions in a way that would accommodate both Islamic values and Western principles. This push for reform led to a critical re-examination of the foundations of religious authority, particularly with respect to hadith. The aim was to adapt Islam to the needs of the time, while preserving its core teachings and principles.³⁸

Prominent figures identified as sunnah deniers in the modern era include Muhammad Abduh (1849-1905 CE), Sayyid Rashid Ridha (1865-1935 CE), Ahmad Amin (d. 1929 CE), Tawfiq Shidqy (1881-1920 CE), Mahmud Abu Rayyah, Ahmad Subhi Manshur (1988 CE), and Mushthafa Mahmud (b. 1921 CE), all of whom hailed from Egypt. In India and Pakistan, figures such as Ahmad Khan (d. 1897 CE), Maulevi Abdullah Jakrlevi (1839-1918 CE), Khawarij Ahmad Din Amritsari (1861-1933 CE), Abdullah Al-Jakr, Chiragh Ali (1844-1898 CE), and Ahmad Parwez became notable.³⁹ Additionally, Malaysia saw the rise of Kassim Ahmad, former chairman of the Socialist People's Party of Malaysia (PSRM). Kassim Ahmad authored *Hadith: An Initial Appraisal*, in which he categorically rejects the hadith, criticizes the Prophet Muhammad's dignity, denies the authority of renowned scholars such as Imam Al-Shafi'i, Imam Al-Bukhari, and Imam Muslim, and bases his understanding of Islam solely on personal logic and reasoning. He advocates for preventing division among Muslims and asserts that the Prophet Muhammad left only the Qur'an as his legacy, excluding hadith. According to Kassim, the Prophet's sole responsibility was to convey the message of Islam, as repeatedly emphasized in the Qur'an.⁴⁰

In response to Kassim Ahmad's book, several critical papers have been published, such as *Explanation of Hadith* and *KOD 19 and Hadith Investigation Panel Kelantan Ugama Islam: Hadith Misconceptions, An Explanation*, curated by Mahyuddin Haji Yahya. Umar Yunus noted that Kassim Ahmad caused significant unrest in Malaysia, which included stepping down as chairman of the PSRM and announcing his intention to join the UMNO Party, despite his previous hostility toward it. Additionally, Kassim published a book rejecting the hadith as a source of Islamic teachings. Kassim Ahmad is now seen as largely disconnected from religious matters, and his religious involvement and knowledge are often questioned. Angkatan

38 Ibid.

39 Langaji, *Ingkar Hadits*, hlm. 68.

40 Kassim Ahmad, *Hadis Satu Penilaian Semula* (Kuala Lumpur, 1986), hlm. 76.

Belia Islam Malaysia (ABIM) criticized Kassim Ahmad's 131-page book, stating that it contradicts Islamic teachings and that its contents cannot be justified by either scientific or Islamic scholarly methods.

Those who reject the sunnah often maintain individualistic perspectives and do not identify themselves as mujtahids or mujaddids, although the majority of sunnah deniers are part of organized groups. In the classical era, individuals who initially rejected the sunnah frequently retracted their views upon recognizing their error. In contrast, during the modern period, many who reject the sunnah remain steadfast in their position, even after being informed about the significance of hadith as a vital source of Islamic teachings. Some even disseminate their ideas covertly despite official prohibitions by local governments. This reflects the ongoing debate concerning the role and authority of the sunnah, which continues to have complex implications for modern Islamic society.⁴¹

The spread of the *Inkar Sunnah* ideology in West Sumatra is believed to have begun with the publication of Nazwar Syamsu's book *Al-Qur'an Essential Logical Questions and Answers (Tawheed and Akal Series)*, released by Ghalia Indonesia in 1976. This book represents one example of a viewpoint that rejects sources of Islamic teachings other than the Qur'an. Nazwar Syamsu's work is rooted in a literal interpretation of Qur'anic verses. The subsequent reprinting and widespread distribution of this and other similar works between 1976 and 1985 indicate a significant public interest in rejecting other sources of Islamic teachings beyond the Qur'an. This reflects a broader trend of challenging traditional religious authority and advocating for a return to the primary sources of Islam, as interpreted by a particular ideology.⁴²

In 1980, Ahmad Husnan published a book titled *The Movement Against the Sunnah and Its Answer*. This publication was a response to the growing *Inkar Sunnah* movement in Indonesia, indicating that the rejection of the sunnah had been developing for some time. The spread of *Inkar Sunnah* in Indonesia can be traced back to the mid-1970s, corroborated by the distribution of Nazwar Syamsu's works starting in 1976 and the release of Ahmad Husnan's first book in 1980. These events reflect the rising concern over the rejection of the sunnah within Indonesian society during this period. Additionally, reports of activities promoting sunnah-rejecting ideologies across various regions in Indonesia further support the conclusion that discussions around the role and authority of the sunnah had become a significant

41 Ali Musthafa Yaqub, *Kritik Hadis* (yogyakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1995), hlm. 46.

42 Langaji, *Ingkar Hadits*, hlm. 71.

part of religious discourse in the country during that time.⁴³

Around 1980, the concept of *Inkar Sunnah* became more widely recognized in Indonesia. Zufran Rahman, a lecturer at IAIN Jambi and a researcher of *Inkar Sunnah* thought, highlighted this in his studies conducted in 1982 and 1983. However, evidence suggests that the movement may have appeared earlier, with figures like H. Endi Suradi leading similar efforts in Bogor by 1981. Zufran Rahman's research indicates that the movement gained broader public attention in the early 1980s.⁴⁴ Meanwhile, H. Sanwani mentions that Pasar Rumpit was established in November 1982, but its relevance seems to be more socio-economic rather than directly tied to the *Inkar Sunnah* movement. Nevertheless, Pasar Rumpit might have been a venue for discussing religious topics, including *Inkar Sunnah*, whether openly or discreetly. According to the orientalist Snouck Hurgronje, orientalist books had long been circulating in Indonesia, likely distributed covertly before 1980. The ideas introduced in these books, and the subsequent discussions among their readers, may have contributed to the emergence of the *Inkar Sunnah* movement. Hurgronje observed that deviations from mainstream Islam in Indonesia often stemmed from exposure to foreign ideas, introduced through literature or direct interaction with outside thinkers.⁴⁵

Indonesia became a key focus for the development of *Inkar Sunnah* following its emergence in India and Egypt. The concept of *Inkar Sunnah* was introduced to India with the intention of weakening the spirit of jihad among Muslims and diminishing Islam's influence from within. This spread was facilitated by the collaboration between British colonists and Indonesian Islamic figures who promoted these ideas. The British, as colonial rulers in India, likely saw *Inkar Sunnah* as a tool to reduce Muslim militancy and weaken their unity. After gaining ground in India, orientalist thought began to proliferate in Egypt, which was seen as a pivotal intellectual and religious hub of the Islamic world. The strategic focus on Egypt was based on the belief that influencing thought there would have a ripple effect throughout the broader Muslim world. Orientalists conducted scientific research to support their perspectives, and these findings were often published in books that presented Islam with a certain bias. These books were introduced into major educational institutions, including Al-Azhar, one of the oldest and most influential

43 Langaji, hlm. 71.

44 Zufran Rahman, *Sunnah Nabi SAW Sebagai Sumber Hukum Islam (Jawaban Terhadap Inkar Sunnah)* (Jakarta: CV Pedoman Ilmu Jaya, 1995), hlm. 162.

45 Abdul Majid Khon, *Pemikiran Modern Dalam Sunnah: Pendekatan Ilmu Hadis* (Jakarta: Kencana, 2011), hlm. 100.

centers of Islamic education globally.⁴⁶

Following Egypt, Indonesia, with the largest Muslim population in the world, became the next focus for the modern *Inkar Sunnah* movement. Around 1980, the ideas associated with *Inkar Sunnah* began to spread across various regions in Indonesia. The movement reached its peak between 1983 and 1985, causing significant debate and drawing attention in newspapers and magazines. Jakarta became the central hub of the movement, with its influence extending to Bogor (West Java), Tegal (Central Java), and West Sumatra. The dissemination of *Inkar Sunnah* ideas occurred through multiple channels, including religious lectures in mosques, the distribution of leaflets, speeches recorded on cassette tapes, and the publication of books.⁴⁷

The Qur'anic recitation group, named Majelis Qur'ani, gained significant popularity, particularly in Jakarta. They established their presence in several mosques, including the Asy-Syifa' Mosque at Cipto Mangunkusumo General Hospital, Jakarta. H. Abdurrahman led the recitations in various locations, such as Pedurenan Kuningan, usually held after Maghrib prayers, and attracted many attendees. Notably, congregational prayers were shortened to two rak'ahs, as the ustad reasoned that the inclusion of azan and iqamah contradicted the Qur'an. This practice was also observed by Ust. H. Sanwani, a local leader, who had ceased reciting the azan and iqamah for prayers, continuing the two-rak'ah format as instructed by H. Abdurrahman.⁴⁸

The *Inkar Sunnah* movement has spread its teachings in many regions, utilizing a variety of mediums to reach a broader audience. They distribute their ideas through numerous published books and cassette recordings. Lukman Sa'ad, originally from Padang Panjang, West Sumatra, is one of the prominent figures involved. With a degree from IAIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Sa'ad also directs a publishing company. Initially, he manually printed books but later expanded operations with a modern printing press imported from the Netherlands. This technology is used to produce materials that reject the sunnah. Another key figure, M. Irham Sutarto, the head of the Labor Union at Unilever Indonesia in Cibubur, West Java, authored the first book advocating *Inkar Sunnah* ideas, initially handwritten before its publication faced calls for a ban.⁴⁹

46 Abdul Madjid Khon, "Paham Ingkar Sunnah Di Indonesia (Studi Tentang Pemikirannya)," *Teologia* 23, no. 1 (2021): 58.

47 Khon, *Pemikiran Modern Dalam Sunnah: Pendekatan Ilmu Hadis*, hlm. 101.

48 Zarkasih, "Inkar Sunnah: Asal Usul Dan Perkembangan Pemikiran Inkar Sunnah di Dunia Islam."

49 Zarkasih, "Inkar Sunnah: Asal Usul Dan Perkembangan Pemikiran Inkar Sunnah Di Dunia Islam," hlm. 14.

The Rise of Inkar Sunnah in West Sumatra: Key Figures and Ideologies

West Sumatra stands out for preserving its Minangkabau cultural heritage and traditions. However, when scholars returned from Saudi Arabia with a desire to cleanse the religion of what they saw as deviant practices, the community's adherence to these traditions was put to the test. The Padri movement, which aimed at religious purification, became the first radical religious faction in West Sumatra and possibly in the entire archipelago. Despite this, the region's matrilineal tradition endured through the civil war that resulted from this conflict. A compromise was eventually achieved between the traditional adat group and the reform movement led by Tuanku Imam Bonjol, encapsulated in the principle "Adat Basandi Syarak, Syarak Basandi Adat." Religion in West Sumatra has since produced assertive and dynamic leaders, many of whom gained recognition both locally and globally. However, the growth of religious leaders has coincided with the rise of various sects or groups that diverge from orthodox religious practices.⁵⁰

The Inkar Sunnah movement is one of the groups that has gained attention in West Sumatra. While detailed research on the origins of this movement in the region is limited, previous studies on Inkar Sunnah in Indonesia indicate that one of its key proponents hailed from West Sumatra. The dissemination of their ideas relied heavily on printed materials such as books, newspapers, and magazines, which helped spread these views to a broader audience. The use of print media played a significant role in advancing the Inkar Sunnah movement in West Sumatra. The reception of Inkar Sunnah was varied, with some individuals critically engaging with the ideas while others rejected them entirely. This movement sparked discussions and debates among scholars and intellectuals in the region. Two notable figures associated with Inkar Sunnah in West Sumatra are Dalimi Lubis and Nazwar Syamsyu. To gain a better understanding of their perspectives, it is essential to explore their biographies and ideologies in more detail.

Dalimi Lubis

Dalimi Lubis was born in 1940 in Paraman Ampalu, Pasaman Regency, West Sumatra, into a religiously committed family. His father, Labai Abbas Mukmin, was a teacher at Madrasah Ibtidaiyah and a Da'i, illustrating the family's dedication to both education and religion.⁵¹ Dalimi's early education, like that of his six siblings,

50 M. Agus Noormani, "Perkembangan Aliran/Paham Keagamaan Di Sumatera Barat," *Jurnal Multikultural dan Multireligius* 13, no. 1 (2014): 174.

51 Safri, *Melacak Pandangan Dalimi Lubis Tentang Penolakannya Terhadap Sunnah (Kajian Kasus Penganut Paham Inkar Al-Sunnah Di Padang Panjang)*, hlm. 11.

was shaped by the religious atmosphere at home. He began his formal schooling at Muhammadiyah Mu'allimin Folk School in Ujung Gading, Pasaman, where he studied for three years. Following this, he continued at Madrasah Ibtidaiyah in Pasaman Ampalu. After completing his studies there, Dalimi pursued further education at the Religious Teacher Education (PGA) school, again in Pasaman Ampalu, underscoring his family's focus on a strong religious foundation for him and his siblings.⁵²

Dalimi Lubis followed in his father's path by becoming a religious teacher, appointed by the Ministry of Religious Affairs and assigned to teach at the Silaping Folk School, near his birthplace. His qualifications from the Religious Teacher Education (PGA) enabled him to fulfill this role from 1962 to 1965. In 1965, he pursued further education at the Muhammadiyah College of Tarbiyah in Padang Panjang, majoring in Aqidah and Akhlak, while also teaching at the Muhammadiyah People's School. By 1971, Dalimi had completed his baccalaureate studies, reflecting his commitment to both advancing his education and contributing to religious education in the community.⁵³

Dalimi Lubis continued to teach at the Muhammadiyah People's School in Padang Panjang until 1970, after which he transitioned to a role as a religious educator at the Padang Panjang State Elementary School. Following his undergraduate education, he began teaching at the Padang Panjang State Girls Vocational School and the Upper Family Welfare School. His career as a religious teacher expanded across various institutions, demonstrating his dedication to religious education in Padang Panjang. In 1976, he moved to the Padang Panjang State Teacher Education School, where he remained until 1982, when government policy led to the school's closure. After two decades of teaching, Dalimi Lubis transitioned to administrative work at the Padang Panjang Religious Affairs Department Office, eventually becoming the Head of the Islamic Tamaddun Subdivision before retiring in 1996.⁵⁴ Alongside his civil service duties, Dalimi's passion for learning drove him to pursue further education. He enrolled at the Faculty of Ushuluddin at IAIN Imam Bonjol Padang in 1979, majoring in Aqidah and Philosophy, and successfully graduated in 1985.⁵⁵

According to muhaddisin and scholars of ushul, hadith or sunnah is defined as "everything attributed to the Prophet SAW, including his words, actions,

52 Safri, hlm. 12.

53 Safri, hlm. 12.

54 Safri, hlm. 12.

55 Safri, hlm. 13.

approvals (taqrir), and characteristics” as a foundational source of Islamic teachings.⁵⁶ However, Dalimi Lubis rejects this formulation, basing his disagreement on his interpretation of specific Qur’anic verses that mention “hadith” and “sunnah.” He argues that the term “sunnah” only refers to sunnatullah, God’s decree, and not to the actions or traditions of the Prophet.⁵⁷ Dalimi supports this view by citing verses such as QS. 3:137, 17:77, 8:38, 18:55, and 33:38, where the term “sunnah” appears in reference to God’s laws. Additionally, Dalimi claims that none of the 28 Qur’anic verses containing the term “hadith” support its use in reference to the sayings of the Prophet, challenging the traditional interpretations by hadith scholars. This perspective reflects Dalimi’s critical stance toward conventional understandings of these terms within Islamic discourse.⁵⁸

Dalimi argues that the hadith of the Prophet, when viewed in the context of Qur’anic verses that mention the term “hadith,” refers to the message delivered by the Messenger as part of his duty to convey the revelation. He contends that the tradition of the Prophet (sunnah) is none other than the Qur’an itself, as it is the word delivered by the Messenger. This, according to Dalimi, is the true meaning of hadith.⁵⁹ In his writings,⁶⁰ he acknowledges that the words, actions, attitudes, and approvals of the Prophet, as recorded in hadith and historical accounts, may be referred to as the Prophet’s hadith. However, he asserts that these do not represent the true hadith, which, in his view, is solely the hadith of Allah, found in the Qur’an.⁶¹

Dalimi Lubis is recognized by M. Djamaluddin, an Indonesian figure committed to combating sunnah rejection, as a leader of the movement opposing the sunnah in West Sumatra. Through various forms of media—articles, books, and cassette recordings—Dalimi Lubis promoted the idea that the sunnah should not be followed. PT Ghalia Indonesia played a role in distributing his writings and lectures.⁶² One of his notable articles, which critiques Abu Hurairah RA, a prominent hadith narrator, was published in *Suara Muhammadiyah* magazine in 1995. Additionally, his book titled *Alam Barzakh and the Law in Islam Only the Quran* was published on

56 Muhammad ‘Ajjaj Al-Khatib, *Ushul Al-Hadits, Ulumuhunwa Musthlabahu* (Beirut: Dar Al-Kutub, 1989).

57 Dalimi Lubis, “Mempertanyakan Eksistensi Hadits/Sunnah Nabi Dalam Ajaran Islam,” n.d. (Naskah Buku Belum Diterbitkan, hanya disimpan secara Pribadi)

58 Safri, *Melacak Pandangan Dalimi Lubis Tentang Penolakannya Terhadap Sunnah (Kajian Kasus Penganut Paham Ingkar Al-Sunnah Di Padang Panjang)*, hlm. 18.

59 Lubis, “Mempertanyakan Eksistensi Hadits/Sunnah Nabi Dalam Ajaran Islam,” hlm. 5–6.

60 Lubis, “Alam Barzakh (Alam Kubur),” hlm. 10.

61 Lubis, “Mempertanyakan Eksistensi Hadits/Sunnah Nabi Dalam Ajaran Islam,” hlm. 6.

62 Makhfud Makhfud, “Meninjau Ulang Signifikansi Kedudukan Hadits Dan Ingkar Al-Sunnah,” *Tribakti: Jurnal Pemikiran Keislaman* 28, no. 1 (2017): 47–68.

May 13, 1995. However, this book, particularly under the title *Alam Barzakh*, was banned from circulation by the Muhammadiyah Central Leadership through Decree Number Kep-085/J.A/9/1985.⁶³

Nazwar Syamsu

Nazwar Syamsu, a prolific author, has written twelve books, all of which reflect his defense of the sunnah in West Sumatra. His notable works include titles such as *The Qur'an on Man and Society*, *Man and Economics*, *The Qur'an on Al-Insan*, *Mecca and Hajj*, *Prayer, Fasting and Time*, *The Qur'an Basic Scientific Questions and Answers*, *Complement to the Qur'an Basic Scientific Questions and Answers*, *The Qur'an and the History of Mankind*, and *Comparative Religion (Qur'an and Bible)*. In addition to these, he translated the Qur'an in a two-volume work titled *Tafsir*, compiled a *Dictionary of the Qur'an*, and published *Correction of Qur'anic Translations: The Noble Reading of HB Yassin*. A newspaper later reported that the Indonesian Ministry of Religious Affairs recommended 23 cassette titles, indicating the extent of his influence and contributions.⁶⁴

The recommended cassettes cover various topics such as “Living the Laws of Religion,” “Obeying God’s Laws,” “Faith and Islam, the Hereafter,” “The Dead and the Torment of the Grave,” “The Origin of Man,” “Jesus and the Interplanetary,” and “Adam and the Interplanetary,” among others. One cassette titled *Obeying God’s Law* addresses issues like false and fabricated hadiths. It argues that much of the conflict between Islamic caliphates arose from reliance on inauthentic hadiths, with claims that Jewish trickery played a role in this confusion. The cassettes assert that modern Muslims lack clear knowledge of Ahlusunnah Wal Jamaah, which is often just a label. The four madhhabs—Al-Shafi’i, Hanbali, Maliki, and Hanafi—are criticized for neglecting the Prophetic hadith as the basis for Islamic law. Additionally, the idea that the first human was a woman born from a meteor and who lived in Muntaha is rejected, with the Qur'an and the Prophet Muhammad’s traditions affirming that Prophet Adam was the first human, created by God from the ground.⁶⁵

Nazwar Syamsu has translated 30 juz of the Qur'an, with some interpretations that have been considered misleading by critics such as M. Amin Djamaluddin. Examples of these include translations of QS. Al-Baqarah/2:63 as “We raised the aurora above you” (interpreting aurora as a rainbow or a glittering object made by the Israelites), QS. Ali Imran/3:136 as “And the heavens that move day and night

63 Langaji, *Ingkar Hadits*, hlm. 73.

64 Langaji, hlm. 73.

65 Armayanti, “Inkar Sunnah: Asal Usul Dan Perkembangan Pemikiran Inkar Sunnah Di Dunia Islam.”

underneath,” and QS. Ali Imran/3:181 as “And their killing on the basis of rumors without a just cause.”⁶⁶ In Nazwar Syamsu’s view, the Qur’an serves as the sole, reliable source of moral guidance for Muslims. He argues that the Qur’an provides all the necessary instructions to live a righteous and civilized life.⁶⁷ In his book *The Quran on Humanity and Society*, Nazwar explores this idea in two parts: one addressing obedience to Allah’s commands and the other focusing on embodying the provisions of Islamic law.⁶⁸

Nazwar Syamsu strongly believes that using legal sources outside of the Qur’an constitutes acts of polytheism, disbelief, injustice, and wickedness. He bases this view on several verses of the Qur’an, particularly Surah Al-Maidah, verses 44, 45, and 47. For Nazwar, the Qur’an is the sole legitimate source of Islamic law, and he rejects the inclusion of additional sources, such as hadith, as part of authentic Islamic teachings. In his view, while the hadith and the Prophet Muhammad’s life serve as *Uswatun Hasanah* (a good example), they should not be considered secondary sources of law. He asserts that the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) implemented the rules found in the Qur’an, without introducing new laws or contradicting the words of Allah (SWT). In this understanding, the Prophet is seen as a messenger who perfected the laws revealed in the Qur’an, following the teachings of Prophet Ibrahim and upholding Islam in its complete form.⁶⁹

Nazwar Syamsu firmly holds that hadith cannot serve as a source of Islamic law alongside the Qur’an in the present day, primarily due to the vast number of fabricated hadiths, which he estimates could reach up to 600,000. He attributes the creation of these false hadiths to individuals who seek to weaken Islam, often linking their origins to the descendants of Israel, including Jews and Christians.⁷⁰ According to Nazwar, those promoting these false hadiths in the name of the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) are willing to invest significant resources. He claims that these individuals use various tactics, including offering bribes and material incentives to religious leaders with weak faith, and even involving people who feign piety. Their aim, as Nazwar sees it, is to undermine Islamic culture through a range of destructive methods.⁷¹

66 Khon, “Paham Ingkar Sunnah Di Indonesia.”

67 Nazwar Syamsu, *Taubid Dan Logika: Al-Qur’an Tentang Manusia* (Jakarta: PT Ghalia Indonesia, 1983).

68 Nurfajriyani, “Ingkar Hadis Di Indonesia dan Malaysia (Studi Konparatif Pemikiran Hadis Nazwar Syamsu dan Kassim Ahmad).”

69 Syamsu, *Taubid dan Logika: Al-Qur’an tentang Manusia*, hlm. 22.

70 Nurfajriyani, “Ingkar Hadis Di Indonesia dan Malaysia (Studi Konparatif Pemikiran Hadis Nazwar Syamsu dan Kassim Ahmad).”

71 Syamsu, *Taubid dan Logika: Al-Qur’an tentang Manusia*, hlm. 23.

Nazwar Syamsu acknowledges the hadith as a source of guidance, though he views it as secondary to the Qur'an. He argues that the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) acted in strict accordance with the Qur'an, which he sees as a flawless source of law. In Nazwar's view, the Prophet's words and actions serve as *Uswah Hasanah* (a good example) but should not be regarded as a legal basis. He emphasizes that while hadith aligns with the Qur'an and may be used for guidance, it is not necessarily an accurate representation of the Prophet's teachings and cannot be considered binding law. The Prophet's primary duty was to spread the message of the Qur'an and guide his followers according to its principles. Nazwar also notes that the Prophet, being the final prophet, had knowledge of various sciences but chose not to elaborate on them, allowing human understanding to progress through the opportunities given by Allah SWT and in line with His guidance.⁷²

Dalimi Lubis and Nazwar Syamsu: Rational Philosophy and the Rejection of Sunnah

Dalimi Lubis, despite never studying abroad, shows that his views on rejecting the Sunnah are not influenced by Western Orientalists. Based on analysis, his thoughts seem more influenced by his academic background, particularly in theology and philosophy. He has a strong interest in philosophy and logic, as well as in disciplines directly tied to the sources of religious teachings, namely the Qur'an and Sunnah. His keen focus on philosophy and religious studies has shaped his views, suggesting that his approach blends rational philosophical reasoning with a deep understanding of Islamic religious sources.

Dalimi argues that philosophy and logic are crucial for scientists, as they enhance the ability to think critically and serve as tools in scientific discourse. These disciplines sharpen analytical and critical thinking, which are necessary for research and debate. At the same time, Dalimi views knowledge of the Qur'an and Sunnah as essential for every Muslim. He believes that understanding these two primary sources forms the foundation for comprehending Islamic teachings and living in accordance with their principles. Dalimi stresses that the combination of logical reasoning and a deep understanding of religious knowledge is vital for becoming both a competent scientist and an informed Muslim.⁷³

Dalimi Lubis is not only dedicated to studying philosophy, logic, and the sciences of the Qur'an and Sunnah, but he also actively engages in discussions

72 Nurfajriyani, "Ingkar Hadis Di Indonesia dan Malaysia (Studi Konparatif Pemikiran Hadis Nazwar Syamsu dan Kassim Ahmad)."

73 Azami, *Dirasat Fi Al-Hadis Al-Nabawi Wa Tarikh Tadwinibi*, hlm. 27-29.

with prominent scholars in Padang Panjang, such as Buya Yahya Al-Ma'aniy, Buya Mawardi Muhammad, Johar Mahmud, Johar Nurdin, and others like Nazwar Syamsu. These discussions often become intense debates, particularly concerning hadith and sunnah, as Dalimi frequently challenges the traditional views.⁷⁴ Dalimi's ideas align closely with those of Nazwar Syamsu, another notable figure in the rejection of the Sunnah in West Sumatra. This shared stance is evident in Dalimi's writings, including magazine articles, books, and various religious discussions where he critiques the role of Sunnah as a source of Islamic teachings.

Nazwar Syamsu is among the early proponents of the idea of rejecting the Sunnah, which involves denying or minimizing the role of hadith and sunnah as equal sources of law and teachings alongside the Qur'an in Islam. His perspective is expressed through his publications, including the 1976 book *The Qur'an: A Scientific Question and Answer Guide (Series on Monotheism and Logic)*. This work is one of the first to explicitly advocate for the rejection of the Sunnah, encouraging readers to prioritize the Qur'an as the sole source of Islamic teachings and to critically assess the validity of Sunnah as a legal and religious foundation.⁷⁵

Nazwar Syamsu influenced some of his students, including Kassim Ahmad and Dalimi Lubis, with his perspective on rejecting the Sunnah. Kassim Ahmad cited Nazwar's 1980 book, *The Qur'an on Humanity and Society*, as a key source for his ideas. This book expanded on the rejection of Sunnah, providing additional arguments to emphasize the primacy of the Qur'an. Dalimi Lubis, another student of Nazwar, was also deeply influenced by these ideas and has consistently critiqued the role of Sunnah as a source of Islamic teachings, reflecting the views he learned from Nazwar. Overall, Nazwar Syamsu played a pivotal role in introducing and spreading the concept of rejecting the Sunnah, with his students like Kassim Ahmad and Dalimi Lubis continuing and building upon his ideas through their own writings and teachings.

Nazwar Syamsu's views on the rejection of the Sunnah share significant similarities with those of Tawfiq Shidqi in Egypt. Shidqi argued that the Qur'an is the only necessary source of Islamic teachings, asserting that it is complete and perfect in itself, with no need for supplementation from hadith or sunnah. This perspective holds that all Islamic laws and teachings should be derived directly from the Qur'an, without reference to the Sunnah as a complementary source.⁷⁶ Similarly, Nazwar

74 Safri, *Melacak Pandangan Dalimi Lubis Tentang Penolakannya Terhadap Sunnah (Kajian Kasus Penganut Paham Ingkar Al-Sunnah Di Padang Panjang)*, hlm. 14.

75 Kassim Ahmad, *Hadis Diteladani Sebuah Re-Evaluasi Mendasar Atas Hadis* (Malaysia: Trotoar, 2006), hlm 38.

76 Tawfiq Shidqi, "Al-Islam Huwa Al-Qur'an Wahdah," *Al-Manar*, Juz IX, Jilid, XII., 906–907.

Syamsu views the Qur'an as the primary and sole source of Islamic teachings, believing that the Sunnah is not only unnecessary but may also complicate or confuse the interpretation of the Qur'an. Like Shidqi, Nazwar emphasizes the sufficiency of the Qur'an in providing comprehensive guidance for Islamic teachings, rendering the Sunnah less important or even irrelevant.

Both Nazwar Syamsu and Tawfiq Shidqi share the belief in the integrity and completeness of the Qur'an as the sole source of Islamic teachings. Although there is no evidence that Nazwar Syamsu studied directly under Tawfiq Shidqi, their views align in emphasizing that the Qur'an alone is sufficient for all aspects of Islamic religious guidance. They both argue that the Qur'an is perfect and does not need supplementary laws or explanations from the Sunnah. This perspective rests on the belief that the Qur'an provides comprehensive guidance for life and religious practice, without the need for additional references from the Sunnah.

Conclusion

The *Inkar Sunnah* movement in West Sumatra represents a significant ideological challenge to the traditional Islamic understanding of the Sunnah as a critical source of law, alongside the Qur'an. Figures like Dalimi Lubis and Nazwar Syamsu have played central roles in propagating the belief that the Qur'an alone is sufficient for Islamic jurisprudence, rejecting the authenticity and relevance of prophetic traditions. Through their writings, speeches, and public engagements, they have argued that the Sunnah, as it has been transmitted through hadith collections, is unnecessary for understanding and practicing Islam. This study reveals how their views are rooted in a combination of historical skepticism towards hadith, modern influences from Orientalist critiques, and a literalist approach to Qur'anic interpretation. The persistence of this movement in Indonesia, despite scholarly refutations, highlights the ongoing tension between traditional Sunni orthodoxy and reformist currents that question the role of hadith.

The research also highlights the socio-political and historical factors that contributed to the growth of the *Inkar Sunnah* ideology in West Sumatra. The dissemination of these ideas through modern media, books, and local religious figures, along with the broader context of religious reform movements in Indonesia, has allowed the movement to attract a following. The analysis of Dalimi Lubis and Nazwar Syamsu's arguments shows a deliberate attempt to reinterpret key Islamic concepts such as *sunnah* and *hadith*, challenging the consensus of classical and contemporary scholars. This phenomenon poses a significant risk to the integrity of Islamic teachings, particularly for lay Muslims who may not have the scholarly

background to navigate these complex debates. The study contributes to the broader discourse on the intersection of local culture, religious reform, and the transmission of Islamic legal authority in Indonesia.

However, this research leaves several areas unexplored that present opportunities for future investigation. Firstly, a comparative analysis between the *Inkar Sunnah* movements in Indonesia and similar movements in other Muslim-majority countries, such as Egypt and Malaysia, could offer a more global perspective on this ideological trend. Additionally, further ethnographic research on the impact of *Inkar Sunnah* teachings on local communities, particularly in terms of religious practice and social dynamics, would provide a more nuanced understanding of the movement's real-world implications. Lastly, an in-depth study of the responses of traditional Islamic scholars and institutions to the spread of *Inkar Sunnah* could yield valuable insights into the strategies employed to safeguard the transmission of prophetic traditions in the modern era.

Supplementary Materials

Acknowledgements

Authors' contributions

All listed authors contributed to this article. L.H wrote the original draft, reviewed and edited it, and wrote the formal analysis, compiled the resources, conceptualised the study, and managed the project administration. A.S.Y and Y.A was responsible for the methodology and validation and supervised the project

Data availability statement

Data sharing is not applicable to this article as no new data were created or analysed in this study.

Conflicts of Interest

None of the authors of this study has a financial or personal relationship with other people that could inappropriately influence or bias the content of the study.

Funding

This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public,

commercial or not-for-profit sectors

References

- Afwadzi, Benny. "Epistemologi Inkah Al-Sunnah: Telaah Pemikiran Kassim Ahmad." *Al-Furqan: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Tafsir* 1, no. 2 (2018): 121–144.
- Ahmad, Kassim. *Hadis Diteladani Sebuah Re-Evaluasi Mendasar Atas Hadis*. Malaysia: Trotoar, 2006.
- Al-Baghdadi, Al-Khatib. *Al-Kifayah Fi 'Ilm Ar-Riwayah*. Beirut: Al-Maktabah Al-'Ilmiyah, 1358.
- Al-Khatib, Muhammad 'Ajjaj. *Ushul Al-Hadits, Ulumuhunwa Musthlahahu*. Beirut: Dar Al-Kutub, 1989.
- An-Naisaburi, Al-Hakim. *Al-Mustadrak Ala Ash-Shahihain*. Banjarmasin: Dar Al-Ma'rifat, 2006.
- Armuyanti, Dona. "Inkar Sunnah: Asal Usul Dan Perkembangan Pemikiran Inkar Sunnah Di Dunia Islam." *Tashdiq: Jurnal Kajian Agama dan Dakwah* 2, no. 1 (2023): 41–50.
- As-Syafi'i, Muhammad bin Idris. *Al-Umm*. Beirut: Dar Al-Ma'rifah, 1975.
- . *Jima' Al-Ilm*. Madinah: Dar Al-Atsar, 2002.
- Azami, Mushtafa Muhammad. *Dirasat Fi Al-Hadis Al-Nabawi Wa Tarikh Tadwinihi*. Beirut: Al-Maktab Al-Islami, 1980.
- Brown, Daniel W. *Rethinking Tradition in Modern Islamic Thought*. Cambridge University Press. London, 1996.
- Damanhuri. "RECONSTRUCTION OF MATAN HADITH UNDERSTANDING ABOUT WOMEN POSITION IN HOUSEHOLD." *Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun* 4, no. 2 (May 28, 2016): 239–56.
- Dewi, Subkhani Kusuma, and Muhammad Akmaluddin. "Broadcasting Umrah through the Hadith of Hajj Badal in the COVID-19 Pandemic Era." *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadis* 24, no. 2 (July 31, 2023): 231–52.
- Fatihunnada, Fatihunnada, and Afni Miftah Khairunnisak. "Kritik Argumentasi Ingkar Sunnah Menurut Al-Buti." *Refleksi* 19, no. 2 (2020): 167–182.
- Hakim, Luqmanul. *Ingkar Sunnah Periode Klasik*. Jakarta: Hayfa Press, 2004.
- . *Inkar Sunnah Periode Klasik*. Jakarta: Hayfa Press, 2004.
- Handika, Caca. "Ingkar Al-Sunnah Di Indonesia (Studi Analisis Tentang Pemikiran Ingkar Sunnah Ir. M. Ircham Sutarto)." *Al-Din: Jurnal Dakwah dan Sosial Keagamaan* 4, no. 1 (2019): 35–46.
- Hidayat, Rian, and Yulmitra Handayani. "The Phenomenon of the Death of Sacrificial Animals Before the Day of Slaughter in the Islamic Law Perspective: A Portrait

- of the Case in Luhak Nan Tigo, West Sumatra.” *Journal of Islamic Law* 1, no. 1 (February 25, 2020): 1–24. <https://doi.org/10.24260/jil.v1i1.3>.
- Khon, Abdul Madjid. “Ingkar Al-Sunnah Masa Klasik (Telaah Tentang Pokok-Pokok Pemikirannya).” *UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta* (1998).
- . “Paham Ingkar Sunnah Di Indonesia.” *Jurnal Theologia* 23, no. 1 (2017): 57–74.
- . “Paham Ingkar Sunnah Di Indonesia (Studi Tentang Pemikirannya).” *Theologia* 23, no. 1 (2021).
- . *Pemikiran Modern Dalam Sunnah: Pendekatan Ilmu Hadis*. Jakarta: Kencana, 2001.
- . *Ulumul Hadis*. Jakarta: Amzah, 2020.
- Langaji, Abbas. *Ingkar Hadits*. Yogyakarta: Madani, 2021.
- Lubis, Dalimi. “Alam Barzakh (Alam Kubur).” *Ghalia*. Jakarta, 1985.
- . “Mempertanyakan Eksistensi Hadits/Sunnah Nabi Dalam Ajaran Islam,” n.d.
- Makhfud, Makhfud. “Meninjau Ulang Signifikansi Kedudukan Hadits Dan Ingkar Al-Sunnah.” *Tribakti: Jurnal Pemikiran Keislaman* 28, no. 1 (2017): 47–68.
- Mudrikah, Syarifah, and Imamul Authon Nur. “Pasang Surut Inkar Sunnah: Studi Analisis Pada Masa Klasik Dan Modern.” *Al-Bukhari: Jurnal Ilmu Hadis* 3, no. 1 (2020).
- Mursidin, Ida Ilmiah. “Inkar Sunnah (Argumen Dan Tokohnya).” *Jurnal Ilmu Hadits* 1, no. 1 (2022): 1–21.
- Nadia, Zunly, and Niswatin Faoziah. “Gender Equality within Family in Islamic Perspective: Insights from The Hadiths of Ummul Mukminin.” *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur’an Dan Hadis* 25, no. 1 (June 14, 2024): 161–86.
- Noormani, M. Agus. “Perkembangan Aliran/Paham Keagamaan Di Sumatera Barat.” *Jurnal Multikultural dan Multireligius* 13, no. 1 (2014).
- Nurfajriyani, Nurfajriyani. “Ingkar Hadis Di Indonesia Dan Malaysia (Studi Konparatif Pemikiran Hadis Nazwar Syamsu Dan Kassim Ahmad).” *An-Nida’* 43, no. 1 (2019): 101.
- Rahman, Zulfan. *Sunnah Nabi SAW Sebagai Sumber Hukum Islam (Jawaban Terhadap Inkar Sunnah)*. Jakarta: CV Pedoman Ilmu Jaya, 1995.
- Rasyid, Daud. *Sunnah Di Bawah Ancaman: Dari Snouck Hugronje Hingga Harun Nasution*. Bandung: Syaamil, 2006.
- Rayyah, Mahmud Abu. *Adwa ’Ala Al-Sunnah Al-Muhammadiyah*. Makkah: Dar Al-Ma’arif, 1957.
- Safri, Edi. *Melacak Pandangan Dalimi Lubis Tentang Penolakannya Terhadap Sunnah (Kajian Kasus Penganut Paham Ingkar Al-Sunnah Di Padang Panjang)*. Padang: Baitul Hikmah Press, 2001.

- Saif, Muhammad Ibrahim Ahmad. "Denying Tyranny According to Quran and Sunnah" (2007). <https://repository.najah.edu/handle/20.500.11888/8193>.
- Shidqi, Tawfiq. "Al-Islam Huwa Al-Qur'an Wahdah." *Al-Manar*, n.d.
- Solahuddin, Agus, and Agus Suryadi. *Ulumul Hadis*. Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2008.
- Syamsu, Nazwar. *Tauhid Dan Logika: Al-Qur'an Tentang Manusia*. Jakarta: PT Ghalia Indonesia, 1983.
- Yaqub, Ali Musthafa. *Kritik Hadis*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1995.
- Zainuddin. "Ailal Rashid's Critical Contribution to Sahih Al-Bukhari in the Book of Sahih Al-Bukhari Nihayah Usturah." *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Hadis* 23, no. 1 (2022): 1–18.
- Zarkasih. "Inkar Sunnah: Asal Usul Dan Perkembangan Pemikiran Inkar Sunnah Di Dunia Islam" (n.d.): 1–19.

